

**Targamadžė Vilija, Kriaučiūnienė Roma**  
Vilnius University, Lithuania

## **The Place of Values in Plurilingual Education: A University Teachers' Viewpoint**

### **Abstract**

Contemporary university education is based on the development of students' competences that is generally being understood as the unity of knowledge, skills and value attitudes. While knowledge and skills can be easily measured and evaluated in the teaching / learning process, value attitudes seem to fall in the category of more intangible things, the development of which could not be very easily tested and assessed. Therefore, value attitudes may not always be in the focus of attention of university teachers, although they seem to be responsible for nurturing value attitudes of students. The development of value attitudes in the process of plurilingual education is especially necessary as values can be the core or foundation that helps learners realize the necessity of learning languages, foster their motivation and expand their understanding and acceptance of diversity issues. Thus, the aim of this research was to find out the university teachers' views on the development of students' value attitudes in plurilingual education. The aim was specified by several research questions: why values should be integrated in the teaching of their subjects, what values could be developed within the framework of teaching their subjects at universities, and what teaching / learning methods should be applied. The research was qualitative, there were 10 teachers from different universities of Lithuania interviewed and it was carried out in 2017. The results of the current research were compared with the research into university teachers' viewpoints on the development of value attitudes conducted in 2013, when university teachers from Ukraine, Georgia, and Latvia were interviewed. The conclusion is made that university teachers are aware of the necessity of the development of values in plurilingual education, although they seem to lack the *Know-How*. University teachers have to create favourable learning environment, choose appropriate teaching / learning materials and apply suitable teaching / learning methods.

**Keywords:** *Value attitudes, plurilingual education, university teachers, teaching/ learning process.*

### **Introduction**

Plurilingualism, which is a fundamental principle of the Council of Europe language education policies, is defined by Beacco & Byram (2003, p.15) as: "*the intrinsic capacity of all speakers to use and learn, alone or through teaching, more than one language.*" An expanded viewpoint of plurilingualism, encompassing not only the linguistic but cultural aspects as well, is presented in the *Common European Framework of Reference for Languages* ([https://www.coe.int/t/dg4/linguistic/source/framework\\_en.pdf](https://www.coe.int/t/dg4/linguistic/source/framework_en.pdf) p.168), where plurilingual and pluricultural competence is referred to as "*the ability to use languages for the purposes of communication and to take part in intercultural interaction, where a person, viewed as a social agent has proficiency, of varying degrees, in several languages and experience of several cultures.*" The updated version of CEFR (2017, p. 28) provides a more extensive explanation of the reason why most of the references to plurilingualism in the CEFR are to 'plurilingual and pluricultural competence': "*This is because the two aspects usually go hand-in-hand. Having said that, however, one form of unevenness may actually be that one aspect (e.g. pluricultural competence) is much stronger than the other (e.g. plurilingual competence)*". Evidently, the development of plurilingual competence of learners is inseparable from the enhancement of their understanding of the culture of

the target language or languages. In other words, strengthening the learners' cultural awareness, as Beacco & Byram (2003) state, is closely related to their acceptance of differences with respect to the collective values, behavior and standards of a different society. Such cultural awareness building is a matter of education which is linked with the process of teaching and learning languages. Given the peaceful philosophy of language learning that plurilingualism is based on and the fact that pluricultural competence does not develop on its own, but is interconnected with the learners' intercultural experience, exposure to and acceptance of cultural differences and the otherness, purposeful educational intervention aimed at the development of pluricultural competence of learners seems to be unavoidable.

### **The problem of the research**

In accordance with Bologna declaration (2005) university education in Lithuania is based on the development of students' competences the latter being understood as the unity of knowledge, skills and value attitudes. The main aim of competence-based learning is to develop not only subject-specific competences necessary for a certain future profession, but to develop students' general competences as well, enabling them to function successfully in multilingual and multicultural professional fields. Thus, the requirements that higher education institutions face nowadays seem to provide favourable conditions for the development of competences and value attitudes of students. However, while knowledge and skills can be easily measured and evaluated in the teaching / learning process, value attitudes seem to fall in the category of more intangible things, the development of which could not be very easily tested and assessed. Therefore, value attitudes may not always be in the focus of attention of university teachers, although they have to be responsible for nurturing value attitudes of students in the teaching / learning process. There is no denying the fact that the development of plurilingual and pluricultural competences is closely linked with the development of students' value attitudes which, alongside the other dimensions of a competence, i.e. knowledge and skills, make up the core foundation of learning languages. Undoubtedly, a better understanding of the meaningfulness of such values as respect, tolerance, sensitivity, and responsibility raises students' awareness of the culture of the *other* and strengthens their acceptance of diversity issues. However, the problematic issue is, whether the teaching / learning process of foreign languages at contemporary universities really serves the development of students' value attitudes to prepare them for a successful communication in a multilingual and multicultural world. Thus, **the subject** of the research is values in language teaching / learning process and **the aim** of the research is to find out university teachers' views on the development of students' value attitudes in plurilingual education. The aim is specified by several **research questions**: why values should be integrated in the teaching of their subjects, what values could be developed within the framework of teaching their subjects at universities, and how and by what teaching / learning methods this process should be handled.

### **The novelty of the research**

It should be mentioned, however, that the concept of plurilingual education is not a new one and there has been a lot of research done recently into different aspects of plurilingual education. A large amount of research is carried out in university settings addressing plurilingual and pluricultural approaches in Foreign Language Education. For instance, the research carried out by P. Lobo (2016) proves that reformulation of foreign language classes with a plurilingual approach can empower students from diverse backgrounds with self-knowledge and tolerance towards alterity. Similarly E. Moore's (2014) research results showed that the use of plurilingual repertoires of learners may be advantageous for learning and participation in similar higher education classroom settings and, ultimately, for strengthening internationalisation. Furthermore, E. Moore, L. Nussbaum, E. & Borràs (2013) provide empirical insights into how internationalisation of universities, - and in particular the teaching of subjects in a second language - can be achieved in harmony with existing plurilingualism at the same time ensuring complexity of disciplinary content. Other scholars (Starkey-Perret &

Narcy-Combes, 2017) tested the implementation of a task-based plurilingual program with postgraduate students of Foreign Languages and International Business in a predominately monolingual area and identified the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats involved. Their research results revealed the research participants' positive acknowledgment of the social value, the intercultural dimension and representations of language acquisition and plurilingualism.

The other research, as presented by C. C. López and M. González-Davies (2016), focuses on how different plurilingual practices (code-switching and translation) can be successfully used in a foreign language classroom to improve students' linguistic capacities. Similarly the findings presented by M. Pujol-Ferran, J. M. DiSanto, N. N. Rodríguez and A. Morales (2016) also show successful application of plurilingual pedagogies across the college curriculum, in science, humanities, education, and linguistics courses. The four case studies presented demonstrate how they integrated dynamic translanguaging teaching practices such as translation, code-switching, cross-linguistic analysis, and the use of students' linguistic repertoires to complete assignments in multilingual classrooms. The researchers found that plurilingual pedagogies enable students to discover their linguistic strengths and utilize them to complete college assignments. Other scientists, such as C. Jeoffrion, A. Marcouyeux, R. Starkey-Perret, M. Narcy-Combes, and I. Birkan (2014) explored the university students' viewpoint of the use of plurilingual practices in a monolingual French academic setting and revealed that advanced students who learn several languages have a more plurilingual posture than beginners or those who learn fewer languages.

The analysis of the recent research articles on plurilingual education showed that there is a lot of research carried out to demonstrate the application of plurilingual practices in schools. G. Prasad (2015), for instance, presents the analysis of the process of creating plurilingual multimodal books with students and teachers across five different schools and presented very positive results of inclusive plurilingual pedagogy. A similar successful account of this kind of pedagogy is presented by R. Fielding (2016) whose research results proved that children in Australian schools enjoyed the learning process more by using their plurilingual experience and teachers expanded their own linguistic repertoires. The researcher maintains the view that teachers must re-conceptualize language learning to acknowledge the language resources of children with plurilingual experiences. A more positive change in teachers' approaches to language teaching to develop students' intercultural communicative competence in plurilingual contexts is provided by C. Tolosa, C. Biebricher, M. East, and J. Howard's (2018) research results. Their study offers valuable insights for teacher education into the ways teachers' inquiries can support curricular change. Another interesting study is presented by J. B. Clark, A. Vanthuyne and C. Mady (2014) who attempt to answer the questions what it means to be and become a bi/multilingual and multicultural language teacher in today's plurilingual times.

However, the analysis of theoretical literature on plurilingual education reveals that the research into foreign language teachers' approach to the development of learners' value attitudes in plurilingual education has not been given adequate attention and some more light should be shed on the empirical reality in order to get a deeper insight into university teachers' awareness of and readiness to integrate values into the foreign language teaching/ learning process.

## Methodology

### Methodological guidelines of the research

The research was based on:

- The insights of *constructivism theory* claiming that each person is a uniquely constructed individual that cannot function separately, any intention of human behaviour is collectivist in nature, social reality is determined by all the members of the group, therefore maintaining relations with others requires respect for others; the decision making process should focus on the welfare of the community preserving each member's honour and fairness of pluralistic societies (May 1987).

- The interpretation of an *intercultural (communicative) competence* comprising attitudes, knowledge and skills, and *pluralistic approaches* for the development of *plurilingual and intercultural competences* of learners as well as descriptors of *plurilingual and intercultural competences* encompassing the dimensions of *knowledge, attitudes and skills developed by European Centre of Modern Languages* (A framework of reference for pluralistic approaches to languages and cultures (<http://carap.ecml.at/Accueil/tabid/3577/language/en-GB/Default.aspx>; Byram 2000, Neuliep 2006);

### Methods of the research

In order to achieve the aim of the current research, i.e. to find out the university teachers' views on the development of students' value attitudes in plurilingual education, theoretical and empirical research methods were used. *Descriptive, analytic and comparative* approaches were used for the analysis of educational and linguistic literature as well as Lithuanian and European documents on plurilingualism in order to provide the theoretical-analytical framework for the empirical research. The *qualitative, expert interview method* was applied with a focus on the deepening and broadening of the understanding of teachers' views on the development of students' value attitudes. There were 10 teachers of different languages (English – 4 teachers, German - 1, Lithuanian - 2, Russian - 2, Spanish - 1) representing different institutions of higher education of Lithuania (Vilnius University, Vytautas Magnus University, Kaunas University of Technology, University of Educational Sciences, University of Applied Sciences) interviewed who were asked for their outlook on the research questions.

The criteria for the selection of experts, teachers of languages, were the following: 10 years' and above teaching experience at institutions of higher education; scientific degree; experience of curriculum design and study program development; participation in projects on the development of national educational documents. The research was carried out in 2017.

The research participants were asked some questions concerning the development of values in the language / teaching process at universities. The research data collection technique was a structured interview, including questions pertaining to the constituent parts of the teaching / learning process: teaching aims, content, methods, the place of values in the teaching process as well as possibilities of integration of values in the plurilingual education (*What are the main aims of the teaching of your subject? What is the place of values in the subject you teach? Do you think that you pay enough attention to values in your subject teaching process? Why? What are the possible methods to develop students' value attitudes in your subject teaching process? Why is the development of values necessary in plurilingual education? How can value attitudes of students be fostered / developed in plurilingual education? What values could be fostered in the language teaching / learning process?*). The data of structured interviews were organized using a thematic analysis to identify all important themes mentioned by the experts and by applying categories and subcategories for each question of the interview.

In order to obtain a deeper insight into the experts' views, the results of the current research were compared with the research into university teachers' viewpoints on the development of value attitudes conducted in 2013, when university teachers from Ukraine, Georgia, and Latvia, who participated in a Tempus project "Development and Introduction of Multilingual Teacher Education programmes at universities of Georgia and Ukraine (DIMTEGU)" (No. 530360-TEMPUS-12012-1GE-TEMPUS-JPCR2012 – 2014), were interviewed by using the same data collection technique.

### Theoretical background of the research

The *State Education Strategy 2013 - 2022* provides the strategic framework for the development of the education system in Lithuania. One of its objectives is "to develop value orientations of each person that will

allow them to become a good-willed, independent, responsible, patriotic person” (State Education Strategy 2013 - 2022, p.2). One of the prerequisites for the implementation of this aim, among others, is the development of openness, creativity and responsibility, which are considered to be the fundamental values of progress. These values are further specified as follows: openness to a different approach, positive initiatives, dialogue, cooperation, innovation; creativity in generating valuable ideas and in implementing them; responsibility for their actions, morality, and active care not only for themselves, but also for their environment, community and country. *The language education policy specification* (Kalbų mokymo politikos aprašas, 2006) of Lithuania states that in the process of teaching / learning foreign languages students improve themselves as personalities, develop value-related attitudes such as openness to the target language and intercultural diversity; they qualify themselves for living in the multicultural and multilingual world that requires the mastering of general competences and skills.

One of the publications of the EU “*Promoting Plurilingualism Majority Language in Multilingual Settings*” (2011) establishes clear links between learning languages and the development of one’s values together with a strong sense of one’s own identities and acknowledgment of otherness in increasingly multilingual societies. *A framework of reference for pluralistic approaches to languages and cultures* (<http://carap.ecml.at/Accueil/tabid/3577/language/en-GB/Default.aspx>) developed by the European Centre of Modern Languages of the European Union provides ways for implementing pluralistic approaches for the development of plurilingual and intercultural competences of learners as well as give descriptors of plurilingual and intercultural competences encompassing the dimensions of knowledge, attitudes and skills. Seven general competences are defined, mainly: *Competence in managing linguistic and cultural communication in a context of otherness, Competence in the construction and broadening of a plural linguistic and cultural repertoire, Competence of decentering, Competence in making sense of unfamiliar linguistic and/or cultural features, Competence of distancing, Competence of critical analysis of the (communicative and/or learning) situation and activities one is involved in, Competence in recognising the "other" and otherness*. The development of these competences seems particularly encouraged by the implementation of pluralistic approaches in the language teaching / learning process.

One of the components of competences - the attitudes are specified by the European Centre of Modern Languages as follows: attitude to foreign languages, cultures and/or persons, to linguistic, cultural and/or human diversity in the environment; to language in general; to linguistic, cultural and/or human diversity in general (<http://carap.ecml.at/Descriptorsofresources/2/tabid/3592/language/en-GB/Default.aspx>). The specification of these attitudes reveal the embedded values: sensitivity, respect to linguistic, cultural or human diversity.

The development of the above-mentioned competences and value attitudes set very serious requirements for foreign language teachers, who have to constantly reflect their practices and make the necessary adjustments in their teaching practices. Moreover, as Angela Scarino and Anthony J. Liddicoat (2009, p.69 - 70) state, “learning is a deeply social and cultural process that involves active construction through interaction, mediation, talk, questioning, and scaffolding with more knowledgeable others”. Thus, the knowledgeable language teachers have to be able to create a favourable learning environment, choose appropriate teaching materials and apply suitable teaching and assessment methods. Moreover, intercultural language teaching / learning as Angela Scarino and Anthony J. Liddicoat (2009, p. 33 - 36) put it: “*involves developing with students an understanding of their own ‘situatedness’ in their own language and culture, and the recognition of the same in others. It also involves understanding the way in which this recognition influences the process of communication within their own language and culture, and across languages and cultures*”.

Language teachers’ competences as described in European Portfolio for Student Teachers of Languages (EPOSTL) by Newby, Allan, Fenner, Jones, Komorowska & Soghikyan (2007, p. 29, p. 56) include the

following capacities of language teachers that enable them to foster students' awareness of the target language culture and strengthen their understanding and acceptance of cultural differences:

- ability to evaluate and select a variety of texts, source materials and activities which awaken learners' interest in and help them to develop their knowledge and understanding of their own and the other language culture (cultural facts, events, ability to create opportunities for learners to explore the culture of target language communities out of class (Internet, emails etc);
- ability to evaluate and select a variety of texts, source materials and activities which make learners aware of similarities and differences in sociocultural 'norms of behaviour';
- ability to evaluate and select activities (role plays, simulated situations etc.) which help learners to develop their socio-cultural competence;
- ability to evaluate and select a variety of texts, source material and activities which help learners to reflect on the concept of 'otherness' and understand different value systems;
- ability to evaluate and select texts, source materials and activities to make the learners aware of stereotyped views and challenge these;
- ability to evaluate and select activities which enhance the learners' intercultural awareness;
- ability to evaluate and select a variety of texts and activities to make learners aware of the interrelationship between culture and language;
- ability to assess the learners' knowledge of cultural facts, events etc. of the target language communities;
- ability to assess the learners' ability to make comparisons between their own culture and that of target language communities;
- ability to assess the learner's ability to respond and act appropriately in encounters with the target language culture.

It could be maintained that having mastered such competences teachers are able to foster their students' value attitudes and prepare them for successful functioning in multicultural working environments.

### Research results

As mentioned earlier, the aim of the current qualitative research is to reveal teachers' viewpoints of the connection between values and the language teaching / learning process. As language teaching / learning is closely linked with cultural and linguistic diversity, the values are essential in this domain to develop students' holistic personalities and to foster their plurilingual and pluricultural competences.

To reveal the place of values in language teaching / learning process the experts' structured interviews were carried out that revealed several overarching themes. The empirical research data analysis allowed identification of the categories and subcategories that are presented in the Tables and the analysis of the empirical data below. Links between value education and foreign language teaching are defined by the categories "*Aims of teaching languages*", "*Place of values in the educational process*", "*Attention to values in the language teaching / learning process*", "*Teaching methods to develop students' value attitudes in language teaching / learning process*", "*Importance of the development of values in plurilingual education*", "*Ways value attitudes of students could be fostered in plurilingual education*", "*Values to be fostered in the language teaching / learning process*".

The content of the category "*Aims of teaching languages*", presented in Table 1 below, reveals the objectives of language teaching such as development of students' communicative competence, creative and critical thinking, professional communicative skills, and familiarization with the culture of the target language.

**Table 1. Links between values and language teaching / learning process: category “Aims of teaching languages” and subcategories.**

Category	Subcategories	Examples of Statements
<b>Aims of teaching languages</b>	Development of communicative competence, creative and critical thinking, development of professional communicative skills, familiarization with the culture of the target language.	<p><i>&lt;to raise interest in the culture of the target language&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;to help students learn a foreign language of their choice, to familiarise them with the culture of the target language&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;To create the preconditions for students to develop communicative competence, to develop all linguistic skills - listening, reading, speaking and writing - to develop linguistic competence in order to acquire socio-cultural knowledge and abilities necessary for communication with representatives of foreign-speaking countries in the multicultural and multilingual world of the contemporary world.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;To develop future primary education teachers so that they understand and can develop the language skills of primary school students not only through the Lithuanian language lessons but also in the context of all other subjects.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;It is important for prospective teachers to understand contemporary didactics, apply active learning methods to motivate their students to learn.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;formally – to develop students’ communicative competence, however, my main aim is to foster students’ critical thinking abilities&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;to develop professional competences and improve practical foreign language skills&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;Students should obtain knowledge of flexible and effective usage of the English language in a social, academic and professional environment. They should acquire correct usage of the language of science and technology along with the effective usage of all language skills.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt; Learners are expected to develop additional skills necessary for success in their studies, future life and careers (not just language skills), for example, communication, critical thinking, creativity and collaboration.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;To teach students the use of English in their subject areas.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;To develop students’ competence as future translators&gt;</i></p>

The content of this category shows that the main focus of language teachers’ attention is paid to the development of students’ communicative, linguistic competence and familiarization with the culture of the target language studied, which seems to be in compliance with the requirements of CERF (2017).

The Category of “*Place of values in educational process*”, presented in Table 2 below, reveals the experts’ approach that refers to the values being important in the educational process.

**Table 2. Links between values and the language teaching / learning process: category “Place of values in the educational process” and subcategories.**

Category	Subcategories	Examples of Statements
<p><b>Place of values in educational process</b></p>	<p>Values are different.</p> <p>Values are important for the choice of the teaching material.</p> <p>Values are a motivating force to learn a foreign language and to know about the culture of the target language.</p> <p>Language is the value of every nation.</p> <p>Values are discussed during various activities of teaching / learning process.</p> <p>Values encourage motivation to succeed and to grow.</p> <p>ELT is a highly value-laden subject.</p> <p>Language is not just a means of communication but also a powerful tool for thinking and value transfer, thus, for identity formation.</p> <p>Language is a tool for development &amp; reconstruction of the ways students understand the world and themselves.</p> <p>It is not the main purpose of the course, but it is certainly felt throughout.</p>	<p><i>&lt;Values are important if they are values. We each have a variety of them and we see them differently. The subject I teach is inseparable from the social environment and personal contact with students.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;Important, but not formally focused. I pay particular attention to values when it comes to the choice of topics for texts, dialogues, speeches.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;It is very important to develop a desire to learn a foreign language.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;The following things are important: improved knowledge of Spanish-speaking countries' cultures and traditions.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;Language itself is a value that reflects a person's attitude towards people, the state. Languages, as they are related to thinking, are the values of every nation.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;It is important to develop tolerance and respect for the distinctive and diverse nature of other cultures.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;An important place. I think this is an integral part of the internal learning motivation, the desire to develop, the attitude to a positive development, the need to reflect on what has been successful, to discuss things that need to be improved in order to achieve better results. A positive attitude to activities is the basis for growth and improvement.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;Although study programmes focus more on professional subjects, we discuss values during classroom activities, through the analysis of texts and tasks, by students' behavior during lectures, and during breaks&gt;.</i></p> <p><i>&lt;In comparison to other subjects in higher education, ELT is a highly value-laden subject. It allows us to encourage diverse values.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt; I see language not just a tool for communication but also as a powerful tool for thinking and value transfer, thus, for identity formation. &gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;Language is a tool for development and reconstruction of the ways students understand the world and themselves.&gt;</i></p>



		<p><i>&lt;It is indirect. It is not the main purpose of the course, but it is certainly felt throughout.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;It is important: I always stress values such as academic integrity and honesty as well as respect for other people's opinions.&gt;</i></p>
--	--	---

Some of the research participants claimed that values are important for the choice of the teaching materials. Others maintained the view that values encourage students' motivation to succeed and to grow as well as to learn a foreign language and to know more about the culture of the target language. It was emphasized by some of the respondents that language is the value of every nation. Nearly all pointed out that ELT is a highly value-laden subject and that it is not just a means of communication but also a very powerful tool for developing critical thinking and value transfer, thus, important for students' identity formation ('<...> language is a tool for development and reconstruction of the ways students understand the world and themselves <...>'). However, one respondent claimed that development of the linguistic competence is not the main purpose of the course, but it is certainly felt throughout, very much depending on the choice of themes studied according to the curriculum and the target audience of students. It should also be mentioned that the respondents' answers demonstrated that some subjects, within the scope of language teaching/ learning, provide more favourable opportunities for the development of values than others, for instance, the course of *English Language for the Students of Philosophy* and the course on *English Morphology* ('<...> Values could be fostered more directly in culture classes than in language classes, especially language classes that teach pure grammar <...>').

The Category of "**Attention to values in the language teaching / learning process**", presented in Table 3 below, is defined by subcategories which reveal the respondents' views on the importance of values in language teaching/ learning process.

**Table 3. Links between values and language teaching / learning process: category "Attention to values in language teaching / learning process" and subcategories.**

Category	Subcategories	Examples of Statements
Attention to values in the language teaching/ learning process	<p>Various values can be found in the educational materials.</p> <p>Value is respect not only for my language but also for other languages &amp; cultures.</p> <p>Students belong to the other generation and have different values.</p> <p>We can influence and develop their values indirectly and subtly.</p>	<p><i>&lt;The themes of various values can be found in the educational material and applied in the classroom.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;I think that enough because current students are very sensitive and are not self-critical, they prefer to criticize others more than to be objective, and therefore they need to be accountable for talking, they can very quickly recognize it as moralization.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt; We feel a lot of freedom at school, and intolerance to accept a different idea. I noticed that young people value love, freedom, health, self-esteem, tolerance, leadership, innovativeness, honesty with oneself more than faithfulness, honesty with respect to others, diligence, self-criticism, respect for the person, responsibility.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;The value is respect not only for my language but also for other languages and cultures (I also present the views of other countries on the state language, language policy). I consider citizenship (not only nationality) as a value and try to talk about it.&gt;</i></p>

		<p><i>&lt; I appreciate the students' desire to improve and improve their work / activities / tasks. As the Lithuanian language is essential, one of the most important components in the whole content of education, I want future teachers to have a true understanding of education from the content of my subjects. &gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt; I believe that feedback is one of the most important elements not only for personal evaluation, but also to maintain the feeling that there is always something to improve, there is always where to improve. And such a teacher is a value.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;The way I understand values is a set of beliefs about what is good and right. In my opinion, I do not give enough attention to this issue, which is also typical to many language educators.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;We, language educators, and our students belong to different generational cohorts that share different systems of values, which is what makes things complicated. What I might see as an important value to be preserved, students, who belong to Generation X, may consider of little importance.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;I do pay attention, but I never talk about it, except maybe with students of philosophy. When we talk about ethics, my values are probably felt in the questions I ask them.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;Probably in the topics we choose to do with them, and our approach to those topics. We can influence and develop their values indirectly and subtly.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;Yes, because I not only simply tell my students where they can find information regarding a problematic issue, but also teach them – e.g. I explain how to make references and paraphrase sources of literature correctly in order not to plagiarise.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;Besides, I teach them by my personal example. To illustrate, at the beginning of the course I explain what academic integrity is and why cheating is not acceptable, and I never tolerate academic cheating.&gt;</i></p>
--	--	---

Some of the research participants acknowledged an evident need to develop students' value attitudes as ('<...> students are very sensitive and are not self-critical, they prefer to criticize others more than to be objective <...>'). Others claim the importance of values to be linked with cultures of the target language ('<...> value is respect not only for my language but also for other languages and cultures <...>'). Some others stated that values are different and everyone has different value attitudes, therefore they try to avoid the topic of values ('<...> students belong to the other generation and have different values <...>'), whereas others expressed the view that development of value attitudes might be indirect ('<...> we can influence and develop their values indirectly and subtly <...>'). O Some research participants highlighted that academic integrity and students' desire to improve are of great importance for university education.

The Category of “*Teaching methods to develop students’ value attitudes in the language teaching / learning process*”, presented in Table 4 below, is specified by subcategories that determine the choice of teaching / learning methods that assure successful integration of values into the language teaching / learning process.

**Table 4. Links between values and the language teaching / learning process: category “*Teaching methods to develop students’ value attitudes in language teaching / learning process*” and subcategories.**

Category	Subcategories	Examples of statements
Teaching methods to develop students’ value attitudes in language teaching / learning process	Involving students in peer or group assessment and self-assessment, extensive use of communicative language teaching and action-based approaches, discussion to encourage critical thinking.	<p>&lt;From frontal, group and individual work&gt;</p> <p>&lt;Discussion of the presented information (raising issues), discussion, justification of the opinion.&gt;</p> <p>&lt;Analysis of texts and videos, discussions in small groups on a variety of cultural and linguistic phenomena, presentations on selected cultural themes.&gt;</p> <p>&lt;Brainstorming activities, case analysis, movie / text discussions, all methods can be applied.&gt;</p> <p>&lt;I do not agree with the idea that "values" can be taught. You just need to talk with the students, select a topic you are teaching in order to have a discussion, share experiences.&gt;</p> <p>&lt;The presentation of examples and the promotion of critical thinking - the best methods.&gt;</p> <p>&lt;Whatever the work, I always ask students to distinguish at least three advantages and two aspects to be improved. If it is organized in pairs or groups, the activities are evaluated by all the members of the group; performance results are evaluated in equal parts jointly by students and a lecturer according to previously developed criteria&gt;</p> <p>&lt;Through the extensive use of communicative language teaching and action-based approach, which is prioritized in the new CEFR document.&gt;</p> <p>&lt;Probably in the topics we choose to do with them, and our approach to those topics. We can influence and develop their values indirectly and subtly.&gt;</p> <p>&lt;By explaining, analysing examples, and discussing difficult issues&gt;</p>

This category reveals such notional contexts as: involving students in peer group assessment, and self-assessment, extensive use of communicative language teaching and action-based approaches, discussion to encourage students’ critical thinking (‘<...> discussions in small groups on a variety of cultural and linguistic phenomena <...>’). Some teachers expressed a very strong opinion on the development of values (‘<...> I do not agree with the idea that "values" can be taught. You just need to talk with the students, select a topic you are teaching in order to have a discussion, share experiences <...>’) supporting her argument by the statement that the best method is the presentation of examples and the promotion of critical thinking.

The Category of “*Importance of the development of values in plurilingual education*”, presented in Table 5 below, revealed the teachers’ viewpoints to the place of values in the language teaching / learning process.

**Table 5. Links between values and the language teaching / learning process: category “Importance of the development of values in plurilingual education” and subcategories.**

Category	Subcategories	Examples of statements
Importance of the development of values in plurilingual education	<p>Comparison of one's and other countries' cultures, highlighting their similarities and differences;</p> <p>The need to develop tolerance and respect for the distinctive and diverse nature of other cultures;</p> <p>the mission of language lecturers, as the representatives of the sciences of humanities, is to promote other cultures and to respect their own;</p> <p>value attitudes are very important as they are the "engine" of all life; higher education is the place where the growth and maturation of the learner as a whole human being should be inspired and reinforced;</p> <p>nowadays it's particularly important because there are many international students who come from different cultures.</p>	<p>&lt;More important is the comparison of one's and other countries' cultures, highlighting their similarities and differences.&gt;</p> <p>&lt;I do not like "education" as a term, because it implies the development of some fixed ability and qualities that can be measured. From this point of view, the development of value attitudes in adult education is nonsense, because it is a matter of choice, they change according to the situation, cannot be measured.&gt;</p> <p>&lt; In the context of language teaching, it is worth developing a knowledge of potential values (such as a particular culture) that is needed for understanding and interpreting foreign languages and subjects of linguistic ethics ("traffic rules")&gt;</p> <p>&lt;The need to develop tolerance and respect for the distinctive and diverse nature of other cultures.&gt;</p> <p>&lt;Language is a very grateful thing when comparing peoples' cultures, discussing different situations, it is possible to speak directly about it through examples, tasks, to get an opinion, and from the answers to understand the importance of values and the place of values in the life of each student, in his / her environment.&gt;</p> <p>&lt;It's important because subjects of humanities are decreasing in higher education. Thus, the mission of language lecturers, as the representatives of the sciences of humanities, is to promote other cultures and to respect their own, and is becoming more and more important.&gt;</p> <p>&lt;Value attitudes are very important as they are the "engine" of all life, which determines not only language learning but also the quality of any activity. After all, the person's independence, responsibility, ability to express his or her opinion, depend on value attitudes.&gt;</p> <p>&lt;Because higher education is the place where the growth and maturation of the learner as a whole human being should be inspired and reinforced.&gt;</p> <p>&lt;In plurilingual education the value of multiculturalism could be developed, although by choosing to study a foreign language and culture, students probably already have a multicultural mindset. It could be further enforced in the classroom, though.&gt;</p> <p>&lt;It's always been necessary, but nowadays it's particularly</p>

		<i>important because there are many international students who come from different cultures, which can result in misunderstandings.&gt;</i>
--	--	---

Some of them expressed a view that you cannot teach values as they cannot be measured ('<...> I do not like "education" as a term, because it implies the development of some fixed ability and qualities that can be measured <...>'). Others expressed similar views to the ideas presented in CERF (2017): ('<...> Comparison of one's and other countries' cultures, highlighting their similarities and differences; the need to develop tolerance and respect for the distinctive and diverse nature of the other culture <...>'). Most of them agreed that values are important in the language teaching / learning process by expressing very similar opinions about it ('<...> the mission of language lecturers, as the representatives of the sciences of humanities, is to promote other cultures and to develop students' respect for their own <...>'). Other research participants highlighted that value attitudes are very important as they are the "engine" of all life and pointed out the role of universities in the development of value attitudes of students ('<...> higher education is the place where the growth and maturation of the learner as a whole human being should be inspired and reinforced <...>'). Still others related the importance of values with the process of internalisation of higher education ('<...> nowadays it's particularly important because there are many international students who come from different cultures <...>').

The Category of **“Ways value attitudes of students could be fostered in plurilingual education”** is presented in Table 6 below.

**Table 6. Links between values and language teaching / learning process: category “Ways value attitudes of students could be fostered in plurilingual education” and subcategories.**

<b>Category</b>	<b>Subcategories</b>	<b>Examples of statements</b>
Ways value attitudes of students could be fostered in plurilingual education	Social interaction and group work. Raising awareness of students. Discussion, justification of the opinion, presentations on a chosen cultural theme.	<p>&lt;By organizing much of social interaction and group work. Setting up common ground rules with agreed values could also help group members to foster them.&gt;</p> <p>&lt;By broadening their views of other cultures and universal themes and attitudes, they can develop a sense of what is considered good and what bad. &gt;</p> <p>&lt;They could also be taught not to accept any idea at face value, but to critically appraise it and form their own opinion about it.&gt;</p> <p>&lt;By developing students' understanding of the role of values in higher education&gt;</p> <p>&lt;Through the educational material, through student self-examination, through the improvement of psychological health in society.&gt;</p> <p>&lt;Discussion of the presented information (raising issues), discussion, justification of the opinion.&gt;</p> <p>&lt;Preparing meetings and general lectures with native speakers; discussions in small groups on a variety of cultural and linguistic phenomena, presentations on a chosen cultural theme.&gt;</p> <p>&lt;Through theoretical and practical materials, analytical reading, situation / case analysis, problem solving, the personality of the teacher - his personal experience and</p>

		<p><i>experiences, as well as student experiences, events in the world and in Lithuania, and their discussion and correct interpretation.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;To encourage interest in your own history, geography, politics - Lithuania is a most unknown land.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;I think it should be integrated in all activities, promoting both the development of their own abilities, self-assessment of activities, and the evaluation of the activities of group friends or colleagues.&gt;</i></p>
--	--	--

This Category is explained by the subcategories of social interaction and group work (*'<...> Setting up common ground rules with agreed values could also help group members to foster values <...>'*), raising awareness of students (*'<...> students could also be taught not to accept any idea at face value, but to critically appraise it and form their own opinion about it <...>'*), discussion, justification of the opinion, presentations on a chosen cultural theme, which express very similar ideas mentioned in the category describing teaching / learning methods. Some of the respondents mentioned the personality of the teacher as well as students' experience to be of great importance (*'<...> teacher's personal experience as well as students' experiences, events in the world and in Lithuania, and their discussion and their interpretation <...>'*).

The Category of **"Values to be fostered in the language teaching / learning process"**, presented in Table 7 below, defines the values that could be fostered in the language teaching/ learning process.

**Table 7. Links between values and the language teaching / learning process: category "Values to be fostered in language teaching / learning process" and subcategories.**

Category	Subcategories	Examples of statements
Values that could be fostered in the language teaching / learning process	Multiculturalism, tolerance and empathy. Respect for different cultures, tolerance regarding different opinions, and academic integrity.	<p><i>&lt;The most important thing is a desire to learn if you are studying and the path is chosen. Formation of the attitudes takes place in education from the family, later in a healthy society.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;love, freedom, health, self-esteem, tolerance, leadership, innovativeness, honesty, diligence, self-criticism, respect for the person, responsibility, patriotism, hope, beauty ....&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;Respect for your country and language, knowledge of other cultures, and language skills. Conversational skills; Respect for your own and other cultures - it is possible when you know them, honesty in task performance independent thinking.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt;Respect for human dignity, respect for different nationalities, acknowledgment of diversity, equality of human rights, tolerance for ambiguity, supportive dialogue, perseverance, being able to engage into critical but constructive dialogue, even empathy.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt; respect for the learner's principles, and be honest and responsible both in delivering content and in assessing achievements.&gt;</i></p> <p><i>&lt; Students have to be taught these things as well. This is especially important for mutual interaction. Agreements and</i></p>

		<p><i>compliance with them are the cornerstone of working together.&gt;</i>  <i>&lt;Tolerance for other languages and cultures, empathy, the desire to learn languages and love for the native language.&gt;</i>  <i>&lt;Apart from multiculturalism, tolerance and empathy in general, I think. Values could be fostered more directly in culture classes than in language classes, especially language classes that teach pure grammar. &gt;</i>  <i>&lt;By fostering their interest and curiosity, an instructor can stimulate students to learn more, and that could hopefully lead them to study relevant issues from all angles and become well-rounded beings.&gt;</i>  <i>&lt;Respect for different cultures, tolerance regarding different opinions, and academic integrity.&gt;</i></p>
--	--	---

The notional content of this category shows that teachers rank *multiculturalism, tolerance and empathy*; they also mentioned *respect for different cultures* ('<...> *Respect for your country and language <...>, <...> Respect for human dignity, respect for different nationalities, acknowledgment of diversity, equality of human rights <...>*'), *tolerance* regarding different opinions ('<...> *tolerance for ambiguity, supportive dialogue, perseverance, being able to engage into critical but constructive dialogue, even empathy <...>*') and *academic integrity*.

It should be pointed out that similar tendencies have emerged in the research into values in plurilingual education, conducted in 2013 when university teachers from Ukraine, Georgia, and Latvia, who participated in Tempus project "Development and Introduction of Multilingual Teacher Education programmes at universities of Georgia and Ukraine (DIMTEGU)" (No. 530360-TEMPUS-12012-1GE-TEMPUS-JPCR2012 – 2014), were interviewed by using the same data collection technique. By answering the question if they pay enough attention to values in the language teaching / learning process, the research participants demonstrated similar viewpoints to the ones expressed by the language teachers of the Lithuanian universities. Most of them were aware of the necessity for values in education, some others' awareness level of it was lower. It could be mentioned, however, that the research participants provided a more extensive enumeration of the teaching / learning methods for the development of value attitudes than the Lithuanian interviewees. They have mentioned experiential learning, problem-based teaching, project work, cooperative learning, reflection, culture oriented approach, communicative activities, active learning, discussions, brainstorming, case-studies, presentations, debates. Some of their answers revealed some deeper insights into the reality of the application of enumerated teaching / learning methods ('<...> *teaching values in an inexplicit way; speaking about cultural values, British or American culture; the best method is immersion; by showing to students the rich cultural heritage of a given culture; by providing knowledge that the gap between cultures is always a challenge to bridge over <...>*'). By providing the answers to the question why the development of values is necessary in plurilingual education they mentioned that values determine one's behavior, therefore it is important to develop students' values. They have also stressed the fact that plurilingualism itself presupposes respect for other cultures, democracy and diversity ('<...> *It strengthens one's love of the native language and culture as well as the culture of others <...>*'). Some others expressed similar ideas ('<...> *plurilingual education is based on values, helps form empathy to other cultures, respect to other nations, values make the multilingual education full-fledged, develops the perception of equality <...>*'), which undoubtedly prove the research participants' understanding of the importance of values in plurilingual education.

## Conclusions

The empirical research data analysis leads to the following conclusions that could be made: university teachers are aware of the necessity of the development of values in plurilingual education. Nearly all the teacher experts, who participated in the research, agree that teaching languages is inseparable from cultural issues and that values are embedded in the cultures of the target languages. In terms of teaching / learning methods, the most appropriate ones seemed to be: involving students in peer or group assessment and self-assessment, extensive use of communicative language teaching and action-based approaches, discussion to encourage students' critical thinking. The interviewees' answers also revealed that university teachers have to purposefully choose appropriate teaching / learning materials to develop students' value attitudes. The interviewees' answers revealed that the most important values that should be fostered during language teaching/ learning process are: *multiculturalism, tolerance and empathy; respect for different cultures, tolerance regarding different opinions, and academic integrity.*

## References

- A framework of reference for pluralistic approaches to languages and cultures. Retrieved from <http://carap.ecml.at/Descriptorsofresources/tabid/2654/language/en-GB/Default.aspx>
- Beacco & Byram (2003). Guide for the Development of Language Education Policies in Europe. Language Policy Division Council of Europe. [https://www.coe.int/t/dg4/linguistic/Source/FullGuide\\_EN.pdf](https://www.coe.int/t/dg4/linguistic/Source/FullGuide_EN.pdf)
- Byram, Michael. (2000). Assessing intercultural competence. *Sprogforum* 18 (6): 8-13. [http://inet.dpb.dpu.dk/infodok/sprogforum,Espr\\_nr18.html](http://inet.dpb.dpu.dk/infodok/sprogforum,Espr_nr18.html). Accessed 27 August 2009.
- CARAP / FREPA Project Training Kit. FREPA and educational language policies. (2012). Retrieved from <http://carap.ecml.at/LinkClick.aspx?fileticket=FIuVnewvfZ0%3d&tabid=2964&language=en-GB>
- Clark, J. B., Vanthuyne, A., & Mady, C. (2014). Exploring Reflexivity and Multilingualism in Three French Language Teacher Education Programs. *Canadian Journal Of Applied Linguistics*, 17(1), 129-155.
- Common European Framework of Reference for Languages: learning, teaching, assessment companion volume with new descriptors. Provisional Edition September 2017. Language Policy Programme Education Policy Division Education Department Council of Europe. Retrieved from <https://rm.coe.int/common-european-framework-of-reference-for-languages-learning-teaching/168074a4e2>
- Common European Framework of Reference for Languages: learning, teaching, assessment. Language Policy Unit, Strasbourg [www.coe.int/lang-CEFR](http://www.coe.int/lang-CEFR). Retrieved from [https://www.coe.int/t/dg4/linguistic/source/framework\\_en.pdf](https://www.coe.int/t/dg4/linguistic/source/framework_en.pdf)
- Fielding, R. (2016). Students' use of their plurilingual resources in Australian schools. *Language & Education: An International Journal*, 30(4), 361 - 377. doi:10.1080/09500782.2015.1114631
- Jeoffrion, C., Marcouyeux, A., Starkey-Perret, R., Narcy-Combes, M., & Birkan, I. (2014). From multilingualism to plurilingualism: university students' beliefs about language learning in a monolingual context. *Language, Culture & Curriculum*, 27(1), 8-26. doi:10.1080/07908318.2014.887724
- Kalbų mokymo politikos aprašas: Lietuva. Kalbų politikos skyrius Strasbūre. Lietuvos Respublikos švietimo ir mokslo ministerija, 2004 - 2006. (2006). Vilnius: Švietimo aprūpinimo centras.



- Klaus Børge Boeckmann, Eija Aalto, Andrea Abel, Tatjana Atanasoska and Terry Lamb. (2011). Promoting plurilingualism - Majority language in multilingual settings. European Centre for Modern Languages. Council of Europe Publishing.
- Lobo, P. (2016). Foreign Language Education in the 21st European Context: Exploring New Directions in Intercultural and Plurilingual Approaches Using Anzaldúa's Border Epistemology. *E-Teals: An E-Journal of Teacher Education & Applied Language Studies*, (7), 70 - 86. doi:10.1515/eteals-2016-0008
- López, C. C., & González-Davies, M. (2016). Switching codes in the plurilingual classroom. *ELT Journal: English Language Teaching Journal*, 70(1), 67-77. doi:10.1093/elt/ccv056
- May, Larry. (1987). *The Morality of Groups: collective responsibility, group-based harm and corporate rights*. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press.
- Moore, E., Nussbaum, L., & Borràs, E. (2013). Plurilingual teaching and learning practices in 'internationalised' university lectures. *International Journal of Bilingual Education & Bilingualism*, 16(4), 471 - 493. doi:10.1080/13670050.2012.702724
- Moore, E. (2014). Constructing content and language knowledge in plurilingual student teamwork: situated and longitudinal perspectives. *International Journal of Bilingual Education & Bilingualism*, 17(5), 586 - 609. doi:10.1080/13670050.2013.860947
- Moore, E. (2014). Constructing content and language knowledge in plurilingual student teamwork: situated and longitudinal perspectives. *International Journal of Bilingual Education & Bilingualism*, 17(5), 586 - 609. doi:10.1080/13670050.2013.860947
- Newby, D., Allan, R., Fenner, A., Jones, B., Komorowska, H., Soghikyan, K. (2007). European Portfolio for Student Teachers of Languages A reflection tool for language teacher education. European Centre for Modern Languages, Council of Europe, February 2007. <http://www.ecml.at/epostl>
- Neuliep, James. (2006). *Intercultural Communication. A contextual approach*. 3<sup>rd</sup> ed. California: Sage Publications.
- Prasad, G. (2015). Beyond the mirror towards a plurilingual prism: exploring the creation of plurilingual 'identity texts' in English and French classrooms in Toronto and Montpellier. *Intercultural Education*, 26(6), 497 - 514. doi:10.1080/14675986.2015.1109775
- Pujol-Ferran, M., DiSanto, J. M., Rodríguez, N. N., & Morales, A. (2016). Exploring Plurilingual Pedagogies across the College Curriculum. *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 72(4), 530 - 549. doi:10.3138/cmlr.3306
- Scarino, A., Liddicoat, A. J. (2009). *Language, Culture and Learning*. Australian Government Department of Education, Employment and Workplace Relations. ISBN: 978 1 74200 081 7. Retrieved from [http://www.tllg.unisa.edu.au/lib\\_guide/gllt\\_ch2.pdf](http://www.tllg.unisa.edu.au/lib_guide/gllt_ch2.pdf)
- Starkey-Perret, R., & Narcy-Combes, M. (2017). Implementing a plurilingual programme in a university in France. *Language, Culture & Curriculum*, 30(2), 174 - 197. doi:10.1080/07908318.2016.1217232
- Tolosa, C., Biebricher, C., East, M., & Howard, J. (2018). Intercultural language teaching as a catalyst for teacher inquiry. *Teaching & Teacher Education*, 70227 - 235. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2017.11.027
- Valstybinė švietimo strategija 2013 – 2022 m.: tikslai, problemos, tobulinimo kryptys. (2012). 2012, spalio Nr. 17 (81) ISSN 1822 - 4156. Retrieved from [https://www.smm.lt/uploads/documents/kiti/201210\\_Nr\\_17\\_Valstybine\\_svietimo%20strategija.pdf](https://www.smm.lt/uploads/documents/kiti/201210_Nr_17_Valstybine_svietimo%20strategija.pdf)