International Journal

of

MULTILINGUAL
EDUCATION

INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL
of
MULTILINGUAL EDUCATION

CCIIR

CONTENT

Lena (Elene) Jajanidze

Ivane Javakhishvili Tbilisi State University, Georgia

Practices of Submersion Education and Readiness of Teachers to Teach in a Culturally Diverse Classroom on the Case of Georgia[1]

ABSTRACT

In this article will be introduced the teaching practice and challenges for one of the most popular education programs in Georgia, the Submersion Bilingual Program. The practice of submersion bilingual education includes the learning and teaching process of linguistic majority and minority students together, in the same classroom environment, with the same curriculum in the majority language.

The existence of a submersion bilingual program in Georgia is conditioned by the ethnic and linguistic diversity of the country's population. The article is based on a qualitative research in which I studied the attitudes of teachers in submersion schools and their professional readiness to teach in a multilingual classroom. The research analyzes the difference between teachers' expectations towards minority and majority students and the impact of teachers' attitudes and preconceptions on the process of forming expectations towards ethnic students. The article below also highlights the challenges specific to submersion schools, the methodological knowledge and intercultural skills of teachers, and their practices for effective teaching in a different language environment. At the end of the article the author's conclusions and recommendations are provided which are based on the research findings in order to improve teaching practice.

Keywords: Classroom environment, Multilingual, Expectations, Different language, Intercultural sensitivity

1. Introduction

Every child has the capacity to learn and develop. Having high expectations is especially important for the most vulnerable children, so that, they can achieve better outcomes. Some children need additional support during different learning experiences (VEYLDF, 2016). It is especially important to support students which live and study in diverse communities and schools. This article

discusses the issue of minority students studying in majority schools on the example of Georgia.

Georgia is a multi-ethnic country with religious, linguistic, and cultural diversity. According to the 2014 census of Georgia, about 12% of the population represents different ethnic groups (Georgian National Department of Statistics, 2019). The most numerous are Armenian - and Azerbaijani-speaking populations. Teaching the Georgian language to ethnic minorities and ensuring quality education while preserving their native language and culture is one of the most important challenges in Georgian education policy.

This issue is directly related from the need of implementing bilingual teaching practices in Georgia. The issue of bilingual education has become more essential in Georgia in recent years, and therefore, approaches and strategies of state intervention are gradually changing. In order to promote state language teaching for ethnic minorities from 2004 to the present, various events were held, changes were made in this direction, both - the legislative framework and pilot schools were introduced and various bilingual/multilingual educational programs were implemented. Also, Georgia has a pluralistic approach to linguistic minorities: there are state-funded language minority schools, but in most non-Georgian language schools are provided the weak bilingual programs, for example: Teaching the state language as a second language (Tabatadze, 2010).

Currently, out of 2085 public schools operating in Georgia, 208 public schools are non- Georgian, mostly located in densely populated regions with ethnic minorities (Georgian National Department of Statistics, 2019). In addition to this program, in Georgian language schools, students of ethnic minorities study within the Georgian general education program and according to general observations, their number is increasing in different Georgian schools from year to year. This practice is called as submersion education instructed in the majority language, and it is one of the most common form of bilingual education (Baker, 2006/2010). The challenges of the implementation of submersion education in Georgia are the research topic of this paper. For a broader understanding ofthe issue, I consider the importance between providing short and comprehensive information aboutsubmersion education, its effectiveness, and the role of teachers in this program. Accordingly, in thenext subsection, I briefly discuss the purpose and role of submersion bilingual teaching practice interms of education and integration of language minority students. However, for the purpose of thisarticle, I conducted a qualitative study, the results and findings will be given below in the paper.

1.1. Discussion on the effectiveness of submersion bilingual teaching practices

As mentioned above, submersion is a form of educational practice in which minority students attend schools where the majority language is used as the language of instruction and the minority

language students learn with the majority students (Baker, 2006/2010).

The goal of submersion is to force students of immigrants or linguistic minorities to learn the language of the majority as quickly as possible (Baker, 2006/2010). This goal is related to the political goal, while linguistic assimilation is more profitable for the state, where the representatives of differentlanguage groups live. For example, linguistic diversity was often perceived as a threat to the unity ofa country in the United States. Consequently, one language is associated with a unified system ofvalues, attitudes, or goals (Baker, 2006/2010). In addition, one of the important factors contributing tosubmersion education can be considered the motivation of parents to make their children learn thelanguage of the majority quickly.

This motivation is driven by the belief of immigrant parents that getting a quality education is only possible in the majority language and therefore, it is related to career advancement and social integration (Tago & Ots, 2010).

Different education researchers in the context of different countries study the results of submersion education and the factors that prevent the student from simultaneously learning the language and getting a quality education. For example, we can review Collier's studies in this field. Collier (1995) presented a conceptual model of second language acquisition as part of a review of the effectiveness of a submersion learning program, consisting of four critical components: sociocultural, linguistic, academic, and cognitive processes, which are interrelated and complex phenomena. Analyzing this model, Collier concludes, that the development of each component separately, neglecting any other component or inconsistent principle, hinders the language acquisition process as a whole process and considers the role of the first, or native language, as an important basis of these processes of language development.

Cummins also examined the academic achievement of immigrant children in the United States and the records of their teachers and school psychologists concerning specific children who had to study in a submersion environment. Cummins in the study discusses the comments of teachers and psychologists about the cognitive-developmental delays and academic failure of immigrant children. In particular, there are cases, where teachers talk about a child's low level of development and learning failure, while the same teachers emphasize that these children do not have a problem communicating in English. Examining teachers 'written assessments, Cummins found that teachers' expectations were low in terms of academic achievement of linguistic minorities (Cummins, 1981, 1984).

In the United States, within various bilingual programs, including submersion ones, students achieved certain language competencies and it was believed, that they could already master the subjects in English, which in turn led to students' academic failure (Baker, /2006/2010). Concerning this

Elene (Lena) Jajanidze, Practices of Submersion Education and Readiness of Teachers to
Teach in a Culturally Diverse Classroom on the Case of Georgia

20, 2022

pp. 1-13

issue, Cummins emphasized that second language learners have not yet achieved sufficient linguistic competence to be able to master the learning materials / programs in the second language. These findings of the study played an important role in the practice of language minority students' evaluation process in later years (Timmermans &Rubie-Devies, 2018).

Tago and Ots conducted a study with fourth-grader bilingual and monolingual children in Estonian primary schools. Bilingual children were taught in submersion programs, in a majority language in schools that differed from their native/spoken language. Research has shown that students whose language skills are high, achieve higher academic results and have higher cognitive skills than students whose language skills are not sufficiently developed (Tago & Ots,2010). In general, researchers in bilingual education have come to the general conclusion, that the cognitive development and academic success of a bilingual person increases with the development of his or her level of proficiency in both languages (Baker, 2006/2010).

Valdes points out, that understanding the definition of academic language proficiency is important for school administrators and teachers in planning the learning process and approach and setting appropriate expectations for students. Valdes points out those teachers' expectations have a large impact on students' performance in terms of their capabilities. This last one in many cases even determines their learning effectiveness (Valdes, 2010). In an earlier study, Valdes identified and highlighted the factors, that prevent a student from mastering academic language at an appropriate level. These factors are relatively passive teaching strategies, students of mixed language competencies studying in one class and their joint work, overly simplified content of the subject, and use of simplified forms of language by teachers. It is important to note that teachers and the school, in general, are not to blame for this process, as the situation in the school system is largely due to the dominant structure in the society, which directly affects both teachers' expectations and students' perspectives (Trinidad, 2018).

The findings of the studies discussed above show, that many factors affect the cognitive and academic success of a language minority student, including School readiness with availability of resources, infrastructure and technology, teachers' expectations towards students, their beliefs and attitudes, relevant assessments, and teaching approaches. Each of these details are important so that the submersion program of bilingual education has certain effective results, both for the students of the linguistic minority and for the linguistic majority. The focus of this article is to study the teaching process in Georgian submersion schools, to understand the problems in submersion education classrooms and to determine the expectations of teachers, theirattitudes towards linguistic minorities.

2. Research Methodology

Within the framework of the desk research, I have processed the statistical data obtained from the regional educational centers of the Ministry of Education and Science of Georgia and public schools. According to the data, the submersion education program is mainly implemented in two regions of Georgia: Kakheti and Kvemo Kartli. These two regions, along with the Georgian-speaking population, are mostly populated by Azerbaijani-speaking people. Consequently, in the Georgian schools of these two regions, among the Georgian- speaking students also learn Azerbaijani-speaking students. According to the statistics, there are a total of, exactly 119 Georgian schools in these two regions, where submersion education practice is provided and for the 2016-2020 academic year, the total number of non-Georgian speaking students in these schools was 38.48%. By 2020-2021, the total number of non-Georgian speaking students in Georgian schools has increased even more, up to 41.17%. Based on the results of the desk research, I selected four schools for the study, two of which are presented with a small number of students and two schools - with a large number of students.

To study of the issue, I chose a qualitative research method, namely as a focus group of teachers. And as research instrument, I developed and used a focus group protocol.

RQ1: How high are the expectations and how positive attitudes have the teachers towards non-Georgian speaking students in Georgian schools?

RQ2: Do teachers' expectations for Georgian-speaking and non-Georgian-speaking students differ?

RQ3: How high is the professional readiness to teach in a linguistically diverse classroom environment and what types of hindering factors exist for teaching?

The aim of the research is to identify teachers' expectations towards non-Georgian speaking students, also to assess their attitudes towards the linguistic and ethnic diversity in the classroom, and to study teachers' professional readiness to teach in a linguistically and culturally diverse environment.

Research objectives are: 1. To find out how high the expectations of teachers are towards non - Georgian-speaking students. 2. To compare whether these expectations differ from the expectations towards Georgian-speaking children. 2. To study the professional readiness of teachers, to teach effectively in a linguistically diverse classroom environment and school preparation to instruct in a logistically and technically arranged classroom.

A total of 4 focus groups were conducted. A total of 18 teachers participated in the focus groups (15 female and 3 male participants). Teachers were selected from all major subjects from the school curricula. The teachers participating in the study teach at the secondary education level. The study was conducted remotely to reduce the risks of the Covid-19 pandemic. A-Zoom platform was used for the focus group interview.

Elene (Lena) Jajanidze, Practices of Submersion Education and Readiness of Teachers to
Teach in a Culturally Diverse Classroom on the Case of Georgia

20, 2022

pp. 1-13

2.1 Analysis of research results and important findings

The focus groups with the teachers were interesting and interactive, which allowed to make important findings related to the research questions. The analysis and findings of the research results according to the research objectives are briefly presented below.

The expectations of the teachers of the target schools towards the non-Georgian speaking students are lower in terms of learning. Teachers have much higher expectations towards Georgian-speaking students. - Teachers at all three target schools openly state, that they have lower expectations for non-Georgian-speaking students than for Georgian-speaking students. Teachers explain their low expectations towards the non-Georgian speaking students through long experience and relationships with this group of linguistic minorities, particularly the Azerbaijani-speaking community. It is noteworthy that teachers strongly emphasize that their parents also have low expectations towards their children in terms of learning and getting a better education. They point out that learning the Georgian language only at a conversational level is the goal of parents and that is why they enroll them in Georgian schools.

"An Azerbaijani parent does not want to give the child a better education. It is enough for them to learn the Georgian language, so that they can use and communicate in the hospital or in the market ... In an everyday situation, when needed"- says one of the teachers.

Teachers' low expectations towards non-Georgian-speaking Azerbaijani students are reinforced by cultural differences and traditions. They highlight the low chances of continuing their further education for Azerbaijani girls and explain this by their early marriage traditions.

"Girls are not encouraged by their parents to study well. It is not their request for a girl to be educated. Especially, with higher education. They should get married soon. Sometimes girls are appointed even before leaving school. Neither the husband's family should bring a highly educated girl"- Tells one of the school teachers.

Interviews with teachers during focus groups showed that teachers try not to interfere and do not change parents' expectations. Moreover, according to the expectations of the parents, their expectations towards the students are low as well. Teachers prefer to distance themselves from the issue of raising motivation for students' learning, as they relate parents' attitudes towards girls' education traditions, and when it comes to get a quality education for boys, teachers say they get the education they need to run easy business relationship in the country. In addition to the reasons mentioned above, teachers point out, that their low expectations are also since a large number of non-Georgian students are not interested in getting higher education in Georgia and living here in general,

as they go to work in neighboring countries: Azerbaijan, Turkey, and Russia.

In this regard, it is very interesting to study the motivation of students, why they choose a Georgian language school even when some of them do not plan to continue their education and further life in Georgia, which may be the subject of my further, more extensive research. Contrary to the low expectations of teachers towards non-Georgian speaking students, the expectations towards Georgian- speaking students are much higher. Teachers explain their attitude by a relatively high involvement of Georgian-speaking parents in the educational process, also the interests of parents and their children go in line with each other: to continue students' education in higher educational institutions.

It should be noted, that in the regions where the target schools are located, the Georgian- speaking population lives in the neighborhood of the Azerbaijani-speaking population. Most of the Azerbaijani-speaking population does not speak the state language, or few of them speak it very poorly. Teachers especially emphasize the role of mothers in supporting students; they emphasize the fact that, unlike Georgian parents, Azerbaijani parents, especially mothers, do not have the opportunity to help their children because of not knowing the language of instruction.

Although, teachers are well aware that the increased motivation and interest of Georgian children in learning is related to the active involvement of their parents in the learning process. The study found, that teachers and the school administration did not apply any additional mechanisms to increase the involvement of non-Georgian-speaking parents in the educational process. They note that it is difficult to communicate with non-Georgian-speaking parents, and it would be helpful for everyone to have their courses for teaching the Georgian language, but the school itself does not consider offering the same courses.

As I found out, during the research, teachers do not know how much their expectations and expectations of parents and school administration could determine the students' expectations towards themselves, their responsibilities, self-confidence, and motivation for the learning process. The study showed that teachers do not give much importance to this and indicate only the low motivation of non-Georgian students to study due to their culture and traditions. The named problem is closely related to teachers' prejudices about the Azerbaijani - speaking community and their culture. They have low expectations of Azerbaijani students from the very beginning, as they have a pre-established belief, the family of an Azerbaijani girl will not continue their education in higher educational institutions. Also, Azerbaijani boys continue their family activities, which are mainly related to gardening and vegetable selling.

It is noteworthy, such attitudes towards the ethnic Azerbaijani community of teachers are

Elene (Lena) Jajanidze, Practices of Submersion Education and Readiness of Teachers to Teach in a Culturally Diverse Classroom on the Case of Georgia

20, 2022

pp. 1-13

explained by the experience of the relationships, which teachers have with them, or know from others. Having similar attitudes and prejudices towards a particular community, culture, or ethnic group may indicate low intercultural competencies of teachers, resulting in lower expectations of teachers towards different cultures and language groups. The above-discussed level of intercultural sensitivity of teachers can be a significant hindering factor to the effective teaching process in a diverse classroom environment.

As the study clearly showed, low expectations of teachers towards non-Georgian speaking students are one of the important factors in their willingness to teach in a diverse classroom environment. However, in addition to these expectations, the quality and results of learning are also greatly influenced by the professional readiness of teachers, knowledge of teaching methods, and the maintenance of school infrastructure. Accordingly, the next important finding based on the research objectives is related to school preparation and teachers' readiness to teach in a diverse environment.

As the study shows the professional readiness of teachers in schools with a submersion education program to teach in a diverse classroom environment is low. The target schools are characterized by unsupported infrastructure for teaching, poor teaching materials, and inaccessibility of technology - Two of these four target schools have just been renovated, two schools are still very damaged and teachers and students have difficulty even creating basic learning conditions at the school, such as warmth, good lighting, and classroom equipment. Those two schools, which have been renovated for only a few months, were in the same conditions as the other schools with a completely disorganized and unsuitable teaching infrastructure. Teachers point out that schools have only limited access to technological materials such as computers, projectors, etc. They underline - there is a computer class in school, but computers are insufficient due to the number of students - only computer technology lessons are taught in the computer class, and other teachers rarely have access to the Internet and computers during the learning process.

However, teachers also underline the importance of technology in the teaching process, especially in languages and subject teaching, and pointed out-they often use their smartphones to show students any videos or pictures related to the lesson topic. Teachers themselves reflect on their approaches insufficient to integrate technologies into the learning process and agree the idea it would be very helpful in the submersion classes to have in each classroom a computer, projector, and high-speed Internet. An internet connection is also problematic for rural settlements and consequently for the schools located there.

My research has shown, the target schools are characterized by a lack of much-needed laboratories for science classes, as well as a lack of visual materials, posters, illustrations, or various

learning cards. For the positive evaluation of the teachers of this school, we must emphasize the next fact- they try to fill the lack with necessary teaching materials, buy materials at their own financial expense, or create, paint or sculpt educational resources with the help of students. They point out, without visual materials it is very difficult for non- Georgian students to understand the content of the lesson, to understand new words. However, they emphasize, the visual resources they create, are not enough to realize the materials thoroughly.

At the same time, the usage of visual materials are one of the methods which teachers apply in the teaching process, and they say, the next - it has a positive effect on learning in a linguistically diverse classroom, as the visuals make the issue more interesting and more perceptible for all students at all levels of learning. Teachers also pointed out, teaching in a linguistically diverse classroom is a challenge for them, as it is difficult to explain lesson material to children with different language proficiency levels in classroom so that, it is understandableand fascinating for every student.

"How can I be not aware of different teaching approaches? But there is a language barrier between students in my classroom. What should I do in this case? For example, I want to plan group work. It also takes a long time to explain to an Azerbaijani student and after they analyze what to do. Meanwhile, the Georgian child loses interest and tries to make noise. I can understand him too, he/she's a child as well, and he/she's tired of these boring instructions. Sadly, I often cannot achieve the goal of the lesson at all, and I am forced to either stop the activity or change the purpose of the activity." -Shared me her experience of using the methods of one of the teachers.

Focus group interviews revealed that teachers themselves feel, they do not possess teaching methods in a linguistically diverse classroom properly, so the lesson does not become too simplistic and boring for Georgian-speaking children, while they try to explain the issue in simplified language to the Azerbaijani student. As the research showed, the teachers mainly use the method of adapting and simplifying the content of the lesson and at the same time use as language translators those Azerbaijani-speaking students who are relatively fluent in Georgian. When using the approach of involving language translators, teachers cannot control the quality of the material comprehension or the relevance of the content delivery. They point out, this is not an effective method, however, they consider and apply it as one of the alternative approaches in the existing learning environment.

It is noteworthy that teachers also use the pair working method. When using the method, teachers pair an Azerbaijanian-speaking student with a Georgian-speaking student to help the Azerbaijanian-speaking student in understanding. Working in pairs helps bringing together culturally diverse students and integrate linguistic minorities into the school environment. Teachers point out that the method of working in pairs is also rarely used, especially in the last two years, aspandemic

recommendations require keeping students at a distance from each other.

Research has shown the next result: teachers attended a variety of subject training for professional development, although they have never been offered training about teaching in a linguistically diverse classroom. However, they do not consider themselves incompetent to teach in a submersion education program school, they see this as a problem to be solved by the school administration, the Ministry of Education, or even Azerbaijani-speaking parents. Teachers think that the following activities will help them a lot in their teaching process and for their students in learning: the good arrangement of submersion education schools in terms of infrastructure and equipment (including the purchase of appropriate laboratories and other visual materials), providing additional compensatory lessons for Azerbaijani students in Georgian, increasing parental involvement, arranging libraries, where additional reading materials in Georgian will be available.

To summarize the results of the research, interviews with teachers showed that submersion schools do not have good technological equipment at this stage, which hinders the effective conduct of the learning process, while the readiness and knowledge of teachers to use effective methods for teaching in a multilingual classroom is low and insufficient. Based on the results of the research and the analysis of the relevant findings, in the article, I have proposed conclusions and several recommendations on key issues, which are addressed to the school administration, teachers, as well as the Ministry of Education.

3. Conclusion and Recommendations

The aim of the current research was to study how high the expectations of teachers are towards non-Georgian-speaking students and whether these expectations differ from the expectations of Georgian-speaking children. The research question, which included teachers' expectations of language minority students, was answered as a part of the study. A qualitative method study of the issue showed that the expectations of teachers in submersion schools towards linguistic minorities are low, and it differs from the expectations towards linguistic majority students.

Teachers' low expectations of linguistic minorities are reinforced by prejudices against the culture of the ethnic Azerbaijani community, indicating teachers' low intercultural sensitivity. As studies and teaching practices show, teachers' expectations may correlate with students' academic success. Therefore, it is very important to plan appropriate measures in this direction. In particular, I would suggest to the Ministry of Education and Science of Georgia to take into account the results of current research, as well as to plan and study the level of intercultural sensitivity of submersion school teachers and determine their beliefs and attitudes towards different cultures.

Based on the results of the research, teachers should be offered seminars focused on tolerance- and diversity-oriented pedagogic, which will aim to increase teachers' intercultural sensitivity and expectations towards linguistic minority students.

The involvement and support of the school administration will also be significant in this regard, as a tolerance-oriented pedagogical approach must be fully understood by the whole school community.

Based on the results of this study, I would recommend to teachers to search and share each other additional methodological resources and materials, as well as to get acquainted with the submersion- classroom teaching practices of other countries, which will allow them to see their approaches from another perspective and be able to flexibly change teaching strategies, share and try different teaching methods.

The second part of the research aim, which included to study the proper infrastructural and logistical support of schools and the professional readiness of teachers for the effective implementation of the submersion program can be considered answered through in-depth analysis and information gathering process. We can conclude that in one part of the surveyed schools, which has been renovated, various learning resources are partially available, however, in the other part - which is not newly renovated -learning resources, except for textbooks, aren't available. However, we can say on the example of all schools that the use of the Internet and technologies is problematic and limited in the school, which creates discomfort for teachers in the teaching process.

However, I should also mention here, my research had limits. Foremost, it was qualitative research in which I studied the issue in-depth, although it is important to increase the coverage area of the research. In line with the findings of the study, I consider it critical, schools implementing the submersion bilingual education program should be declared by the Ministry of Education as priority- schools in terms of infrastructural improvement, necessary equipment, and technology.

I believe that the implementation of this recommendation will make teaching in these schools more effective, which will be one of the supporting factors to increase the school engagement and motivation of both Georgian and non-Georgian students.

In response to the third research question, the professional readiness of teachers to teach in a linguistically diverse classroom is low, I think it is an essential indicator for the effective planning and implementation of the current process of submersion education in the regions of Georgia. I would suggest, in addition to tolerance-oriented pedagogical training, we also would offer them quality training and seminars to apply modern teaching methods and approaches in the diverse environment tailored to the needs of the students. I think, education is a versatile process, which also takes into

account the experience of other countries and requires the involvement of various actors in the field of education to implement it effectively.

References

Baker, C. (2006/2010). *Foundations of Bilingual Education and* Bilingualism (S. Tabatadze, Trans.) Multilingual Matters. (Original work published 2006).

Collier, V. P. (1995). Acquiring a second language for school. *Directions in language and education*, *1*(4), 2-14.

Cummins, J. (1981). The role of primary language development in promoting educational success for language minority students. In California State Department of Education (ed.), *Schooling and language minority students: A theoretical framework*. Los Angeles: Evaluation, Dissemination and Assessment Center California State University, 3- 49.

Department of Education and Training (Victoria) and Victorian Curriculum and Assessment Authority (2016). *Victorian Early Years Learning and Development Framework*. Melbourne: Department of Education and Training (Victoria).

National Statistics Office of Georgia. (2019). *Demographic Situation in Georgia 2019*. Tbilisi, Georgia.

Tabatadze, S. (2010). Bilingual education programs in Georgia, what public schools can choose. *Journal Bilingual Education*, *1*, 7-21.

Tago, M., & Ots, A. (2010). Pupils who speak a „wrong" language: Bilingual children's academic achievement in submersion education. In A. Toomela (Ed.), *Systemic person-oriented study of child development in early primary school* (pp. 133–154). Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang.

Timmermans, A. C., & Rubie-Davies, C. M. (2018). Do teachers differ in the level of expectations or in the extent to which they differentiate in expectations? Relations between teacher-level expectations, teacher background and beliefs, and subsequent student performance. *Educational Research and Evaluation, 24* (3-5), 241-263.

Trinidad, J. E. (2019). Collective expectations protecting and preventing academic achievement. *Education and Urban Society*, *51*(9), 1147-1171, doi:10.1177/0013124518785444.

Valdés, G. (2001). Learning and not learning English: Latino students in American schools. New York: Teachers College Press.

Valdés, G. (2004). Between support and marginalisation: The development of academic language in linguistic minority children. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, *7*(2-3), 102-132, doi: 10.1080/13670050408667804

Ruženka Šimonji Černak, Mila Beljanski, Bilingualism as an independent variable in the education of national minorities in the example of Slovakian national minority in Vojvodina

20, 2022

pp. 14-35

Ruženka Šimonji Černak

Mila Beljanski

University of Novi Sad, Sombor (Serbia)

Bilingualism as an independent variable in the education of national minorities in the example of Slovakian national minority in Vojvodina

ABSTRACT

The Slovakian people in Vojvodina are an autochthonous minority with command of both Slovakian and Serbian language. The Constitution of the Republic of Serbia enables them to receive education in their mother tongue. The task of this paper is to analyse how the Slovak-Serbian bilingualism affects the process of education in children whose mother tongue is Slovakian. The starting point is the fact that education of children who belong to national minorities is specific due to choice of their official medium of instruction, change of the medium of instruction, adapting to the majority language, learning of the majority language and development of intercultural competences. Within these specific aspects, throughout this paper, we have showcased various research conducted in the past 20 years. These research deal with the choice of the medium of instruction, influence of the change of the medium of instruction on academic achievement, adaptation to Serbian language in the secondary school, learning the majority language as core subject and research on bilingualism as a factor of developing interculturality of children. Based on the results we can attempt answer to a question of how Slovakian-Serbian bilingualism affects the educational path of the Slovak national minority in Vojvodina.

Keywords: autochthonous minority, bilingualism, education, Slovak, Serbia

Introduction

Slovakian people in Vojvodina are an autochthonous language minority who have been living outside their homeland, Slovakia for nearly 300 years. They have migrated within the Hungarian-Austrian Empire without changing the country, but after WWI found themselves living within the borders of a different country. The term autochthonous minority denotes people who have become an ethnic or national minority in a new country without changing their place of residence (Gilbert &

Castellino, 2003; Vuković, 2010; Raduški, 2009). Their national identity is determined on the basis of their language and culture, rather than the country of residence. In their language, the term "nationality" is a ethnonym, not a politonym. The region od South-East Europe is relatively rich in linguistic minorities (Černak, 2019). Slovak are the autochthonous linguistic minority in Serbia, Hungary, Romania and Croatia. As members of the national minority in Serbia, they are always bilingual, they have command of Slovakian a their first language and Serbian as a second language and the majority language. Their bilingualism can be observed as and studied on individual and social levels. According to the 2002 census, there are 56.637 Slovaks in Vojvodina (Makišova, 2010) and according to 2011 census there were 52.425 (Languages and scripts in Vojvodina, 2019), which is fewer when compared to the previous census, but also, due to negative birth rate and vast migrations of the young people to Europe, the number today is much lower.

Bilingualism influence many segments of life of the autochthonous national minorities: education, culture, informedness, language usage in public life, professional development and professional movement, migration. The most prolific interrelatedness can be seen in the relationship of bilingualism and education. On the one hand, bilingualism of the autochthonous minorities determines in great part their education path, and on the other hand, education is the key element in sustaining an developing bilingualism. In the literature, there are numerous examples and typologies of bilingual education in the languages of minorities (Baker, 2001, Garcia, 2009; Göncz, 2007; Skutnab Kangas, 1991). For educational needs of the autochthonous linguistic minorities, especially in central-eastern European countries, the distinction between between the concept of bilingual education and education in two languages (Göncz, 2007) is useful. Bilingual education has a broader meaning and it includes all forms of education which have as their goal promotion of bilingual students, regardless of the language used as medium of instruction. On the other hand, education process conducted in two languages means using two parallel languages in schooling, where becoming a bilingual student is not a goal. Distinction between the two is important for members of the autochthonous minorities because in their case, education in the mother tongue while taking the majority language as a separate subject is the best way to achieve high levels of bilingualism, rather than taking classes in both languages. Moreover, institutional support to the language which has less chance of developing can make a difference between success and failure in preserving minority language. Education in mother tongue and learning of the second, majority language is the way to integrate into the broader community, where many national minorities live alongside the majority. This way, assimilation is also avoided, which would perhaps occur if education was only to be conducted in the majority language or even by using both languages, as well as ghettoization, which

is a consequence of education conducted only in the minority language, without a strong presence or quality learning of the language of majority.

Official language of the instruction (particularly in elementary school which is compulsory and lasts longest) is thus one of the most significant factors for preservation and development of the mother tongue of a minority. According to a research of education in the Slovakian language in Serbia, Hungary and Romania, which was conducted by Šimonji-Černak (2012) the language of instruction is an important predictor of development of linguistic competences in Slovakian, attitude towards minority education and frequency of simultaneous usage of mother tongue and the language of majority. The medium of instruction in elementary school can be treated as an independent variable which will influence the education model applied in primary schools, status and perspectives of the development of mother tongue, acquiring linguistic competences in mother tongue and the majority language as well as development of national and linguistic identity.

Education in Serbia is conducted in the languages of minorities, thus in Slovakian, it is conducted in several different ways (Černak. 2013):

1. Entire process is done in the mother tongue of the minority, and Serbian is taken as a second language.

2. In the first cycle of the elementary school (first four years) the process is conducted in the mother tongue of the minority, with Serbian as a second language as the only subject taught in the majority language, while the the second cycle is taught in the majority language, with the minority language only present as the compulsory or elective subject.

3. The whole process is conducted in the majority language, with the mother tongue of the minority present as an compulsory or elective subject or not present at all in the curriculum.

We can see that the first model is of a developmental type (Garcia, 2009) or a strong model (Baker, 2001) of education. Its goal is development of the mother tongue, with simultaneous development of bilingualism, because the majority language is learned intensively through a separate subject. This model is aimed at non-dominant groups which want to develop their mother tongue. They have not been through a phase of language change and their language is not at risk. The theoretical framework is additive. The second model 4+4 can be positioned somewhere between the development and transitional models. Although the second cycle of the elementary education there is transition to the majority language, the motivation for the transition is not a gradual transition from the minority language to the majority language (Garcia, 2009, Skutnab Kangas 1991) but the insufficient number of students and a lack of teaching staff who would teach in the minority language. The third model, is the immersion model (Skutnab Kangas, 1991) or a weak model (Baker,

2001). The theoretical framework is subtractive, because a less valued language is replaces by a more valued one. This model does not support the preservation of the mother tongue nor development of bilingualism.

Research of the pedagogical aspect of Slovakian-Serbian bilingualism

This review paper aims to analyse how Slovakian-Serbian bilingualism influences the education process of children with Slovakian mother tongue. Research of pedagogical aspects of Slovakian-Serbian bilingualism in Vojvodina has been conducted in the past 20 years and based on these, we can conclude that the educational process of the children from minority groups there are certain particularities which do not appear in the education of the children who speak the majority language. These are:

1. The choice of the language medium of instruction

2. Change of the language medium of instruction

3. Adapting to the majority language medium of instruction

4. Learning the majority language medium of instruction

5. Development of intercultural competences

In the remainder, we will show research which have analysed these particularities and which can help us in determining how Slovakian-Serbian bilingualism influences the process of education of the Slovakian minority in Vojvodina.

1. The choice of the language as medium of instruction

In places where there are classes in Slovakian and Serbian languages, which is in the majority of locations with the Slovak population, the parents can opt for the medium of instruction of their child. This choice is particularly significant in elementary school, because of its duration and the fact that it is compulsory for all children. The question is on what grounds do parents choose the language of their child's education? Part of the answer to this vital question can be found in the research which was conducted among the 712 subjects in the region of Vojvodina Šimonji-Černak, Šukolová, Marković, in print). The subjects were adults who identify themselves as Slovak. The aim of the research was to establish the components and component values of attitudes towards education of Slovaks in their mother tongue as factors which influence the choice of language as medium of instruction. The research used a questionnaire especially designed for the purpose of the research, in the form of a five-point Likert scale. There were 20 items in total. The factorial analysis pinpointed the following groups of factors:

1. The role of school in preserving national identity

2. The possibility for education in Serbian and Slovakian schools

3. The quality of schools with Slovakian language as medium of instruction as opposed to schools in Serbian medium of instruction.

4. The role of school in preserving the Slovakian language.

The values of these components of he subjects' attitudes towards education in Slovakian language across the whole sample are shown in Table 1.

Table 1

Factorial scores across the whole sample of subjects

	f1 School-national identity	f2 Further education possibilities	f3 Quality of the school	f4 School-mother tongue
N	713	713	713	713
AS	2,34	1,78	2,43	1,60
SD	1,176	,929	,708	,799

The highest quality is assigned to the schools with Slovak medium of instruction (teaching staff, textbooks and resources), followed by significance of education in mother tongue for preserving national identity. On the lower side of the scale, there are the possibilities of further education in the language of majority which is provided by the education in their mother tongue, and the lowest value is the link between the education in mother tongue and preservation and retention of the mother tongue. We have to but notice that the scores are low overall, (maximum arithmetic mean is 5). Therefore, the attitude towards education of Slovaks in their mother tongue is revolving round a positive mark, the average.

We can say that the attitude is formed based on the two groups of factors and that they are involved in the decision making process of the parents and the choice of the language as medium of instruction for education in primary school.

1. Parents' perception of the of the role of education in Slovakian mother tongue and maintaining an preserving the development of the Slovakian language and Slovakian national identity.

2. Parents' perception of of the quality of schools with Slovakian as medium of instruction and possibilities for further education that they provide, manly secondary schools in the majority language.

The first factor can be observed as an intrinsic and second as extrinsic in firming up attitudes towards education in minority language, thus a factor in decision –making process of enrolling children into elementary schools (if the option is available). Parents opt for minority language as medium of instruction as they wish to preserve national identity of their ethnic community, as well as their mother tongue. Furthermore, the decision is made based on the position and quality of school in Slovakian medium of instruction compared to the ones with majority language as the medium of instruction.

2. Change of the medium of instruction and academic achievement of the students

Interest in the question of the correlation between bilingualism and academic achievement has emerged from practical problems of the teachers and parents of bilingual children. It has already been mentioned that parents of the children whose mother tongue isn't Serbian have the choice, when enrolling their children into elementary school, of the language they want as medium of instruction for their children's education in elementary schools. What interests the parents the most (and at the same time concerns them) are:

1. The correlation of bilingualism and academic achievement,
2. If learning in native language impairs learning the majority language
3. If the children are equal in command of the Serbian language in secondary school to other children, after completing elementary school in minority language.

In order to reach the right decision, which will have far-reaching consequences, parents must have valid information on all dilemmas and aforementioned questions.

There is also the matter of a practical nature, whether the change of the medium of instruction from Slovak to Serbian leads to a decline in academic achievements with the students. Šimonji-Černak (2009) has conducted a research with parallel groups of children of younger and older age. Experimental group of younger students were those who switched medium of instruction in the 5th grade from Slovak to Serbian, while the older age had two experimental groups. The first group was a group of the first graders of secondary school who completed elementary school in Slovak language and the other group od students completed their elementary education in Hungarian language. Both groups switched to another medium of inastruction upon enrolling secondary school. The control groups of both ages were students who did not changeSerbian language as the medium of instruction. Sample overview is shown in table 2.

Table 2

Sample characteristics

Age	Number of subjects	
	Experimental group	Control gorup
Younger	N= 41	N=75
Older	Ns=63	N=68
	Nm=48	

Instruments used in the research are as follows:

1. Test of communicative and a test of cognitive linguistic competence in Serbian (majority language), versions for younger and older age. Serbian in experimental groups is a new medium of instruction. Theoretical base for constructing the tests was distinction between two levels of linguistic competence, communicative and cognitive, as described by Cummins (Street & Hornberger, 2008).

2. A questionnaire on attitudes towards L1 and L2, versions for younger and older age, showing what kind of attitudes the students have towards their mother tongue, a minority language, and a second language, which is a majority language and vice versa, in the control group.

3. Raven's progressive matrices as non-verbal test of intelligence in the younger group

4. Domino test as non-verbal test of intelligence in the older age groups.

As far as data analysis is concerned, MANCOVA statistical methods were used with and without re-testing, as well as MANOVA. The most significant results are shown in Table 3

Table 3

Differences in academic achievements with experimental group and control group at younger and older age students after the changeof the medium of instruction

Age	Academic achievement (grade average) before the changeof the medium of instruction		Academic achievement (grade average) after the changeof the medium of instruction		Differences	Testing the significance of the differences t test or F test
	Eg	Cg	Eg	Cg		
younger	M=4,35	M=4,53	M=3,81	M=4,14	Eg= -0,537	t= 6,786
	SD=0,65	SD=0,65	SD=0,097	SD=0,96	Cg= -0,385	p≤ 0,01
					Eg - Cg=0,152	t= 6,471
						p≤ 0,01
						F= 2,026

						insignificant
older	Msl=4,16	M=4,138	Msl=3,563	M=3,506	Eg_{sl}= -0,596	p≤ 0,01
	SDsl=0,58	SD=0,58	SDsl=1,09	SD=1,26	Eg_{m}= -0,993	p≤ 0,01
	Mm=4,24		Mm=3,24		Cg= -0,632	p≤ 0,01
	SDm=0,75		SD=1,37		Eg_{sl}- Cg=	insignificant
					+0,036	p≤ 0,01
					Eg_{m}- Cg= 0,361	

Table 3 shows that there is a slight decline in academic achievement of al students in the 5th grade. The difference in academic achievement is 0.15 and is statistically insignificant. Therefore, the switching to the new medium of instruction which occurred in the control group has no influence over decline in academic achievement in the Slovakian students. In the older age group there were two experimental groups and one control group and all show a decline in academic achievement in the 1st grade of secondary school. The most visible decline is present in the group which switched form Hungarian to Serbian as a medium of instruction. As far as Slovakian students go, the decline in academic achievement is even lesser than with the control group which did not change the medium of instruction. To explain this phenomenon further, we will show the results of the the findings of the research on measuring communicative and cognitive linguistic competences of younger and older age students (Table 4) and relations between academic achievement and two levels of linguistic competence.

Table 4

Two levels of linguistic competence of younger and older/aged students (Göncz, 2007; Černak, 2005)

		AS Slovak	AS Serbian
younger age	Communicative competences	29,13	32,58*
	Cognitive competences	23,02	40,29*
older age	Communicative competences	13,57	17,14
	Cognitive competences	28,13	38,41

*statistically significant differences

Subjects who have changed their medium of instruction in 5th grade of elementary or 1st grade of secondary school have significantly lower linguistic competence as opposed to students who have not switched their medium of instruction. Also, this decline in linguistic competences of Slovakian students does not influence the academic achievement. However, according to the finding of this

research, the influence of cognitive linguistic competence during elementary school education is in decline and by the times students reach 8th (the final) grade, communicative and cognitive competences are no longer correlated. The influence of the cognitive linguistic competence in L2 over academic achievement, and starting 8th grade, it is this competence that is relevant pertaining to academic achievement. This finding is in line with theoretical framework of Cummins. With the increase of independence in learning from the context of the situation, and the increase of cognitive demand, so does the role of cognitive linguistic competence rise. If Slovakian students have, statistically speaking, significantly lower cognitive linguistic competence than Serbian students, this means there is its negative impact to academic achievement.

3. Adapting to majority (Serbian) language as a medium of instruction

Researching adapting to a new medium of instruction can provide some answers to a question whether Slovakian students who complete primary education in minority language, Slovakian, have an equal position of command of Serbian language as students who completed elementary school in Serbian. Adapting to Serbian as a medium of instruction in school was a subject of query for Šimonji-Černak (2011). The goal of the research was to identify problems of the students in adapting to new medium of instruction and methods of dealing with this problem by the teachers. A group of 83 students in the first and second grade of secondary school who completed their primary school in Slovakian, as well as 45 teachers who work with these students participated in the research. Two separate questionnaires were created for the purpose of the research for students and teachers. The questionnaire encompassed the following thematic areas: problems in adapting to Serbian language, methods of learning Serbian language in elementary school and influence of switching to a different medium of instruction on academic achievement in secondary school. The results have shown that students have the most problems with core subjects such as physics, chemistry, Serbian, mathematics and history. The problem reflects in the fact that the students are not familiar with the terminology in these subjects since they took them in Slovakian in their elementary schools. Vocational subjects which are taught in Serbian form the basics do not pose such a problem. The students also stated that oral examination poses a larger problem for them since they cannot express themselves verbally as quickly in Serbian as thy would in their mother tongue, but have to "translate" everything in their mind before answering. Both students and teachers have suggested increase in the weekly load of Serbian lessons in elementary schools because they deem that school does not prepare them well enough for the the change of medium of instruction in secondary schools. Beside that, teachers have notices a problem with output skills such as oral examination, poor vocabulary in Serbian as well as

fear and avoidance of oral examinations. Teachers have stated throughout the questionnaire that the adapting period to a new medium of instruction lasts for a year. This means that that the Slovak minority students need to overcome an additional setback beside the problem of adapting to a new school and a new environment. We can conclude (Černak, 2011, Černáková, 2014b) that elementary schools with Slovak as medium of instruction have to provide students with communicative equality in Serbian with the speakers of Serbian through well designed courses and and methodology of Serbian as L2. Otherwise, parents will choose schools with Serbian medium of instruction to avoid the process of adaptation and transition to a new language medium of instruction in secondary schools. It must be said that new curricula has been designed for Serbian L2 classes, with the primary goal of developing functional linguistic competences.

4. Learning a majority language

The Republic of Serbia caters for all level education in minority languages. In this case, the school is obliged to provide Serbian language classes as L2 classes. The classes of Serbian L2, according to the information available to the National Councils of National Minorities, are available in 88 elementary schools and 22 secondary schools (Krajišnik, Strižak, 2018). Moreover, in Vojvodina, which is an example of ethnically and linguistically diverse area, where Serbian is an official language and script, and there are also minority languages such as Hungarian, Slovakian, Croatian, Romanian, Ruthenian (Rusyn) and their official script (Halupka-Rešetar, Kovač Rac, 2019; Statute AP of Vojvodina, 2014).

When minority language is used as a medium of instruction, students are often less competent for oral and written communication in Serbian (Halupka-Rešetar, Kovač Rac, 2019), hence their equality of participation on everyday life and integrating into work life is sensitive. In the same way, exposure to majority language is a strong indicator of the command of that language but it also influences the attitudes towards the majority language. According to the official data, in the Autonomous province of Vojvodina, there are 45 municipalities in 39 towns and cities that have more languages in use, beside Serbian language, there are one or more minority languages used. (Jezici i pisma na teritoriji APVojvodine, 2019). Borbély (Borbély, 2000 according to Halupka-Rešetar, Kovač Rac, 2019) points out that the attitude national minorities have towards the majority language is mostly determined by the following demographic and social factors: the scale of language community, territorial allocation of its members (i.e. whether the settlements they live in are diffuse or compact), the ratio (in percentages) of different ethnic groups within a territory, as well as inter-marrying. The problem with learning Serbian as L2 can arise when students only have

contact with the second language inside the classroom, live in a homogenous community, and their mother tongue is not at all similar to Serbian.

Within the programme of subject Serbian L2 the outcomes as expected results and standards, as expected achievements are related to this subject which is taken by different ethnic minority groups with different mother tongues (which are similar to Serbian, but also structurally different), where some of them live in rather homogenous or rather heterogeneous (mixed) communities, with different degrees of command of the language. In the Republic of Serbia, there are educational standards   for the completion of the elementary education, secondary education and secondary vocational education. Achievement standards are divided into three-level achievement framework (elementary, intermediate or advanced). These levels of achievement in some segments coincide with the concept of different levels of achievement in other subjects, but the process of determining these levels of achievement have taken into account theoretical and practical knowledge of acquiring the a second language (Opši standardi / General Standards, 2017). What remains to be done is creating standards for other subjects and start implementing those as well.

Levels of achievement are based on learning competences that will allow students to successfully answer the challenges of the society, to use Serbian language in their daily lives, work or tertiary education, as well as in improving their participation in cultural, economic, political and other aspects of life. Standards of achievement within Serbian L2 are divided into three different spheres: language, literature and language and culture. Therefore, classes of Serbian L2 need to be adapted to what suits best foreign language methodology and teaching practice. Teachers need to be prepared to adapt their work, methodology style and and language content to the linguistic experience of their students and the type of language which their mother tongue belongs to (Krajišnik, Strižar, 2018). Although ethnic minorities have the right to education in their minority language, one of the goals of education in the Republic of Serbia includes comprehensive inclusion of students in to the education system. (The Law on the fundamentals of the education system, 2017) which entails command of the Serbian language and language use outside the classroom.

Students who take Serbian L2 already speak another language, their mother tongue, which can influence he learning of L2 in a positive or negative way. Therefore, the command of one's mother tongue should be activated during classes of Serbian L2 (Krajišnik, Strižar, 2018) and use the positive transfer while diminishing the negative transfer   (interference). In small homogeneous communities, students do not feel the need to learn Serbian. In their micro-surrounding, they feel quite secure and do not anticipate the need for L2 in advancement in any field in their future. On the other hand, those who live in a diffuse communities in Vojvodina have daily contact with Serbian as L2 and are, in many cases, bilingual.

5. Education in minority (Slovakian) language and development of interculturality

Education in the minority languages is one of the key factors of development of interculturality in countries which are heterogeneous in terms of language and culture. By interculturality, we denote mutual interaction of different cultures which entails mutual knowledge of the other's culture. We will present two items of research which dealt with textbook analysis in schools with Slovakian and Serbian as media of instruction. Theses provide us with an insight into possibilities offered by formal and institutionalized education for contact with other cultures. Beside that, we can see in what degree the students at school can develop intercultural sensitivity and intercultural competences as prerequisites for successful intercultural interaction.

The first research was conducted in 2015 (Šimoniová-Černáková, Beljanski, Marković, 2015) with the aim of determining in what degree the content of certain subjects in schools with Slovakian and Serbian language as media of instruction provide the meeting of minority and majority culture. Based on the goal, the following tasks were operationalised:

1. Analyse the depiction of the way of life of different ethnic groups through the knowledge that the the majority culture possesses of the minority cultures, as well as the knowledge that the minority groups have of the majority group.
2. Illustrate different topics which influence the formation of attitudes, values and behaviour towards society from the perspective of belonging to a particular group (language, religion, tradition, customs).
3. Analyse the elements of quotidian culture (food, clothes) and creative culture (visual arts, performing arts, literature, culture).

The method of content analysis was used in the research used. Contents of particular lessons frim the chosen subjects were analysed (mother tongue and literature, majority language as L2, the world around us, social and natural sciences, history, geography, music, arts, civic education), so it can be said that it is the analysis of the manifested contents. These particular subjects were chosen because researchers assumed that their content will suit the goal of the research and be able to provide an answer to the following question: Is interculturality nurtured in Serbia through the content of the core subjects in elementary schools?

The categories of the content analysis within this research were determined on the basis of formal and content criteria. The formal criteria pertain to frequency of topics connected to interculturality, developing interest in other cultures, ethnic and religious tolerance, i.e. what was attempted was to follow how often lesson topics occur which offer contact with other cultures. Content criteria pertain to the those which connect to other cultures though images, written pieces, food, clothes,

customs/holidays in textbooks and curricula. The sample for the research was taken from 40 textbooks in Serbian and 48 textbooks in Slovakian. The difference in numbers arises form the fact that In schools with Slovakian as medium of instruction, in each grade there is an additional subject of Serbian L2.

The results are not displayed as a table as not to overload the text, but are given descriptively, in ways of findings in terms of content analysis of the lessons and topics for given subjects. Within the language subjects there are far more opportunities for development interculturality when it comes to Slovakian, as many as 33, in comparison to Serbian reading textbooks with only 3 clear opportunities for the 1st to the 8th grade. The opportunities for contact of cultures in the literature textbooks used in teaching Serbian as L2 is also low, merely 8 of the suitable lessons appear. The literature textbooks of Serbian L2 contain some images which present an opportunity for developing interculturality, as opposed to the literature textbooks in Slovakian with only 6 of those images and none at all in the Serbian literature textbooks.

In the minority language literature textbooks, there are far more elements which allow children to meet with Serbian literature, such as translations of Serbian authors or their portraits. The whole subject, Serbian as L2 is dedicated to a different language and culture. The equivalent for schools with Serbian as medium of instruction would be to introduce Slovakian as L2, or another language of a minority, as the language of immediate environment. Slovakian textbooks for the subjects world around us, social and natural sciences are translations from Serbian. In comparison to the materials taught in Serbian-medium of instruction schools there are more elements that support intercultural learning, almost exclusively through contact with the majority nationalities, especially their history. Members of the majority can learn very little about the minority cultures. History textbooks i Slovakian for the 6th, 7th and 8th grades have additional materials dedicated to the Slovakian history, written by the Slovaks from Vojvodina. It could be stated that children in schools with Slovakian as medium of instruction (and the same is applicable to other minorities) have far greater opportunities for developing interculturality than children in school with Serbian as medium of instruction.

Authors of the music textbooks in all grades of elementary schools are Slovaks form Vojvodina. There is a noticeable disproportion of songs in Serbian, which are present in the music textbooks in Slovakian all in original language, rather than translations. Art textbooks are translations of their Serbian counterparts, with additional material of the Slovak art in Vojvodina. Authors are also Slovak people from Vojvodina. Textbooks contain works of art and architecture, particularly religious, as well as texts about Serbian artists and their portraits. In Serbian music textbooks there are various examples of traditional folk songs form the region as well as the rest of the Europe which

opens the possibility for contact with other cultures and different culture perspectives. Knowledge of het majority culture about the minority cultures is not present enough.

In the subject of civic education the textbooks are the same, and in Slovak-medium of instruction schools they have been translated from Serbian into Slovakian. In higher grades there are contents tightly linked to developing interculturality with children, whereas in lower grade there are virtually no such contents.

The second research on interculturality in school context was conducted in 2016 (Beljanski, Velišek-Braško, Šimonji-Černak, 2016). The aim of the research was to analyse the problem of interculturality in the lesson topics of the literature textbooks of mother tongues (Serbian, Hungarian and Slovakian) and to determine the opportunities for students to get in contact with other cultures through literature texts and translation in literature textbooks. The method of content analysis was used. The unit of analysis were lessons in the textbooks of three languages as media of instruction, while the categories of the content analysis were determined through possibility of contact with other cultures via original and folk poems, short stories and other forma of literature as well as national, regional, minority and world literature content. Categories of content analysis within this research were determined based on formal criteria in regard with presence or lack of occurrence.

The results show that the total number of texts in literature textbooks differ, where the most numerous ire those in Slovakian (614), followed by Serbian (422) and lastly, in Hungarian (391). The literature textbooks in each of the languages the most frequent content is the one of national character, which is in accordance to the aims of the subject and aims for mother tongue. Incidentally, we must note that Slovakian and Hungarian are minority languages, so the role of national content is more important in preserving national identity.

When it comes to translation of minority authors, most numerous example can be found in Serbian literature textbooks (19) and i two other languages, this number is the same (5). Translation of world authors are most often found i Slovakian textbooks (96), while Serbian and Hungarian textbooks have a similar occurrence (50). Since translations from Serbian were observed the regional content, we can compare Hungarian and Slovakian literature textbooks. We can see that there is a far greater number od translation Serbian authors in Slovakian textbooks (38) than in Hungarian (7). However, it is useful to keep in mind that there is a separate subject, namely Serbian as L2, witch provides ample opportunities for children to connect with Serbian language, culture and tradition. Similarly, we can observe that there are very few translations of minority authors, which means there are virtually no chances for children to get acquainted to other minorities who live in Vojvodina and Serbia.

In the end, we need to note that organising education in the language-medium of instruction of the minority and the possibility to learn the "language of the community" (the chance of the majority group to learn the language of the minority) represent a significant contribution to the interculturality, understanding and exercising human rights of the minority groups (Beljanski, Dedić Bukvić, 2020; Stanisavljević Petrović & Cvetković, 2011). In the same aspect, knowing and studying Slovakian language as a second language in the multinational community of Vojvodina represents a significant contribution to understanding and exercising human rights of the minorities (Makišova, 2010; Spevák & Šimoniová-Černáková, 2015).

Discussion

Upon inspecting the results of the described research of the population of Slovakian-Serbian bilingualism, we can notice that, as a variable, it has the most significant impact on the education of the autochthonous minorities. Namely, Slovakian children face challenges in education which the children of the majority group do not. We have summed them up in the following five categories:

1. Choice of the language medium of instruction, especially in primary school,
2. Change of the language medium of instruction, especially in secondary school,
3. Adaptation to the language medium of instruction of the majority,
4. Learning a second language (L2),
5. Development of interculturality of students i primary school.

These categories are not independent from one another, and their joint influence shapes the education of the Slovaks in Vojvodina. The first step is the choice of the language medium of instruction in elementary school. Parents are well aware of the link between language medium of instruction and development of national identity and preservation of mother tongue. This is one of the reasons why, in the majority of cases, they opt for their children to be schooled in their mother tongue. At the same time, they are aware that this means an additional subject (Serbian as L2) for their children, and that they will face the change of the medium of instruction in the secondary school. The choice of mother tongue as medium of instruction allows the children to realise their education within the framework of development model of education of national minorities, which is a strong model of bilingual education. Its goal is to nurture and develop the mother tongue and the majority language to the level of native speaker (or a close to it as possible). The hypothesis of the interrelatedness in the language development (Baker, 2001; Cummins, 2000; Göncz, 2007; Göncz, 2015) states that the developments of the first and the second language are closely connected. The degree of development of L1 represents a strong predictor for the degree of development of L2. In

other words, education in mother tongue will enable that language to develop fully, which in turn, enables the development of the second language. If the hypothesis of the interrelatedness of the languages is observed from the view point of medium of instruction, than we can say that medium of instruction equally provides for the development of that language as well as the second (in this case the majority) language (Göncz, 2007). This model also allows social and and economic integration of the members of the national minority into the society they are a part of. Furthermore, according to threshold theory (Baker, 1998; Cummins, 2000; García, 2005), the positive effects of bilingualism on cognitive development occur only when a certain level of bilingual competences is reached. Education of autochthonous minorities in their mother tongue while earning the language of the majority allows reaching the threshold of bilingual competences, which means that children form the autochthonous minority groups benefit in their cognitive development.

Education system should be proactive if it aims to encourage parents to choose Slovakian medium of instruction. The results of the research on the attitudes towards the Slovakian medium of instruction show two factors: intrinsic (preservation and development of national identity and mother tongue) and extrinsic (the quality of schools with Slovakian medium of instruction, quality of the teaching staff and possibilities for further education). The easiest and fastest way to achieve improvements is within the extrinsic factors, by investing more into equipping schools, and strengthening competences of the teaching staff. Improving the teaching practice of the majority languages taught as Serbian L2 is a vital factor. It is a duty and responsibility if each school allow students who take classes in the minority language as medium of instruction to achieve a high level of linguistic competences in the majority language. These are very important for further education and inclusion onto the professional realm. Inadequate language skills in L2 might prove adverse for enrolling students in the minority language medium of instruction schools, including those in Slovakian.

The influence of the change of the medium of instruction to academic achievement is one of the most significant issues in the education of autochthonous minority groups. The results of the research (Göncz i Otoranov, 2001; Šimonji-Černak, 2012; Šimoniová-Černáková, 2014a; Velišek, 1997) point to the fact that when two languages are structurally and genetically similar, as it is the case with Slovakia and Serbian languages, there is no negative influence of the change of the language of instruction to academic achievement. Academic achievement in the 5th grade of elementary school and the 1st grade of the secondary school is in decline as compared to previous grades, but this is not due to linguistic factors. In the case when two languages significantly differ, and do not belong to the same language groups, as is the case with Hungarian and Serbian, we can expect with a high

level of certainty that there will be a negative impact of the change of the medium of instruction to the a academic achievement in the 5th grade of elementaryy school and the 1st grade of the secondary school.\

The reasons for the negative impact of the change of the medium of instruction to academic achievement can be found in the inadequate language competences of the students, especially in the low level of cognitive linguistic competence in Serbian language which does not allow for adequate usage of the Serbian language in academic environment, as well as elements of subtractive bilingual situation in which the students find themselves after having switched to a new medium of instruction (Göncz, 2007; Šimonji-Černak, 2012; Šimoniová-Černáková, 2015; Šimonji-Černak & Bogosavljević, 2016) as well as inadequate or ill-adjusted methods of teaching (in regard to students' mother tongue) Serbian as L2 in elementary schools. Cognitive language competence has a growing influence on academic achievement as students advance in education while the influence of communicative language competence diminishes (Šimonji-Černak, 2012). This means that the less painful transition to a different medium of instruction we seek, the higher must be the level of the cognitive language competence in the majority language for students with minority mother tongue. Elements of subtractive linguistic situation can be found in the new environment for the students and new school, one of which is the fact the the minority language and culture are less valued and are substituted by a highly valued language. All this leads to decrease in the realisation of cognitive advantages that bilingualism can have as well as lowering if the academic efficiency of students (Göncz, 2007). The change of the environment of education for children can tip the scales in favour of the subtractive elements as opposed to additive elements of bilingualism which were previously dominant. Therefore, we should bear in mind that the relationship between the change of the medium of instruction and academic achievement is a complex one, and that there are different factors included. These include the similarity between the two languages, the change of school and possibility residence alongside the change of the medium of instruction, the environment of the new school (if it is linguistically homogenous or heterogeneous), the attitude if the teachers and peers towards the student as native speaker o f the minority language (Šimonji-Černak 2018).

Adapting to a new medium of instruction in secondary school is tightly linked to learning the majority language in elementary school and influences the change of the medium of instruction and academic achievement of the students. The formula for success is clear: quality instruction of Serbian language in elementary school leads to high linguistic competence in the secondary school, which makes transition to a new medium of instruction easier and prevents the negative influence of the change to a new medium of instruction on academic achievement. The accent in learning them

majority language should be on functional linguistic competence, oral production and development of students, with stress on elements of core subjects.

Based on the research conducted about the possibilities of developing interculturality with children who attend schools with minority language as medium of instruction (Slovakian, Hungarian) and in the majority language as medium of instruction, we can conclude that children in elementary schools with minority language as medium of instruction have more opportunities for developing intercultural competences and intercultural sensitivity. In their textbooks, which implies curricula as well, there are more compulsory topics which enable them to gain knowledge, positive attitudes and skills for interpreting sources and events form different cultures. A prominent position in this process belongs to Serbian as L2. On the other hand, we can conclude that the school practice of students with the majority language as medium of instruction there is little on offer about culture systems of the minority communities. Nonetheless, textbooks hat use Slovakian as the medium of instruction also offer little content on other minority groups living in Vojvodina. This implies that children in schools with Slovakian language as the medium of instruction have the highest chance of contact with the Serbian culture, which is hardly enough for forming a broader picture about the multicultural and multilingual society in which they live. From this, it can be assumed that the children who attend schools with Slovakian language as medium of instruction have slightly higher developed intercultural competences compared to the children who attend schools with Serbian language as medium of instruction, and their level of intercultural sensitivity moves towards ethnorelativism.

Conclusion

We can conclude that the Slovaks who live in Vojvodina (Northern part of Serbia) represent an autochthonous national minority. By default, they become bilingual, acquiring Slovakian within tier nuclear family and gradually through informal and formal education acquire the language of the majority, which is Serbian. Their bilingualism can be defined in the terms of dimensions of bilingualism (Baker, 2001; Hamers & Blanc, 2000; Rabanes & Velez, 2016) as almost balanced, more often coordinated, early (simultaneous and successive), with prevalent additive elements and monoclutural. The country of their residence has a several decades long positive practice of enabling the education process i n the language of minorities. There are three different models of education available to the Slovaks: developmental model, 4+4 model (transitive) and immersion model. The most favourable one is the developmental model in which the medium of instruction is mother tongue with the majority language as L2, starting from the kindergarten to secondary school. It

enables the preservation of mother tongue, which, being a minority language, would have little chance of preservation without the support of formal and institutionalised education, especially its literary form and in terms of children's literacy. The second language is added tit the first language, which contributes to creating a specific bilingual situation with prevailing additive elements.

Therefore, Slovak-Serbian bilingualism has the role of independent variable in education of children with Slovakian mother tongue. Parents often find themselves in the situation of choosing the medium of instruction for their children. This decision is particularly important prior to enrolling primary school. The question is whether the parents are acquainted well enough with the advantages of mother tongue as the medium of instruction, with empirical facts, or reach the decision intuitively, based on their personal experience? Nonetheless, Slovakian children most often attend school with their mother tongue as the medium of instruction and exercise their right to education in their mother tongue. Recently, the number of children in school with Slovakian as the medium of instruction is in decline, but it is difficult to separate the influence of at least important factors: birth rate, economic migrations (mostly to their homeland Slovakia) and negative perception of Slovakian as the medium of instruction. Based on the findings of research we can note that the change of the medium of instruction has no significant influence over the academic achievement, which is encouraging. There are certain difficulties in adjusting to the majority language as medium of instruction in secondary school. Adapting to new language can last as longa s a year, but has no significant consequences on the academic achievement. One of the reasons for this can surely be the structural and genetic similarity of Serbian and Slovakian languages, therefore the Slovaks learn Serbian with relative ease (compared to, for example Hungarian minority in Vojvodina). Naturally, there is some danger of strong language interference, due to the similarity in these two languages. The development of intercultural competence and intercultural sensitivity represents an immense   benefit brought about by bilingualism and education in one's mother tongue. In this way, members of the Slovakian national minority become potential creators of intercultural society

References

Baker, C. (1998). *Key Issues in Bilingualism and Bilingual Education*. Clevedon, Avon: Multilingual Matters.

Baker, C. (2001). *Foundations of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*. Clevedon: Multilingual Matters.

Beljanski, M., & Dedić Bukvić, E. (in press). *Komparativni prikaz zastupljenosti interkulturalnog obrazovanja kod budućih učitelja u Srbiji i Bosni i Hercegovini*.

Beljanski, M., Velišek-Braško O., & Šimonji-Černak, R. (2016). Čitanka u osnovnoj školi u funkciji razvoja interkulturalnosti. In D. Radović & E. Toldi (Eds.), *Interkulturalnost u obrazovanju*, *zbornik broj 10*, (pp. 35- 51). Novi Sad: Pedagoški zavod Vojvodine.

Cummins, J. (2000). *Language, Power and Pedagogy.* Clevedon: Multilingual Matters.

García, O. (2005). Minority language Education. In K. Brown (ed.), *Encyclopaedia of Language and Linguistics*, *vol. 8*. Oxford: Elsevier.

García, O. (2009). *Bilingual Education in the 21st Century: a Global Perspective*. Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell.

Gilbert, J. & Castelino, J. (2003). Self-Determination, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities. *Macquarie Law Journal*, 3, 155-178.

Göncz, L. & Otoranov, B. (2001). Jedna provera subtraktivne dvojezične situacije na obrazovnu efikasnost učenika. *Pedagoška stvarnost*, 7-8, 571-583.

Göncz, L. (2007). Novija istraživanja pedagoško-psiholoških aspekata dvojezičnosti u Vojvodini. Posledice promene nastavnog jezika na školsko postignuće i moguća objašnjenja. In J. Szalma, (Eds.), *Jezik, obrazovanje, nauka, kultura, zaštita ljudskih i manjinskih prava u Vojvodini i zemljama u tranziciji. Zbornik radova VANU* (pp. 109–127), Novi Sad: Vojvođanska akademija nauka i umetnosti.

Halupka-Rešetar, S., & Kovač Rac, E. (2019). Srpski jezik iz manjinske perspektive. Novi Sad: *Zbornik Matice srpske za filologiju i lingvistiku*. *LXII*/2. 157-171.

Horvat Vuković, A. (2010). Autohtone nacionalne manjine i ustavne promjene 2009-2010. *Zbornik PFZ*, *60*(2), 555-585.

Jezici i pisma u službenoj upotrebi u statutima gradova i opština na teritoriji AP Vojvodine (2019). Pokrajinski sekretarijat za obrazovanje, propise, upravu za nacionalne manjine. Dostupno na: http://www.puma.vojvodina.gov.rs/mapa.php 0.

Krajišnik, V., & Strižak, N. (2018). Srpski kao strani i srpski kao nematernji jezik–sličnosti i razlike.

In Lj. Bajić, J. Ginić, & N. Stanković-Šošo (Eds.), *Aktuelni teorijsko-metodološki problemi proučavanja i nastave slovenskih jezika, nastave i kulture*. Beograd: Filozofski fakultet.

Makišova, A. (2010). Slovački jezik kao maternji i nematernji u sferi visokog obrazovanja. In E.Toldi (Ed.), *Jezici otvaraju vrata različitih kultura* (pp. 23-29). Novi Sad: Pedagoški zavod Vojvodine..

Pravilnik o opštim standardima postignuća za kraj osnovnog obrazovanja za strani jezik (2017). Službeni glasnik Republike Srbije 78/2017.

Pravilnik o opštim standardima postignuća za predmet Srpski kao nematernji jezik za kraj prvog i drugog ciklusa obaveznog obrazovanja, opšteg srednjeg obrazovanja i osnovnog obrazovanja odraslih (2017). *Službeni glasnik Republike Srbije* 55/2017.

Rabanes, D. S, & Velez, T. (2016). *Multiple Dimensions of Bilingualism*. Reykjavík: Bóksala Menntavísindasviðs.

Raduški, N. (2009.) Iskustva razvijenih evropskih zemalja u rešavanju pitanja nacionalnih manjina. *Sociologija*, *LI*, 1, 65-82.

Šimoniová-Černáková, R. (2009): Specifičnosti obrazovanja dvojezične dece, *Pedagogija* 4, 559-568.

Šimoniová-Černáková, R. (2013). *Dvojjazyčnosť a jej pedagogické aspekty*. Báčsky Petrovec: Slovenské vydavateľské centrum.

Šimoniová-Černáková, R. (2014b). Dvojjazyčnosť a vzdelávanie v menšinovej situácii. In A., Tomanová-Makanová (Ed.), *Slováci a Srbi- história a súčasnosť. Slovaci i Srbi- istorija i sadašnjost*, (pp. 321- 333). Nový Sad: Národnostná rada slovenskej národnostnej menšiny v Srbsku.

Šimoniová-Černáková, R. (2015). Education of Slovaks in Vojvodina: Types of Bilingualism and Educational Models. In S. Karikova (Ed.), *Acta Universitatis Matthaei Belii*, (pp. 178- 195). Banská Bystrica: Pedagogická fakulta Univerzity Mateja Bela.

Šimoniová-Černáková, R. (2019). Slovensko-srbské dvojjazyčné osoby=dve osobnosti? In M. Šimáková Speváková (Ed.), *Slovenské písomníctvo v kontexte*, (pp. 37-51). Novi Sad: Filozofski fakultet**.**

Šimoniová-Černáková, R., Beljanski, M., & Marković, S. (2015). Vzdelávanie Slovákov ako faktor vývinu interkulturality vo Vojvodine. In Š. Porubský, & Z. Lynch (Eds.), *Medzinárodná vedecká konferencia Kurikulárna reforma a perspektívy základnej školy*, (pp. 146- 157). Banská Bystrica: Pedagogická fakulta Univerzity Mateja Bela.

Šimonji-Černak, R (2012). *Dvojezičnost i obrazovanje*. Beograd: Zadužbina Andrejević.

Šimonji-Černak, R. (2011). Adaptacija na drugi nastavni jezik u srednjoj školi sa aspekta učenika i nastavnika. *Primenjena lingvistika 12*, 100-111.

Šimonji-Černak, R. (2014a). Stavovi adolescenata prema svom i drugom jeziku. In M., Franceško (Ed.), *Vrednosne orijentacije mladih u Vojvodini*: stanje i perspektive (pp. 104- 120). Novi Sad: fakultet za pravne i poslovne studije dr Lazar Vrkatić.

Šimonji-Černak, R. (2018). Education in minority languages. In N. Tataković, F. Šuran & M. Diković (Eds.), *Reaching Horizons in Contemporary Education*, (pp. 153-177). Pula: Faculty of Educational Sciences.

Šimonji-Černak, R., & Bogosavljević, R. (2016). The teaching language as an educational-psychological factor of bilingualism: integration without assimilation. In D. Petrović, & M. Antolović (Eds.), *Education and the Social Challenges at the Begininning od the 21st Century*, (pp. 74- 90). Sombor: Faculty of Education.

Šimonji-Černak, R., Marković, S. & Šukolová, D. (in press). (2022). *Stavovi prema obrazovanju na maternjem jeziku: primer Slovaka u Srbiji.*

Skutnabb-Kangas, T. (1991). *Bilingvizam*. Beograd: Zavod za udžbenike i nastavna sredstva.

Spevák, Z., & Šimoniová-Černáková, R. (2015). Interkulturálnosť vo vzdelávaní a jej premeny- prípad autonómnej oblasti Vojvodina. In J. Danek, & M. Droščák (Eds.): *Pedagogica actualis VII.*, (pp. 355- 361). Trnava: Univerzita sv. Cyrila a Metoda, Filozofická fakulta

Stanisavljević Petrović, Z., & Cvetković, M. (2011): Dimenzije razvoja multikulturalnosti u školskoj sredini. *Teme*, *XXXV, 4*, 1407-1420.

Stanovništvo prema nacionalnoj pripadnosti, starosti i polu (2011). Republički zavod za statistiku Beograd:https://data.stat.gov.rs/Home/Result/3102010403?languageCode=sr-Latn& displayMode=table. Posećeno dana: 25.2.2020.

Statut AP Vojvodine (2014). Statute Autonomous Province of Vojvodina: (https://www.skupstinavojvodine.gov.rs/fajlovi/file/Statut/Statut%20AP%20Vojvodine.pdf).

Street, B. & Hornberger, N. H. (Eds.). (2008). *Encyclopaedia of Language and Education, 2nd Edition, Volume 2: Literacy.* (pp. 71-83). New York: Springer Science + Business Media LLC.

Velišek, G. (1997). Promena nastavnog jezika i školsko postignuće. *Deseti kongres psihologa Jugoslavije. Knjiga rezimea*, p. 82. Beograd: Savez društava psihologa Jugoslavije.

Zakon o osnovama sistema vaspitanja i obrazovanja (2017). *Official Gazette of the Republic of Srbia* 88/2017.

Roland Shavadze

Shota Rustaveli Batumi State University, Georgia

Linguistic Peculiarities of Bullying in Georgian and American School Discourse

ABSTRACT

Many scholars have investigated bullying as a social problem in educational institutions. However, just a few scientific works are available attempting to offer the analysis of the linguistic peculiarities related to bullying in school discourse. Since bullying is a violative act expressed verbally or physically to intimidate members of particular society, it is important to consider the linguistic features directly related to the language used by aggressors to harm victims. Consequently, in the present paper, we will explore certain verbal register (words, phrases, linguistic patterns, etc.) generally used by aggressors to insult, threaten or harm victims.

Keywords: *bullying, aggressors, victims, school discourse.*

Introduction

Although, number of preventive decisions have been made in education system to ensure a safe learning environment at schools, physical and psychological violence still remains among the unsolved problems in the general education system. For example, bullying is still a problem in schools. Some students are often victims of negative influences from their peers or other members of school community. Forms of bullying vary according to students' age and background. Victims of Bullying can be both - male and female. Consequently, any child can become either an initiator of aggression or a victim.

Bullying as a social phenomenon is also characteristic in organizational contexts too. In all the contexts, including educational institutions, the purpose of bullying is to intimidate and subordinate individuals. As mentioned, any person can become the object of bullying. However, those individuals who are somehow different from dominant groups, are at greater

risk of bullying. The risk group may also include individuals with difficulties in communication and poorly developed social skills. At the same time, those ones who belong to religious or ethnic minorities.

In scientific literature, bullying refers to the physical and psychological aggression to intimidate individuals. Originally it was a concept of everyday life but over time it became the object of research in sociology, psychology and pedagogy. Scandinavian scientists were the first ones who expressed interest in this problem (Heinemann, 1973; Olweus, 1973; Pikas, 1989). Strong social interest in bullying first appeared in Sweden in the 1970s. The Swedish physicist Heinemann (1973) used the term "mobbing" in the context of racial discrimination. He borrowed this term from the work of famous Austrian ethologist Konrad Lorenz. Lawrence used mobbing to express the facts of attacking a group of animals to other different species. As for Heinemann (1973), he uses the term "mobbing" to describe an attack of one group of people to other groups. The scientific research of bullying was first done by the Swedish scholar Dan Olveus. Olveus uses the term "bullying" in many of his works (Olweus, 1973, 1978), describing one or more people attacking other people. As he states, vulnerable students are bullied by one or more individuals for a long time. So, aggressive or negative actions cause harm to the victims (Olweus, 1973).

Research Methodology

The following research includes the quantitative and qualitative methods of data collection. The survey was used to get the whole picture of the problem and the final analyses was done on the basis of individual and group interviews and focus groups. More specifically, we interviewed 9th Grade students, teachers and school masters at Gallatin High School in Montana, the USA and N15 Public school in Batumi, Adjara region, Georgia. Comparative analysis was based on the data gathered from the participants of both schools.

Results and Discussion

In order to analyze verbally expressed bullying as a threatening phenomenon, it is essential to study its linguistic features, i.e. to find contextual and linguistic markers of bullying. This

allows to identify the author's intention. Since verbal expression of bullying is a verbal act between individuals, the verbal nature of aggression cannot be defined without a context. The context defines language as a socio-semantic system that reflects the beliefs and values of individuals in a particular environment. Accordingly, this paper explores various examples of verbal bullying (words, phrases and sentences of intimidation); offers linguistic analysis of the forms of verbal bullying which are typical expression in general education institutions in Georgia and the United States. In particular, the paper presents the linguistic techniques used by the aggressors to realize their intentions towards victims.

For comparative analysis, the research was conducted at Batumi N15 Public School and at Gallatin High School in Montana, the United States. The participants were Georgian and American students aged 13-15 from both Georgian and American schools. Additionally, teachers and school principals were interviewed from both schools to illustrate a problem in a batter way.

As the research shows, victim can be anyone with differences from the norms existing in a particular society. In Georgian cases, as the research participants state, aggressors use insulting and derogatory words to people who are physically different from others:

Georgian Student: ”…overweight girls are often addressed by boys: რას გავხარ, ძროხა! (You look like a cow!). As for overweight boys, they are insulted by the words like ღორივით ხარ ჩასუქებული (you are as fat as a pig!). Brunette girls or boys are often called ზანგი (Negro). And unattractive girls or boys are addressed by a word მახინჯი (ugly) … "

Similar to Georgian reality, some of the provocative factors of bullying in American schools are physical differences such as skin color, weight, height, etc.

American Student: "…Actually, I do not remember many words, but there are cases when black students are called Negroes. And as for overweight students, aggressors call them fatty, lump, tub, porker, fatso. I think that's all I can say about…"

Based on the answers of Georgian and American students participating in the interview, in Georgian context, individuals are humiliated by aggressors with various metaphors and comparisons due to their excessive weight. In particular, a victim is compared to an animal

which is perceived as degrading meaning by the addressee. The above-mentioned words, in addition to their derivative meanings, have negative connotative meanings in the youths subculture. They are perceived to have insulting attitude toward victims. As for the existing slangs used to overweight students in the American context, they do not contain comparisons of humans to animals. However, each slang is associated with an excess of something. For example: **fatso -**offensive meaning: a fat person– by Merriam Webster; **lump-** a person who is heavy and awkward - by Merriam Webster; **tub –** a fat person - by Merriam Webster.

In a Georgian school where the participants were interviewed   there were no black students. However, degrading slang: ზანგი (Negro) is often used to insult brunette students. It is important to note that the Georgians do not perceive this slang as painful as American students (because of few cases of racism in history of Georgia). On the other hand, for African-American students   the same slang word **"Negro"** has a dramatically negative and offensive connotation.

Due to lower social status, some students do not often receive respect and recognition from others. Low financial opportunities of families often affect the quality of their children's clothing. Some families cannot afford to buy trendy cloths for their children. Thess

categories of students are often bullied by their peers through calling nicknames or other insulting words.

Principal of Georgian Public School**:** "*…honestly, I have thought about the reason of bullying a lot. One of them is socially vulnerable category of students. Because of their social conditions, they might not wear fashionable or trendy cloths, so that they become victims of bullying from their peers..."*

After the collapse of the Soviet system, school uniforms are no longer mandatory in Georgian secondary schools. It should be noted that students' clothing style as a visual category of physical difference   often becomes the reason for bullying. In particular,   victims of bullying are individuals of both sexes who, (due to their social status), cannot wear trendy clothes   compared to their peers.

 Georgian student**:** *"…I think, students can be dressed in a way they want to. As I know in the past, all the students wore uniforms at school, but we do not have this requirement today*

and that is why, we all go to school dressed differently. However, as a result, children often insult each other. For example, my classmates often call others names like „ბომჟი" (vagrant) or ციგანი "gypsy" because of they way they dress."

As the research shows, students' dressing-style is one of the provocative factors of bullying in Georgian context. The Russian acronym **БОМЖ** (без предделенного место катольства) is used to address a homeless person distinguished from others by wearing dirty clothes and seeking food in litter bin. The meaning of the word **БОМЖ** has been expanded in the youth subculture. It is used as a slang to mock a student with the motive of bullying. The word -ციგანი (insulting word for gypsy) is also a discriminatory term against the gypsy community. The negative connotation of the word ციგანი refers to some gypsy children wearing dirty clothes and begging in the streets. Therefore, addressing word ციგანი to a person causes negative feelings. Additionally, the victims of bullying in Georgian schools are those students who wear different style of clothing (extravagant, trendy, etc.) to attract the attention of others.

Georgian student*: "...those girls who dress extravagantly are often insulted by boys calling them **bitches** or ironically, აუ რა მაგარი ნაშაა" (what a cool **bit of skirt she is**).*

Conditioned by a big influence of the English language, bullers at Georgian schools frequently use barbarisms towards victims. For example, the slang word "bitch" and "Nasha" (meaning a prostitute woman) are the examples used by Georgian students.

The use of *irony* is one of the linguistic means while expressing bullying verbally. The realization of intended *irony* depends on the presupposition of context. Presupposition plays a big role in perceiving and decoding the irony. In order to achieve intention and make a certain impact on the listeners, aggressor expresses his thoughts through ironic vocabulary.

It is important to note that bullying based on dressing style is not only in Georgian context, but it also occurs in American reality:

American Student: *"...There is no bullying on a boys' appearances or clothing style. Honestly, students do not insult each other because of their choices or taste of the clothes they wear. However, I have heard words like* **whore, slut, hoe** *towards girls who dress up attractively..."*

As research the shows, American students think that clothing style is not provocative factor

of bullying. However, bullying occurs in some cases when girls dress extravagantly. There are facts when attractively dressed girls are addressed with the words: **whore** (a person who engages in sexual intercourse for pay-by Merriam Webster), **slut** (someone who has many sexual partners —usually used of a woman - by Merriam Webster), **hoe** (generally a woman, who is promiscuous- by Merriam Webster). These words are slangs with the negative connotation meaning an immoral woman. Consequently, calling girls these slang words by the aggressors serves to humiliate the victims.

In the paper we looked at the role of socialization in shaping values while developing a child as a person. In these processes an individual develops the habits and shares social norms existing in a particular society. Therefore, he/she gains knowledge, values and norms that are characteristic for a particular society. The complexity of norms and beliefs in a society determine the gender roles perceived by individuals. In this regard, it is important to analyze the context in which men and women are assigned different roles.

Gender role in any society is defined by socio-cultural norms and implies behaviors of a man and a woman in different cultures. It is important to mention that, perception of gender roles in the society is one of the major reasons of school bullying. Gender-based bullying refers to violence against a person with a different appearance and manners than expected by a particular society. Disobedience to the dogmatic frameworks imposed by society becomes the cause of aggression.

Georgian student:	*„... we are 28 students in our group, among us are those who often oppress others. Mostly boys physically abuse other boys who study well or do not go out to smoke with them. Also aggressors bully those boys who have friendly relationship with girls. They also oppress physically weak boys who do not have masculine behavior. Such students are called "gay" or „ცისფერი" (insulting slang for a gay).*

American student: *"... the most common words I would say are* **fag** *or* **faggor** *used for the LGBTQ people, mostly to insult them…"*

In this particular situation, it is interesting to compare the slangs in Georgian and English contexts. For example, in the American context, the word "gay" does not have an abusive

connotation if used for a person who considers himself as a member of this community. However, if a person is a member of a society of traditional sexual orientation, naturally, he will not have acceptance of the word "gay". Despite a person's sexual orientation, the words **fag** and **faggot** (a gay person — used as a term of abuse and disparagement - by Merriam Webster) are considered derogatory. As for the slang used in the Georgian context, ,,ცისფერი", is used to humiliate homosexuals and people with gender-inappropriate appearance in a society.

Expressing the respect for different views/beliefs is a core priority of modern education systems. Georgian law supports students to express their thoughts freely and, on the other side, obligates all members of school community to respect the opinions of others: *"... the student has the right to express his / her opinion and demand its respect ..."* (Georgian Law on General Education, article 1330).

 Although acceptance of different opinions in the social formation of modern human being is one of the main goals of teaching. The existence of different opinions still remains the reason of bullying among students. This problem has been confirmed by the principal of Georgian school participating in the interview: *"... Students with different opinions may be more often victims of bullying than students with physical disabilities. In my opinion, today's generation has much more acceptance towards disable students but not with those who have critical and different opinions..."*

Georgian Student *"... generally, when a teacher asks questions to students, most frequently only the same students give answers. Their answers are sometimes incorrect or illogical, but   no one insults them for that. On the other side, some students are constantly silent. If they answer teacher's questions and have a wrong answer, or express different opinions, others will often make remarks to them, such as: **ხისთავა** (woodenheaded), **დებილი** (stupid), **სულელი** (fool), idiot, etc."*

All the above-mentioned slangs are perceived abusive by individuals who are victims of bullying. The words: **ხისთავა** *(woodenheaded),* **დებილი** *(stupid),* **სულელი** *(fool),* იდიოტი *(idiot)* are associated with mental retardation.

American student*: ,,...Respect for different opinions is essential, however, students who have*

different opinions or views on a particular issue are called: **nerd, retard, dope, doofus, poser...** "

In Georgian and American school contexts, the words discussed above have the negative connotation used towards students with different opinions. For example, the English word **nerd** is a slang used for an intelligent but highly asocial person. The word **retard** in its derivative sense means delay. However, in bullying, the word has derogatory content meaning   intellectual disability.   The main meaning of the English word **dope** is illicit drug (marijuana or heroin), although in abusive context the meaning of the word is different and means a *stupid* or *irritating* person. The literary meaning of the slang word **doofus** is a incompetent person. **Poser** - as a slang is used to humiliate people who behave differently from others to gain attention from people.

As the studies have shown, despite existing legislation and various preventive activities, bullying remains one of the unresolved problems at schools.   Identification and solution of its reasons require in-depth analysis of bullying as a phenomenon considers not only raising awareness about bullying, but also its linguistic analysis. That also means how lexical items are formulated and used by school community in school contents.

General Conclusions

Based on the research conducted, the following can be concluded: bullying in educational discourse is not an individual but a social phenomenon. It is widespread in everyday communication. Expressing bullying in both Georgian and English-languages is characterized by the use of insulting words and phrases. Such expressions have the greatest number of scabrous words, barbarisms, irony, metaphors, acronyms, slangs, etc.   In contrast to the American context, abnormal vocabulary (dysphemisms) is much more commonly used in Georgian school discourse. In fact, the usage of slangs is mainly featured in both languages. In both analytical languages, bullying is characterized by the following linguistic features: offensive and derogatory words to harm a victim.

References

Bloome, D. & Beauchemin, F. (2016). *Languaging Everyday Life in Classrooms.* SAGE Journals.

Heinemann, W. (1973). *Agressive Bevaviours in Human relations .* European Journal of Social
Psychology.

Olweus, D. (1999). Bullying in Norway. In P.K. Smith, Y. Morita, J. Junger-Tas, D.

Olweus, R. Catalano, & P. Slee (Eds), The Nature of School Bullying: A cross-national.

Pikas, A. (1989). *A Pure Concept of Mobbing Gives the Best Results for Treatment.* American
Psychological Association.

Dominique Savio Nsengiyumva

Makerere University, Uganda

A Psycholinguistic Study of Codeswitching: Data from Burundian Multilingual Adult Speakers

ABSTRACT

Codeswitching (CS) is an unavoidable linguistic phenomenon amongst multilingual speakers. Whereas CS has mainly been studied in a sociolinguistic and structural perspective, this article has studied this phenomenon in a psycholinguistic perspective based on the tenets of Competition Model (MacWhinney, B., 1982, 1987). The aim of the study was to analyse how patterns of codeswitching can illustrate the level of language competence among adult speakers. Participants were Burundian educated adult multilingual speakers using both Kirundi (L1), French (chronological L2) and English as languages learned in the multilingual education system of Burundi. Some of the speakers could use Swahili, a language learned outside the formal education (Swahili was not in formal education during the schooling time of the participants in this study). Data was collected through a semi structured interview which was recorded (45minutes for each interview) and later transcribed for analysis. This study was designed as a unilingual mode of language production. The results show that less competent speakers either produced a great amount of 'intruders' into the language being used (English) and the lowest level of competence was marked by a shift of mode i.e. a complete change of code being used. None of the participants has been able to keep the unilingual/monolingual mode that they were required to operate in. What has been termed as 'fluent' codeswitching in natural language production designs is seen as a sign of incapability to keep the mode, therefore a sign of only middle level of language competence as far as the use of the known languages is concerned. Generally, in this study, we argue that codeswitching patterns among more competent speakers are built on single words or short phrases from a different language, middle language competence codeswitches were based on a navigation into different languages whereas lower competence was based on a complete shift of language (code) whereby the speakers changed the language they were supposed to use to a different language.

Keywords: codeswitching, adult multilingual speakers, psycholinguistic study, language competence, multilingual education

1. Introduction

The psycholinguistic perspective of codeswitching posits two possibilities of codeswitching namely the possibility for changes in languages known by the speaker which arise due to the unintended activation of the non-target language, which forces the speaker to switch languages to maintain fluidity in the conversation and the possibility whereby speakers may have a strong desire to switch languages. This means that when the speaker is required to use one language alone, the speaker adopts strategies to actively suppressing other languages to enable fluent speech in the language s/he is required to speak since speech planning involves parallel activation of the languages known by bi/multilingual speakers (Green, 2018). The fact of having parallel activation of the languages known by speakers creates many candidates for competition to be produced and leads to opportunities for cross-linguistic transfer.

The tendency for speakers to constantly codeswitch may reveal the results of a competition process between active items of both languages. In this case codeswitching can be seen as the manifestation of the most active and most easily retrieved items (Green and Wei, 2014) in any of the known languages. The multilingual speakers will therefore use either words and/or structures that win the competition among these competing active language items from any of their known languages. The types of language pattern will depend on how speakers manage the activation of their languages and the control demands of their interactional context (Green and Abutalebi, 2013; Green and Wei, 2014; Beatty-Martínez et al., 2020) towards the competing candidates in both languages.

In the case of this study, speakers (participants in the study) where required to speak only one language but they knew at least three languages. In a psycholinguistic viewpoint of this case, codeswitching is understood as a process which is unintentional in some cases or speakers have no other choice than codeswitching to fill the gap of missing language, whereby the speaker was forced to codeswitch because s/he needed to enable fluent speech in the language s/he was expected to use which was English in this case.

The codeswitches produced in the data are of different types and these different types of codeswitches have been produced by different groups of speakers which leads to predicting which types of codeswitches produced at which level of competence.

From literature, these different types of codeswitches may include the use of words, phrases, or short utterances from different languages known by the participants. This can be looked at as an indication of the competition between languages known by the speakers. In this section, this is

illustrated by a number of examples of utterances produced by the participants as multilingual speakers. These illustrations show the forms of codeswitches known as word form; phrase forms and sentence form. Since the speakers were required to only use English as the language of communication during the interview it can be said that speakers did not produce them consciously. These words/phrases/short sentences just came in the English language that speakers were using.

Moreover, the only way to give account of the representations and processes involved in bilingual language production was to highlight the surface manifestations of codeswitches found in the language produced by the multilingual speakers. For this reason, the systematic observation of the CS patterns in the language produced has been illustrated as reflecting as discussed by Karousou-Fokas and Garman (2001, 41) ''the planning units and processes involved in bilingual language production.''. Codeswitching occurrences were therefore discussed the way they were produced by the speakers both as single word, phrases, and longer stretches of utterances.

Another aspect which is worth mentioning is the unit of analysis of codeswitchng considered in this work. The unit of analysis is based on Karousou-Fokas and Garman (2001, 44) definition of a Textual Unit as they defined it as ''one speaker's verbal contribution up to the point where another speaker takes over or there is a significant pause followed by a change in topic''. In this study, this textual unit has been taken as synonymous to the unit referred to as "utterance" (e.g., Hatzidaki, 1994). This has been considered because the data analysed is from a spoken language whereby the participants had to produce language by answering a set of questions in an interview and not in a form of natural conversations. Units of analysis found in literature, like sentence was avoided because this has more formal and structural aspects which led it to be used mostly in written language which is more organised. Though this unit of analysis constitutes the level considered for this study, organization of linguistic patterns that include clauses, phrases, or single-words were considered as being part of the stretch of unit that constituted the analysis.

2. Literature

For years, many linguistic phenomena have been studied in the field of language contact since the work of Weinreich (1953). The study of these phenomena includes different models to approach them. One of these phenomena which has been explored since years is interference (posited by behaviourists) which evolved to be studied as language transfer. The study of language transfer as a language contact manifestation (especially with the study of L3 acquisition, comprehension and production) has been referred to as Crosslinguistic transfer. Today a number of scholars have adopted another terminology to mean crosslinguist transfer i.e. Crosslinguistic influence. One of the

phenomenon involved in Crosslinguistic transfer as a manifestation of language contact is codeswitching (CS). This phenomenon has itself been studies since years with the earlier works of Pfaff (1979). Different perspectives have been taken to address the issue of CS. These perspectives are structural linguistic perspective including types of codeswitches (Mari, 2005), an examination for structural constraints able to account for different ways in which known languages can be combined (Poplack, 1980), the use of different language pairs and others, a sociolinguistic perspective (Gumperz, 1976; Almelhi, 2020; Yahiaoui et. al., 2021; Gardner-Chloros, 2020) and a psycholinguistic perspective. Most of the studies in literature have focussed on CS as a sociolinguistic phenomenon exploring its different aspects including attitude and motivation for codeswitching. Some scholars have analysed CS taking the two first approaches but not so many have shown great interest in scrutinizing this phenomenon through psycholinguistic lenses. However, the literature has a number of studies which have explored CS in a psycholinguistic perspective such as (Myers-Scotton, 1991; 1992; Milroy, 1995; Gardner-Chloros, 2009; Kootstra, 2015) and others.

Those works which explored CS in a psycholinguistic perspective have focussed mainly on looking at aspects such as Activation or Inhibition; Linguistic Distance; Code-switching and the bilingual mental lexicon, Language Dominance, the level of command of the languages involved and others. Bentahila & Davies, (1992) have quantitatively studied code-switching and language dominance and one of the aspects they focused on was the 'possible use of code-switching as an indicator of bilingual ability'. This involves the implication of language competence in the languages the speakers were likely to use during the codeswitching phenomenon as their participants were involved in their everyday communication in their community both at home and at work. Their study concluded that Code-switching should not be looked at as representing deviant behaviour (a point that other researchers have raised) but that it is ''actually a suggestive indicator of degree of bilingual competence.'' (Bentahila & Davies, 1992, 616).

From these observations, based on the study of types of codeswitches made by bilingual speakers, this study tries to examine codeswitching phenomenon in a psycholinguistic perspective in order to predict the language competence of the participants. The search for understanding codeswitching in a psycholinguistic perspective is timely in order to investigate the phenomenon of language processing and mental lexicon of speakers of different languages. In this sense, Treffers-Daller (2009) argues for a need for scholars to inform and be informed by models of language processing in order to understand Codeswitching as one of different psycholinguistic processes that occur among speakers of different languages.

3. Methods

This investigation used a purposeful sampling method for participants inclusion. A group of 10 participants was engaged in oral interviews using a semi-structured oral interview guide in order to help participants produce natural language that was analysed. The semi-structured interview guide contained questions that were asked in a duration of 45 minutes for each participant. The questions were built on topics such as studies, work, hobbies, spare time activities, family, etc. Data were collected from people who studied when Kirundi and French were the only languages at primary level in education and Kirundi, French, and English at secondary school level. These data were audio-recorded and later transcribed. From the transcribed data, a presentation including detailed qualitative descriptions of illustrations of codeswitching was provided. There was examination of data for patterns of codeswitching that tally to changes in languagecompetence. The unit of analysis was an utterance. The data have been interpreted based on tenets of the competition model MacWhinney (1982; 1987).

4. Interpretation of Data

According to Karousou-Fokas and Garman (2001), codeswitching is directly connected to two main elements i.e. lexical access and the integration of words within utterance frames. In terms of code interaction, the Competition Model (CM) relies on the notion of resonance to account for co-activation processes in both L2 learners and bi/multilingual speakers. The Competition Model postulates that when a speaker's two languages are less perfectly balanced in strength, there is a far greater level of intrusions of the stronger language into sentences/utterances of the weaker language. The analysis and interpretation of data in this study was based on this position of the CM: the weaker the language competence in the language under use, the more the intrusions from different other languages known by the multilingual speakers. It is important to note that this study made use of only English. However, the participants were also able to use (at different levels of competence) Kirundi (L1), English and French as languages learned in formal education. Some participants could also speak Kiswahili, learned in other sociolinguistic environments.

In this study, I show elements involved in the process of codeswitching including lexical items (words) and longer stretches of utterances such as phrases and sentences. In this study, I highlight the surface manifestations of codeswitching to illustrate the processes involved in multilingual language production.

Different studies have categorized the types codeswitches based on their syntactic structures in

an utterance during language production. Hence, there are those switches that come at the beginning of an utterance as in the illustrations below.

(1)   *infirmi* nas

(It high school was among err de high school of our country)

(2)   *Bon*, de way dey teach is good but err de content is hard today

(Well, de way dey teach is good but err de content is hard today)

Yudita, (2019:150) did not consider whether the codeswiches came at the beginning of an utterance or elsewhere but the type of codeswitch produced. These types of codeswitches were classified in different categories including word form codeswitches as in the example 'do you know *nyepeti*?'

The italicised words in the presented data is the form of the codeswitch either in a single word or a phrase form as highlighted in the illustrations given above in (1) and (2). Another form of the codeswitch that were found in the data of the Yudita (2019) is that of the phrase form as example '*tapi ada yang sangat* popular in English'. The same form of the codeswitch have been found in the present study as highlighted in the illustrations below.

(3)   in the program I change a chronology *programme de la*

journée (in the program I change a chronology *program of the*

day)

(4)   I have studied *Lettres modernes*

(I have studied *Modern Arts*)

(5)   when de student are note errr hmmm ayii … what… *ndasubiramwo* lesson

*(*When de student are note errr hmmm ayii … what… *I repeat* lesson)

These forms of codeswitches are said to mostly appear at the end of an utterance as in illustrations above. Similarly, in a study conducted by Nortier (1990, 126) cited in Muysken (2000, 5) three kinds of code-switching were found: alternation, insertion and congruent lexicalisation. In the examples above, instances of code-switching include stretches of words whereby words of one language alternate with those of another within an utterance what Nortier named alternation.

As to what types of language elements that are subject to codeswitching, Azuma's (1991; 1993) and Joshi (1985) argue that open class words such as single nouns are subject to codeswitching but that close class words (which apply to all grammatical words/morphemes) such as determiners, quantifiers, prepositions, possessives, auxiliary verbs, markers of tense, agreement, topic and case, pronouns, conjunctions are not susceptible to codeswitching. This is expressed by Joshi, (1985, 94) in the following words "closed class items … cannot be switched". However, from the data in this

study, it was found that even the grammatical words can be subject to codeswitching as in *in the program I change a chronology programme de la journée.* Here *de la* accounts for preposition and it is a grammatical close class word.

Since the unit of analysis is an utterance, it is also important to look at the structure of the utterance produced by the speakers to see if even though the two languages are combined to produce one utterance, the structure is appropriate and that the embedded language came in at an appropriate place. For example, in the illustration (3), the structure *in the program I change a chronology programme de la journée,* would be more grammatical if at least two articles were added and they are all English i.e. *the* and *of.* A well-structured codeswitch would be put as *in the program I change the chronology of the programme de la journée.*

In illustration (5), the hesitation, and the use of *what* indicate an embarrassment in the language being used. It could be said that the hesitation is normal as in any speech whereby one has to think about what to say as ideas come in but this would not necessarily be followed by a change of the code being used. I argue that the change of the code indicates that the challenge is in the code being used. But because the languages known are all activated, then there is possibility to draw from other languages to compensate the gap in the language being used as a communicative strategy.

As could be expected, the L1 is likely to be the most activated and any language candidate to the competition with the L1 can easily lose competition. The illustration in (4) is a well-structured codeswitch. If the speaker were free in the choice of language(s) to use, it would sound very normal but in this case the design was that the speakers make an effort to use the language required. This shows that codeswitching is an avoidable phenomenon among multilingual speakers whose languages are mostly activated and who are familiar to drawing from any of them. In case the mode of speech changes, the multilingual speaker might not have that ability of keeping one code and possibly blocking the other candidates competing for production from the other codes known.

From the language produced by the participants, it was found that, other forms of codeswitches occurred in the middle of the utterances showing possibility of the speaker to move through the languages during speech production. The samples in (6) and (7) show that this possibility is however made of short insertion of embedded language in the matrix language. The words or constituents from one language which are inserted into a syntactic frame (that Myers-Scotton and Jake 2000 referred to as matrix language) provided by another language have been referred to as insertion. The samples of utterances highlighted below are examples of this type.

(6) De classroom in de near future, ohhhh if I was ehhh if I have a lo a lot an ada activities I will buy a motorcar I'll buy *imodoka* a motorcar ill carry de a anada…

I'll buy anada anoda parc…. [*parcelle*] anadaaa I'll *constru….[construire*] Il'l build anada house which deyi can which someone see and say disi dis house is to our chief (Speake 2 group 1)

(7) yes, eeh someone someone is *anapenda sana* an activity of a nurse *comme moi*

(yes, eeh someone someone is s/he loves a lot an activity of a nurse like me

(8) … in school language ilikuwa in French. (...in school language was in French)

The example (6) shows that the speaker was not intending to change the code in use but the competition between words of different languages known by the speaker made that some similar words were produced but where not the intended ones. This is example of the use of the word *imodoka* before *a motorcar*. As the language in use was English, it is clear that the intended word was the English one but since the L1 items are also activated to compete with those target language ones, the most activated are likely to come in especially when there are similarities which highly activate all of them. *A motorcar* and *imodoka* are all words of English and Kirundi and the syllables tend to sound alike, a fact that is likely to activate them all. Moreover, the meaning is also close, and it is additional factor that allows the activation of all of them. The most activated, is normally the one to win competition and if it is not the one which is simply produced, it is produced first then followed by the appropriate one.

Other forms of codeswitches are those that occur in the stretch of utterances and only one short element is affected and located inside the same utterance. Dabene and Moore (1995) called such type of codeswitches unitary codeswitching or insert in which either the L2 element is treated syntactically as an L1 element or the L2 element is simply inserted in the L1 utterance.

They highlighted this in their example in Spanish-English (1) and French-Spanish (2) language pairs as highlighted below.

1. era bueno aquel *gateau*.

   (*That cake was good*)

2. *Mais* es por eso que nunca las he probado

   (*But, that's why I never tasted them*)

The same type of codeswitches found by Dabene and Moore (1995) have been found in the present study as in the illustrations that follow with the words highlighted in italics. Those types of codeswitching can be confused with what has been referred to as tag switch but looking at it closely they are not in the tag format.

(9) it must be maybe in de office of maybe members of de government or maybe doze big *ONG* and I just respond to the call.

(it must be maybe in the office of maybe members of the government or maybe those big *NGOs* and I just respond to the call)

(10) Errr donc I prepare de lesson and err ayiii I teach what I have I had prepared... (Errr so, I prepare the lesson and err ayiii I teach what I have I had prepared…)

(11) Because err he remember… dati music remembers me errr some values, our culture errr emm, ego, and new words dat errr I don't hear now.

(Because err he remember… dati music remembers me errr some values, our culture errr emm, *yes*, and new words dat errr I don't hear now.

(12) In the past in the past de education is not very clear to this to dis time and dis time *les* ehhh the student is is in middle of of many activities

(In the past in the past de education is not very clear to this to dis time and dis time *the* ehhh de student is is in middle of of many activities)

Most of these words were inserted into the utterance and treated as words of the target language or at least an unintended word was produced followed by a correct one as illustrated in (12). Moreover, some of them add no meaning to what was being said. This is illustrated in example (11). The word *ego* (Kirundi) translated as *yes* has come in the utterance but it actually adds no meaning in the context. However, in example (9) it is evident that the speaker used the abbreviation *ONG* (French for *NGO*) by treating it as a word of the target language.

The same speaker has used the word more than two times and has not been aware that the abbreviation is not English. The illustration in example (12) is a case whereby competition between items of languages known by the speaker is apparent. The word *les* is French which can be translated as *the* (in plural). The fact that the speaker has corrected this shows that he knew well the appropriate word but the competition between the competing candidates in word items from different languages for production led the most activated and the strongest item *les* appear before the correct one *the*. It can be said that the speaker was aware that he is using English and even though these language items came in, the code being used was not changed. The speakers kept operating in a unilingual mode no matter what other languages contributed to their language production.

As can be seen from the data samples, in order to compensate the missing English language that speakers (participants) were supposed to use, they switched into other languages they know. This can be looked at as a communicative strategy since the speakers needed to say what they wanted.

However, since the mode was supposed to be unilingual, then, there was a problem at least in the language that was required to be used.

The participants mostly switched in either French, Kiswahili and Kirundi. But switching into Kirundi was at lesser extent (compared to switching into French). Nevertheless, it can be said that Kirundi would be normally the one which should be the most activated and most accessible for the present speakers and therefore contribute more in terms of changing the codes.

The reason for not codeswitching in Kirundi, the L1 would be that the speakers made an effort to speak in a foreign language since the language in use was also foreign by blocking the other words from other languages. The competition between words of the known languages led to the selection of at least a foreign language because Kirundi would definitively be rejected since it is not a foreign language. The planning of the language to be used would normally inhibit any language felt inappropriate. However, as I argued in the previous paragraphs, it is not always possible to completely inhibit a language which is the most activated and in competition with the target on. That is why some words could come in the utterances even if it is bringing no meaning to the idea being expressed.

Some of the types of codeswitching highlight what has been known as fluent codeswitching, however, depending on the design in this study, these aspects of codeswitching show that the speaker has not been able to operate in unilingual mode as was required.

In what we can look at as 'fluent' codeswitching in the language produced by the participants, there was a recurrent change of the codes speakers were using (which was the one required) by either starting an utterance with a language other than English, then switching to another language in the course of the utterance, and ending the utterance with a different language.

I argue that this was used as a communicative strategy whereby the speakers made use of other languages to compensate and fill the gap because they found it difficult to fully communicate in the unilingual mode. The participants in this study illustrate the use of all the languages which are in the multilingual education system of Burundi as they made use of English, French, Kirundi and Kiswahili as shown in the examples below from the language produced by the participants in this present study. However, these speakers did not take Kiswahili in formal schooling as the time they were still students, Kiswahili had not been introduced in education. Nevertheless, Kiswahili was used in different places especially Bujumbura the then capital city and in other districts bordering Tanzania.

The ways these languages are used and the move in the change of codes can be seen from the illustrations in (13), (14), and (15). I argue that these illustrations highlight the activation of the

languages known by the speakers and that the language items from those languages are involved in competition for production. The purpose of using the languages involved in the multilingual setting in Burundi are diverse, however, the fact of compensating the language which is not strongly activated (less accessible because it is not developed enough) plays an important role.

(13)   hmmm ayii … what… *ndasubiramwo lesson. Je ne sais pas.*

Iyo batabitahuye.

(hmmm ayii … what… *I repeat lesson.   I don't know.   When they*

didn't understand.)

(14)   students are able to uhhh to produce what dey are... [showing sign of hesitations] abanyeshure ubu nibo err nibo *baparticipa* cane nibo ba ahhhh bakora. Abanyeshure ubu bagira ntuze *participative*. Atari ntuze *metode participative* abanyeshure *baraparticipa* bikabavamwo, hama *the teacher* niwe aca agira *synthese.*

(students are able to uhhh to produce what dey are .. [showing sign of hesitations] *now students are the ones err they are the ones who participate a lot…they are the ones who* ahhhh *work. Now the students they do… what… participative. If not participative methods. Students participate and things come out from them*, *and then* the teacher *is the one who does synthesis.*)

(15)   … Err their teacher was [silent showing sign of not knowing how to say what she wanted to say]… *abigisha bari bafise niveau nininya, ego.*

(… Err their teacher was [silent showing sign of not knowing how to say what she wanted to say]… teachers had high level [of competence], yes.

In this 'fluent' codeswitching, all the languages are used to build an argument. In illustration (14) below for example, the codeswitching was used simply as the speaker switched the mode from unilingual to trilingual mode by moving through English, French and Kirundi. The use of these languages shows the languages that the speaker took during schooling time in addition to the fact that Kirundi is L1. The capability to do this is attributed to fluent multilingual especially when the utterances produced are well structured and do not violate any of the syntactic structures of any of the languages involved. This way of codeswitching is presented as fluent codeswitching in bilingual/multilingual mode.

However, studies on changing mode among multilingual speakers have shown that the change of mode is usually based on language competence. This is the case of second language learners while using their less developed language. When they have to operate in their weaker language, they

usually change the code while they do less code changing while operating in their stronger language (Lanza, 1992; Genesee, Nicoladis, & Paradis, 1995). More balanced bilinguals can be able to control and keep language mode (Grosjean, 2008). Grosjean (2013, 4) argues that when bilingual speakers are required to use a language and that this language mode turns to be weaker, they ''attempt to deactivate their stronger language in a monolingual environment that requires the weaker language, but the latter may simply not be developed enough to allow them to stay in a monolingual mode. Hence, their stronger language is activated and it is used to help them out''.

Considering that the speakers in this study were supposed to operate in a unilingual mode, we can argue that their failure to keep the mode they were supposed to operate in is a sign of weakness at least in the language they were using. If this is connected to language competence, a more multilingual speaker would be able to keep the mode. For the present study, I argue that the more often the code was changed the less competent was the speaker. Moreover, the more intrusions from a different language, the less competent the speaker is considered at least in the language they were required to use.

(16)   Atari ntuze *metode participative* abanyeshure *baraparticipa* bikabavamwo, hama *the teacher* niwe aca agira *synthese***.**

(*Which is errr… participative method, students participate and build their [knowledge], and the teacher is the one to make synthesis.*

(17)…. because *nilikua napenda sana*,…

 (… because I loved[it] a lot ….)

(18)   eeh, a routine err, *kwanziya, kwanziya matin asubuhi mtu anafanya douche, puis ataingia ku kazi ku* job.

(eeh, a routine err, *from, from morning morning one takes shower*, *then will enter at work at job*.)

(19)   Eeh, after job mtu anapata ropos, puis je rentre le soir, puis la journée se termine. (Eeh, after job *one takes a rest, then I come home the evening, then the day ends.)*

In the example (16) there was a switch into Kirundi and French whereas there was a switch into French and Kiswahili in (18). The word *participate* is a cognate in French and English with a difference only in pronunciation. This is the case of the word *baparticipa* which is *to participate* (English) or *participer* (French). This word has at least three parts: *ba+particip+a.* The first and the last parts are Kirundi parts whereas the root is shared between French and English. In the example

(18) there is a mixture of Kiswahili (*kwanziya asubuhi mtu anafanya, ataingia ku kazi,…*) French (*matin, douche, puis*,…), and English (*a routine, after job,…*).

As it has been discussed in previous paragraphs, these types of codeswitches are illustration are examples of what is known as fluent codeswitching. A form of codeswitching that normally occurs in natural speech of multilingual speakers. A phenomenon which happens because all the languages known by the speakers are activated and can be used when necessary. However, the normal occurrences of the type of codeswitches happen are said to happen when the speaker is operating in a bilingual mode. In this study, the participants were required to operate in unilingual mode.

The types of illustrations discussed in (16) and (18) above are similar to those found in other codeswitching situations whereby speakers use languages they know without any requirement of using one of them. I argue that this type of codeswitching was used because the participants were finding it difficult in using English as a way of keeping a unilingual mode and they decided to use the other languages to fill the gap.

However, I am aware that there might have been other factors that pushed the speakers to use other languages than the one required and therefore pushing them to change the mode. However, this reason alone cannot explain their codeswitching behaviour in the sense that the use of Kiswahili for example is not common for everybody except those who take it in class. Therefore, the codeswitch in Kiswahili would be avoided since there was no sign that the interviewer could understand Kiswahili.

This can be explained by the fact that the low level of competence in the target language was compensated by the other languages known by the speakers all contributed to help them fill the gap of the missing language (the one in use during the data collection).

The codeswitches also involved simply using either Kirundi or French in a stretch of utterance. This meant changing the language mode throughout the conversation. Some participants, agreed to participate using English but they changed the language and shifted to a different language (one shifted to the use of Kirundi throughout the conversation and another one shifted to using French). The shift in a different language means that the speaker has changed the code and it is even impossible to talk about intruders in the language in use. The case of completely shifting the language can be considered as the lowest level of language proficiency at least in the language being used. Samples of such language shift can be seen in illustrations below.

(20)   Why, bon kubera dukorera mu bantu ba communauté uravyumva kandi dukora mu ma programa atandukanye, dukora le travail en commun, je sinikoranye ndumwe

(Why, *well, because we work with communities you understand and we work in different programs, we work in shared work, I did not work alone*)

(21)   Because I love it, j'aime l'enregistrement des etudiants parce que j'aime la comptabilité, j'aime la comptabilité parce que j'aime ce qui est en rapport avec balanceship

(Because, I love it, *I love registering students, because I love accounting, because I love anything which has to do with balanceship*)

(22)   ico igihe tuuu, hari ighe tuja kubatora kuri frontier, tukabazana ku ma centre de transit, hagaca hongera hakaba transifere tubatahana mu ma komine iwabo

(*that time, we errr, sometimes we pick them from the border, and bring them to transit centres, and then there is a transfer and we bring them back to their respective districts*)

in other studies (Yunta, 2019 for example), this has been referred to as permanent codeswitching in which there is a shift from the language under use to another one. Since the interview had started we decided to continue and let the participants speak the way they wished. Throughout the interview there was no instance where the speaker came back to mainly using English, but the kept in the language they have shifted into. This might be explained by the fact that the speakers had English to communicate but another language was stronger than English and more activated. This point can be explained by the fact that all the questions to be answered were asked in English and the answers given by the speakers were in line with the questions. However, the language used was not English. This is type of codeswitch which shows how competition between known languages can lead to a complete inhibition of a weaker language and therefore lead to a change of code.

In the languages that the speakers switched to, there was codeswitching well formulated but not using English. In sample (22), the speaker made the matrix language Kirundi and constantly switched into French. The use of words *transfer*, *frontier, centre de transit* are all used in one utterance and have French source.

The illustrations of codeswitching presented here have been produced in the sense to compensate the missing English. As far as English language use is concerned in the multilingual speakers (both produced and still in the multilingual education system in Burundi), it can be said that there was a problem of the use of language since as codeswitching in a psycholinguistic perspective posits an inappropriate code which is produced in a need to compensate a language gap.

It is important to note that the interviewer used English only by asking questions to elicit production of the language in a more natural way, however some participants have tried to answer these questions in English when they failed there was the use of the language they felt comfortable with. This means that the participants understood the questions in English and knew the answers they wanted to give but they could not get the language to use as far as English language is concerned.

5. Discussion

This study took a psycholinguistic approach to studying codeswitching (other studies took structural and/or sociolinguistic approaches) which assumes this linguistic phenomenon is a result of the way the speaker's language systems interact. This study investigated the utterances produced by the speakers and looked at how these utterances were constructed based on the languages that participants know and how they are simultaneously activated to contribute to the phenomenon of CS.

In this study, I showed elements involved in the process of codeswitching including lexical items (words) and longer stretches of utterances such as phrases and sentences. I highlight the surface manifestations of codeswitching to illustrate the processes of word/phrase/sentence insertion to build an utterance in multilingual language production. Different studies have categorized the types of codeswitches based on their syntactic structures in an utterance during language production. As has been done by Kapantzoglou, et al. (2021) language samples were used to inquire the level of language competence among the Burundian multilingual adult speakers.

Codeswitching as an aspect of lexical transfer is manifest in different positions in the speech of speakers. The position can reveal the level of planning in the process of retrieval of the words to be produced to covey meaning henceforth the place of competition among words competing for production. In the data from this study, I have illustrated such examples of words of codeswitching that have been produced at the beginning of the utterance. These examples are made of one word which is from a different language. However, in many other studies, the one word codeswitch can come at any place in the utterance. Contrary to some findings in literature, the present study has found that any word category can be subject to codeswitching. From the data in this study, even the grammatical words can be subject to codeswitching.

Some other forms of codeswitches have occurred in the middle of the sentence showing possibility of the speaker to move through the languages during speech production. Such kinds of

utterances whereby the speaker can make movements throughout the languages they know during codeswitching have been considered as fluent codeswitches. The words or constituents from one language which are inserted into a syntactic frame (that Myers-Scotton and Jake, 2000 referred to as matrix language) provided by another language have been referred to as insertion.

Moreover, codeswitches also occur in the stretch of utterances and only one short element is affected and located inside the same utterance in which either the L2 element is treated syntactically as an L1 element or the L2 element is simply inserted in the L1 utterance. This type of CS has also occurred in the language produced by participants in this study and considering how the participants inserted into their speech this type of CS, the words from different languages were treated as words of the target language making the production of these words unintentional.

In order to fill the gap of the missing English language that speakers (participants) were required to use, they switched into the other languages they know. Participants mostly switched in either French, Kiswahili or Kirundi. However, switching into Kirundi was not common even though it can be said that the Kirundi (speakers' L1) has the highest activation level and that it is the most accessible for the speakers. The reason for not codeswitching in Kirundi, the mother tongue would be that the speakers made an effort to speak a foreign language as they wanted to speak a language as the one that they were supposed to use was a foreign language (English). The awareness of the kind of language speakers were supposed to use (and that this language is a foreign language) played a role in the languages being more activated for access and later retrieval. The competition between words of the known languages led to the selection of at least a foreign language because Kirundi would definitively be inhibited since it is not a foreign language (at least for the interview during this study).

Furthermore, the use of codeswitching led to shift the matrix language which would normally be English in the present case. Some of the participants used Kirundi as their matrix language whereas others used French. Here, the sociolinguistic environment plays a significant role as to which language speakers are more competent than others. It has been realised that those who shifted the matrix language to French are those who reside in town whereas those who shifted into Kirundi reside in the countryside. In both of the two cases, the participants were not able to keep the unilingual mode that was required therefore showing a lowest level of language competence at least in the language being used. This can also be expressed in the terms that, in other studies participants reported their felt ability to use a language but ended up realising that they overrated their supposed ability in the language(s) they know.

Generally, the languages the participants switched into was mainly French. Kirundi and

Kiswahili contributed to the codeswitching to a lower level. This shows that besides the competition among languages that are known by the speakers from the multilingual education system of Burundi, there is also an awareness on the side of the speakers that the language under use is a foreign language. This might have had a significant impact on the languages activated and the degree of control exercised by the speakers in order to fit the circumstances present i.e. the use of a language other than the L1 since they have in mind that the language required for use was also a foreign language.

6. Conclusion

In conclusion, the present results show, that codeswitching depends on language competence in multilingual speakers. Based on tenets of the competition model, the amounts of intruders into the language being used (which should be the matrix language throughout) reveals to what extent a multilingual user is competent in his languages. For instance, the code-switches inserting a single word in an utterance can be seen as a sign of advanced competence into the language being used. inserting a whole phrase or chunk of an utterance in another utterance is middle competence while frequent codeswitching in a design like the present is a sign of low competence

Moreover, the capability of the multilingual speaker to keep in a unilingual/monolingual mode illustrates their level of language competence. For instance, in the data discussed from this study more competent speakers would have some few intruders in their language. Most of them would be unintentional whereby the speaker uses a word and be unaware that the word being used is not the target language. In addition, what has been referred to in literature as fluent codeswitching (in designs where the language is recorded as it is naturally used) can be seen as a level of language competence in a design where the speakers are required to operate in a unilingual/monolingual mode. The lowest level of competence is when keeping the mode is completely impossible. That is when the speakers shift into a different language. That means the language the speaker has shifted into is the strongest one whereas the one required is very weak. In this case, it becomes even impossible to talk of intruders. It come out that, based on the notion of switching codes developed by the competition model, the amount of codeswitches produced by speakers can reveal their level of competence at least in the language being used in designs whereby the speakers are required to operate in unilingual mode.

References

Almelhi, A. M. (2020). Understanding code-switching from a sociolinguistic perspective: A meta-analysis. *International Journal of language and linguistics*, *8*(1), 34-45.

Azuma, S. (1991). *Processing and intrasentential code-switching*. The University of Texas at Austin.

Azuma, S. (1993). The frame-content hypothesis in speech production: Evidence from intrasentential code switching. *Linguistics* 31(1993), 1071-1093

Beatty-Martínez, A. L., Navarro-Torres, C. A., Dussias, P. E., Bajo, M. T., Guzzardo Tamargo, R. E., & Kroll, J. F. (2020). Interactional context mediates the consequences of bilingualism for language and cognition. *Journal of Experimental Psychology: Learning, Memory, and Cognition*, *46*(6), 1022.

Bentahila, A., & Davies, E. E. (1992). Code-switching and language dominance. In *Advances in psychology* (Vol. 83, pp. 443-458). North-Holland.

Gardner-Chloros, P. (2009). *Code-switching*. Cambridge university press.

Gardner-Chloros, P. (2020). Contact and code-switching. *The handbook of language contact*, 181-199.

Genesee, F., Nicoladis, E., & Paradis, J. (1995). Language differentiation in early bilingual development. *Journal of child language*, *22*(3), 611-631.

Green, D. W. (2018). Language control and code-switching. *Languages*, *3*(2), 8.

Green, D. W., & Abutalebi, J. (2013). Language control in bilinguals: The adaptive control hypothesis. *Journal of cognitive psychology*, *25*(5), 515-530.

Green, D. W., & Wei, L. (2014). A control process model of code-switching. *Language, Cognition and Neuroscience*, *29*(4), 499-511.

Green, D. W., & Wei, L. (2014). A control process model of code-switching. *Language, Cognition and Neuroscience*, *29*(4), 499-511.

Grosjean, F. (2008). *Studying bilinguals*. Oxford University Press.

Grosjean, F. (2013). Bilingual and monolingual language modes. *The encyclopedia of applied linguistics*, 489-493.

Gumperz, J. J. (1977). The sociolinguistic significance of conversational code-switching. *RELC journal*, *8*(2), 1-34.

Hatzidaki, A. G. (1994). Lexical borrowing in immigrant varieties of Greek. *Amsterdam Studies In The Theory And History of Linguistic Science Series 4*, 365-365.

Jones, M. C. (2005). Some structural and social correlates of single word intrasentential code-switching in Jersey Norman French. *Journal of French Language Studies*, *15*(1), 1-23.

Karousou-Fokas, R., & Garman, M. (2001). A psycholinguistic interpretation of codeswitching: Evidence from fluent Greek-English bilingual adults. *International Journal of Bilingualism*, *5*(1), 39-69.

Kootstra, G. J. (2015). A psycholinguistic perspective on code-switching: Lexical, structural, and socio-interactive processes. *Code-switching between structural and sociolinguistic perspectives*, 39- 64.

Lanza, E. (1992). Can bilingual two-year-olds code-switch? *Journal of child language*, *19*(3), 633-658.

MacWhinney, B. (1987). Applying the competition model to bilingualism. *Applied psycholinguistics*, *8*(4), 315-327.

Milroy, J. (1995). *One speaker, two languages: Cross-disciplinary perspectives on code-switching* (Vol. 10). Cambridge University Press.

Milroy, J. (1995). *One speaker, two languages: Cross-disciplinary perspectives on code-switching* (Vol. 10). Cambridge University Press.

Myers-Scotton, C. (1991). Making ethnicity salient in codeswitching. *Language and ethnicity*, *2*, 95-109.

Myers-Scotton, C. (1992). Comparing codeswitching and borrowing. *Journal of Multilingual & Multicultural Development*, *13*(1-2), 19-39.

Pfaff, C. W. (1979). Constraints on language mixing: Intrasentential code-switching and borrowing in Spanish/English. *Language*, 291-318.

Poplack, S. (1980). Sometimes i'll start a sentence in spanish y termino en espanol: toward a typology of code-switching1.

Treffers-Daller, J. (2009). *Code-switching and transfer: an exploration of similarities and differences* (pp. 58-74). Cambridge University Press.

Weinreich, U. (1953). The Russification of Soviet minority languages. *Probs. Communism*, 2, 46.

Yahiaoui, R., Aldous, M. J., & Fattah, A. (2021). Functional and sociocultural attitudes of code-switching and its relation to the meaning-making process: The case of dubbing Kim Possible into Arabic. *International Journal of Bilingualism*, 25(5), 1349-1368.

Yudita, C. (2019). Code Switching in English Language Learning at Pabelan Islamic Boarding School. *RETORIKA: Jurnal Ilmu Bahasa*, 5(2), 148-158.

Ekaterine Kardava

Gori State University, Georgia

New Approach towards the EU Studies in Georgia

ABSTRACT

The issue of the EU Studies development in Georgia is highly actual and important considering the fact that during the last 30 years' path of European integration, the people of Georgia have not lost their faith and hope honorably to find a place in the EU family. The start of the association process in 2014 based on the AA/DCFTA (within the association trio) and the emergence of a European Perspective for Georgia in 2022, required a qualitatively new understanding of the content and methods of EU studies. The article presents one of the innovative attempts and approaches toward EU studies at the Gori State University, which was developed within the framework of the Jean Monnet Module "European Union Explored in Association Agreement".

Sharing and disseminating the experience of a new style of EU studies could be useful for EaP countries and others oriented on European development.

.   *Keywords: European integration, Curriculum, Teaching Methods*

Introduction

The year 1996, when the Partnership and Cooperation Agreement (PCA) was signed between the European Union and Georgia, is considered the start of the policy of the European integration and legal approximation in Georgia (22.04.1996, https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/ALL/?uri= CELEX%3A21999A0804%2801%29). Since then, continuously, the process of democratization and Europeanization has been ongoing in Georgia. In 2004, Georgia became a beneficiary of the European Neighborhood Policy (12.05.2004, Communication from the Commission European Neighbourhood Policy Strategy Paper, https://ec.europa.eu/neighbourhood-enlargement/2004-communication-commission-european-neighbourhood-policy-strategy-paper_en). Initially, Georgia was not included in the European Neighborhood Policy and enlargement goals. ENP (related to the East countries) touched only Russia, Ukraine, Moldova, Belarus. However, later, it was finally decided that Georgia,

Armenia and Azerbaijan would also become part of this policy; In 2009, Georgia was involved as one of the participant countries (among 6) within the Eastern Partnership Initiative (Joint Declaration of the Prague Eastern Partnership Summit Prague, 7.05.2009); In 2009, Georgia signed the declaration with the EU about the Mobility Partnership (Joint Declaration on a Mobility Partnership between the European Union and Georgia, 30.11.2009, https://home-affairs.ec.europa.eu/system/files/2020-09/mobility_partnership _gerogia_en.pdf); in 2010, the EU and Georgia agreed on Readmission and Visa facilitation regime (Agreement between the European Union and Georgia on the readmission of persons residing without authorization, https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=celex%3A22011A0225%2803%29, Agreement between the European Union and Georgia on the facilitation of the issuance of visas, https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/ALL/?uri=CELEX% 3A22011A0225%2802%29); In 2013, Georgia started the implementation of the Visa Liberalization Action Plan (VLAP, https://home-affairs.ec.europa.eu/policies/international-affairs/collaboration-countries/visa-liberalisation-moldova-ukraine-and-georgia_en); In 2014 the EU and Georgia concluded the Association Agreement (AA/DCFTA, Association Agreement between the European Union and the European Atomic Energy Community and their Member States, of the one part, and Georgia, of the other part, 27.06.2014, https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/en/TXT/PDF/?uri=CELEX:22014A0830(02)); In 2017, the EU granted Georgia Visa-Free regime into the Schengen Area (https://www.eeas. europa.eu/node/23697_en); On March 3, 2022, Georgia made the official application on EU membership. In June 2022, based on the European Commission recommendations, the Council of the EU decided to give the European perspective to Georgia (https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/qanda_22_3800), but like Ukraine and Moldova, Georgia was not granted the candidate status.

European choice is the Constitutional choice, strong will of Georgian people and solely future. Constitution of Georgia states: *The constitutional bodies shall take all measures within the scope of their competences to ensure the full integration of Georgia into the European Union and the North Atlantic Treaty Organization* (Article 78, 1995, amendment of 2018). Thus, Georgia's preparation for joining the European Union (obtaining the candidacy) requires changes, reforms, establishment of new standards, awareness raising, approximation of Georgian legislation with the EU legislation, formation of new practices in each sphere of public and state life. The basis and foundation of success and progress lays in education policy. Today, it is essential to strengthen the traditional approaches of EU studies in Georgia, however, it is necessary to search for new and innovative ways and to find, promote and develop original methods of teaching about the EU.

1. Gori State University – Newcomer to Jean Monnet Activities

Within the framework of 2020 Erasmus+ Jean Monnet Activities competition, Gori State University submitted an application (Jean Monnet Module) for the first time and won (Jean Monnet Activities 2020 – results, https://erasmusplus.org.ge/en/news/jm-results-2020). Gori State University is located in Georgia, in the Shida Kartli region, in the city of Gori - a few kilometers from the territory of Georgia occupied by the Russian Federation. One of the offices of the EU Monitoring Mission is located in the city of Gori (https://www.eumm.eu/en/about_eumm/hom). Gori University is, in fact, the flagship and center of regional education, where Georgians, Ossetians, and other nationalities live, as well as, internally displaced people (IDPs) from the Tskhinvali region.

Various programs of EU studies were carried out at the Gori State University, among them, the university was involved in the Erasmus+ different programs under the leadership of other HEIs (https://gu.edu.ge/en/international-relations1/proeqtebi). However, with the entry into the Jean Monnet space via the module, a new history of EU studies began at the university.

1.1. Jean Monnet Module Goals

Jean Monned Module is titled so – "European Union Explored in Association Agreement" (EUEAA, https://gu.edu.ge/en/international-relations1/jean-monnet-module/about-module). The aim of the module is to strengthen the new angel of EU studies, encourage the European arena within the regional university, develop the innovative teaching content and methods, establish a very new curriculum about the EU studies. The vision was formed by the professor of Gori State University: to teach the European Union via explanation/interpretation of norms of the Association Agreement, through the prism of the implemented and ongoing reforms, by introducing and evaluating the concrete examples of Georgian European integration practices, via describing and analyzing the dynamics of Georgia-EU relations. The traditional way of teaching the European Union in Georgia is to teach the foundation and enlargement of the EU, the EU institutions, EU law and EU values, which is often more like history lessons. (The traditional method of teaching about the EU is crucial for EU studies programs, and the opinion presented here does not mean to diminish or replace this method). In such teaching, there is less of a practical and emotional connection with nationality and usefulness in future daily professional activities. In modern Georgia, any person of any profession must have such knowledge about the EU that will be actually used in practice and that will make any professional competitive in the labor market. Within the framework of the module, exactly this aspect has been taken into account - the combination of academic theoretical knowledge with the development of specific professional skills and practical

efficiency.

The introduction of the Module at the Shida Kartli regional university, aimed, as well, the combating disinformation, popularizing the EU, generating new knowledge and style of thinking among young people, and increasing interest in the EU among the academic personnel of the university.

1.2. Curriculum – "EU, Association Agreement and Legal Approximation"

The curriculum for the new teaching course "EU, Association Agreement and Legal Approximation" was developed within the framework of the module. The course has been integrated into both BA and MA programs (with relevant modifications and differences for the degrees). The course became mandatory for students of the MA Law program and MA of Public Administration program, optional - for students of the BA Law program and BA Business program (https://gu.edu.ge/en/international-relations1/jean-monnet-module/activities/curriculum-eu-association-agreement-and-legal-approximation.page).

The number of contact hours of the new teaching course is 42 per semester (exam and independent work hours are not included).

The following topics are taught within the teaching course:

1. Definition of Article 78 of the Constitution of Georgia; what does it mean that the constitutional bodies of Georgia should act in order to facilitate the full integration of Georgia into the European Union.

2. Association agreement - a unique international agreement; how did Georgia reach this agreement? What purpose does the agreement have for both Georgia and the European Union?

3. What are the mutual interests of the European Union and Georgia?

4. What historic and valuable examples should Georgia take from the unification of European countries and from the establishment of the first European Community till the present day.

5. What are the legal power of those EU primary and secondary legislation which are mentioned in the Association Agreement and what different methods should be used when approximating the secondary law of the EU.

6. Why the structure and design of the Association Agreement are built according to the logic of the Copenhagen criteria (political, trade, sectoral).

7. What is the purpose of the principle of good governance and what is the role of the public administration reform for the Europeanization and democratization of the country.

8. What is the regulatory approximation that ensures the freedom of the EU internal market - from

regulation to freedom of production.

9. What is the policy of sustainable development within the framework of the DCFTA, what does the balance and mutual inviolability of trade, labor and environmental policies mean.

10. What does legal approximation mean (gradual and dynamic) and how many stages does legal approximation consist of? How does harmonization differ from approximation?

11. What are Georgia's practices and examples of approximation with EU legislation (for ex.: right-wheel vehicles, waste management, labor legislation, discrimination, competition, food safety, consumer rights, etc.).

12. What is the purpose of studying the decisions of the Court of Justice of the EU in the process of legal approximation.

13. How did the Council of the European Union adopt the amendment to the legislative act on granting the visa-free regime to Georgia and what procedures does the European Union when making the binding decisions (voting).

14. What is the power of political dialogue formats between the European Union and Georgia (Association Council - European Commission and the Government of Georgia; Parliamentary Association Committee - European Parliament and the Parliament of Georgia; Civil Society Association Platform - the civil representatives of the EU and Georgia).

15. What is the Association Agreement implementation coordination system in Georgia?

16. etc

1.3. Teaching Methods

Teaching of the course, traditionally includes lecture hours, seminars, midterm and final exams, homework.

The teaching of each issue/topic, within the curriculum, is based on the analysis of real facts, case-study, the description and evaluation of specific legal or political examples, frank and open-ended discussion and reflection, and fact/source findings by students.

The following are used in the teaching-learning process:

- group work (for example, students are divided into three groups - the state, business, consumer and they discuss the issue - can Georgia ban right-wheel cars? Students must justify the decisions/opinions in the context of compliance with the EU internal market standards).

- practical component (for example, role-playing and argumentation of decision-making by the European Union institution);

- Critical analysis (for example, It is considered and discussed a specific fact of the information

disseminated by the mass media, which refers to the transposition of the EU standard in Georgian law and practice).

2. Module Implementation

The implementation of the module is scheduled for a period of 3 years. In addition to each semester's teaching, the module provides other activities: meeting with the academic and administrative staff of Gori State University and conducting the training for them regarding the Association Agreement. In the first year of the module, about 40 personnel underwent 12-hour (two-day) training (https://gu.edu.ge/en/international-relations1/jean-monnet-module/activities/jean-monnet-module-at-gori-state-teaching-university-seminar-for-academic-and-administrative-staff.page). The training covered the topics of teaching curriculum, however, in a shortened and relatively reduced volume. The purpose of the training, in addition to awareness rising, was to develop and enrich the teaching and scientific activities in relation to the EU.

The student conference "European Union and Gori" was held within the framework of the module (second year). It was an unprecedented and unique conference, within the framework of which the students researched - what was done in the Shida Kartli region with the support of the EU. At the conference, topics were presented in four directions: infrastructure projects in Shida Kartli; Development of tourism in Shida Kartli; Education, youth and training in Shida Kartli; Cultural heritage in Shida Kartli (https://gu.edu.ge/en/international-relations1/jean-monnet-module/activities/jean-monnet-module-gori-state-teaching-university-conference-eu-in-gori.page). In the process of preparing the conference topics, the students requested official information from public agencies, conducted sociological research, processed other academic and reliable information and discovered for themselves that around them, - in their cities, villages, districts - it turns out that a lot of projects are implemented within the framework of EU assistance. Such an approach aroused great interest among young people. The majority of the public attending the conference heard for the first time how their existence and life conditions were improved with the support of the EU. This conference not only enhanced the research skills of students but also brought to light information that was not properly disseminated to the population of the region (https://gu.edu.ge/en/international-relations1/jean-monnet-module/activities/jean-monnet-module-gori-state-teaching-university-conference.page). Results of the conference were announced at the university, and were spread among families and the community in the region. Conference materials were printed and distributed.

In order to disseminate publicly about the module, presentations were made at different types of events, among: at the Caucasus University dedicated to Erasmus+ days in October 2021; with

Armenian colleagues (at a meeting organized by the National Erasmus+ Office of Armenia); in Shida Kartli mass media, and etc.

Within the framework of the module, the teaching materials/resources were conceptualized and prepared in the form of manual handouts by the professor of the module. These handouts have undergone binding, processing, editing since the first year of the module's inception. In the third year (at the end) of the module, it is planned to publish the curriculum guide/manual and present it at the final event of closing the module and introducing the results.

In the first year of the module, a special website was created for the purpose of informational communication, where any can see/read about the events carried out within the module. The page is bilingual - Georgian and English (https://gu.edu.ge/en/international-relations1/jean-monnet-module).

3. Sustainability of Outcomes and Continuity

The implementation of the module and its results should not be fragmented. It should be continuous and sustainable. For this purpose, the teaching course developed within the module became a part of the university curriculums (based on the decision of the university). Thus, after the completion of the module, the teaching will be continued.

Abovementioned is not enough. There should be more and many activities to strengthen EU studies. It is very important to develop the policy of EU studies based on new ideas and approaches, to integrate EU studies into different teaching courses, to enhance EU studies into scientific activities. For this purpose, it is necessary for Gori State University to continue participating in Jean Monnet activities competitions and use various tools to create a sustainable, solid and stable EU studies environment in Shida Kartli region.

References

Association Agreement between the European Union and the European Atomic Energy Community and their Member States, of the one part, and Georgia, of the other part, 27.06.2014.

Communication from the Commission European Neighbourhood Policy Strategy Paper, 12.05.2004.

Constitution of Georgia, 1995.

Jean Monnet Activities 2020 – results, <https://erasmusplus.org.ge/en/news/jm-results-2020>

Joint Declaration of the Prague Eastern Partnership Summit Prague, 7.05.2009.

Joint Declaration on a Mobility Partnership between the European Union and Georgia, 30.11.2009.

Partnership and Cooperation Agreement between the European Communities and their Member States, of the one part, and Georgia, of the other part, 22.04.1996.

Official Internet Sources:

Jean Monnet Module EUEAA web-page, https://www.gu.edu.ge/en/international-relations1/jean-monnet-module

https://www.eeas.europa.eu/node/23697_en

https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/qanda_22_3800

Giorgi Jgharkava

Ivane Javakhishvili Tbilisi State University, Georgia

Onomastic Material in the Proverbs of Kartvelian Languages: Marking and Generalization[1]

ABSTRACT

Analysis of the vocabulary of proverbs and identification of the existing thematic fields is extremely important, because the lexical fund of paremic units is very close to everyday speech. Due to the social nature of proverbs, the form and content of a concrete word may point to the place of origin and/or spreading of the proverb. Analysis of the empirical material has proved that even within the related Kartvelian languages there may be thematically diverse paremic units, marked by the influence of local peculiarities. In this regard, special focus should be made on the onomastic material represented in proverbs. Since understanding locally marked proverbs is linked to additional problems for language learners, the issues raised in the article are equally relevant in the context of teaching a second language.

Keywords: *Paremiology; Proverb; Culturology; Onomastics; Kartvelian languages.*

1. Introduction

A proverb is an object of interdisciplinary research. Various disciplines and related fields are interested in the study of proverbs. Observation of paremic units from diverse perspectives is important for linguistics proper, as well as folklore, culturology, literary studies, ethnology, translation studies, multicultural studies and so on. Contemporary paremiological research, which chiefly embraces European languages (Rusieshvili, 2005; Mieder, 2014; Grzybek, 2014; Jesenšek, 2014; Sergienko 2016), and analyzes proverbs from diverse perspectives, focuses on the study of the vocabulary of paremic units and identification of the existing thematic fields. All this helps reveal the culture, daily activities, history and traditions of the speech community which has created the paremic units and actively uses them even nowadays. Above all, based on the pragmatic aspects of paremic units, their lexical fund is closely linked to everyday speech and routine. This proves the

---

[1] The paper was presented at a scientific session dedicated to the memory of Parnaoz Ertelishvili on February 28, 2022. Currently it is being published in an altered and enriched form.

social nature of the proverbs[2]. Due to this social nature, the form and meaning of a concrete word may point to the area of origin and/or spreading of a proverb. In this regard, special attention should be paid to the anthroponyms, toponyms, hydronyms etc. represented in the proverbs. The fact that the language of proverbs is diverse, peculiar and interesting, is conditioned by various reasons[3].

Analysis of the empirical material has proved that Kartvelian proverbs refer to various themes and reflect the daily life and activities of peasants. In such way, these proverbs reveal general wisdom which is of crucial significance for everyone. Although Georgian, Megrelian, Laz and Svan proverbs reveal certain similarities, even within this family of related languages there are thematically different proverbs, reflecting the activities and geographical environment of a certain speech community. Hence, it is not surprising that, alongside with the universal lexical-thematic data of Kartvelian languages, we can distinguish certain groups of paremic units marked with original features of specific regions (Jgharkava, 2020).

It is common knowledge that when teaching a second language, proverbs, idioms, and other such linguistic units that are significant from an ethno-cultural perspective require special consideration. In this regard, it is important to note that the lexical-thematic variety found in Kartvelian proverbs and the lexemes that are characteristic to a particular region, distinctive in a particular way, and imprinted with originality, reflected in paremic, present some challenges in the study and teaching of Georgian or other Kartvelian languages. A unique method is needed when using historical, geographical, or other local data during language teaching.

In order to illustrate all the above-mentioned, below I analyze those Megrelian, Laz and Svan proverbs which are peculiar of these regions and reflect specific lexical units (anthroponyms, toponyms) and historical-geographic data.

2. Analyses of the empirical materials (anthroponyms)
Megrelian:
(1) ახალაიაშ ოსურეფ პატარაიაშ ოსურეფს მიშარაგადანდესია.

axalaiaš osurepi p̣aṭaraiaš osureps mišaragadandesia (Sherozia & Memishishi, 1994, 16).

"The Akhalaias' wives mix with the Pataraias' wives".

The given proverb says that the women of the Akhalaia family tried to establish close relationships with the wives of the Pataraia family. The proverb implies the supremacy of the

---

[2] L. Lezhava dedicates special analysis to the lexical peculiarities of Georgian proverbs (See Lezhava 1959).

[3] For more information, see: G. Jgharkava, Lexical-Thematic Characteristics of Proverbs of Kartvelian Languages, East European University, Collection of Scientific Papers, 2020, №2, pp. 149-155.

Pataraia family over the Akhalaias. Thus, the content of the proverb was, from the very start, **defined (marked)** by the historically proved social supremacy of certain families. Due to its very nature, a proverb is always inclined to **generalization**. The above-mentioned paremic unit is nowadays quite general in its content, whereas the social status of certain families is of secondary importance (this can be proved by Megrelian proverbs of the same meaning, containing different anthroponyms.

(2) ახალაიაქ პატარაიას მიშასხაპუა.

axalaiak p̣aṭaraias mišasxap̣ua[4] (Sherozia & Memishishi, 1994, 16).

"Akhalaia mixed with the Pataraias".

(3) ახალაიაშ ჯოღორი გოშუაშ ჯოღორენს მიშალალანდუა.

axalaiaš ǯoġori gošuaš ǯoġorens mišalalandua (ibid, 16).

"Akhalaia's dog barked together with Goshua's dogs".

There are other examples of Megrelian proverbs referring to surnames:

(4) დარსალიემქ თქვისია – შარა გიბრთათ დო ოულარო მუთა ფხვადუნანია.

darsaliemk tkvisia – šara gibrtat do oularo muta pxvadunania (Sherozia & Memishishi, 1994, 35).

"The Darsalias said – let us divide the road and we will have to travel less".

(5) ჭილაიაშ ხოჯი ეკოხონს ხონუნსია.

čilaiaš xoǯi eḳoxons xonunsia (ibid, 175).

"Chilaia's ox ploughs uphill".

The proverbs (4) and (5) are semantically different from the previous examples. Yet, it should be noted that the anthroponyms mentioned in these proverbs must have had concrete referents in the past. However, on the synchronic plane, this aspect is vague. The following proverbs are examples of generalization of originally marked proverbs:

Megrelian:

(6a) სონი ჩიქახე, სო მიშახე.

soni čikaxe, so mišaxe (Sherozia & Memishishi, 1994, 124).

"Fancy where Chikava's daughter has happened to be".

(6b) სონი ჯიქახე, სო მიშახე.

soni ǯikaxe, so mišaxe (Folk Speech. II 1991, 526).

"Fancy where Jikia's daughter has happened to be".

---

[4] Literally: "Akhalaia interfered with Pataraia's dance".

(6c) სონი მიქახე, სო დიშახე.

soni mikaxe, so dišaxe (field materials).

"Fancy where Mikava's daughter has happened to be".

The concrete referents found in the above-mentioned proverbs become generalized with time. The examples (6a), (6b) and (6c) presented above are also interesting from another viewpoint. In particular, the additional basis of their marking is the rhythmic nature of proverbs i.e. the rhyming of the constituent words (cf. ***čikaxe – mišaxe, ǯikaxe – mišaxe, mikaxe – dišaxe).***

Existence of such paremic units is natural and can be explained objectively: a monolithic nature of a phrase, its laconic, musical nature and flexibility are of special significance for a proverb. All this is achieved by rhymed anthroponyms. Other Megrelian proverbs are given below in order to provide examples of arranging the rhythm and rhyme by means of proper names:

(7) გიორგი ცხონდია – ირკოჩიში მორდია.

giorgi cxondia – irḳočiši mordia (Sherozia & Memishishi, 1994, 35)[5].

"Giorgi Tskhondia is a godfather of everyone" ("every man").

The concrete facts which happened in the past have given rise to the following proverbs:

(8) უტუში ნინა მუში ნაჭკადაში უჟგუშო ჭკირუნცია.

uṭuši nina muši načḳadaši užgušo čḳiruncia (Sherozia & Memishishi, 1994, 137).

"Utu's tongue is sharper than his smithery".

The above proverb is explained in the second volume of "Georgian Folk Speech" (Megrelian texts, 1991): "Utu Mikava was a smith, the leader of peasants' rebellion in Samegrelo in 1858. He was famous for his skills of an orator" (Xalx. Siṭqv. II, 1991, 446).

(9) უჭირო საჭირო ჩანგელიაშ კარსია.

učiro sačiro čangeliaš ḳarsia (Sherozia & Memishishi, 1994, 138).

"There was no trouble in Changelia's family until he himself looked for trouble".

This paremic unit has been explained as follows: "Changelia was a peasant who found a salmon on the bank of the Enguri river. As a sign of respect, he brought the salmon to Prince Dadiani. The

---

[5] There are also Georgian proverbs in which concrete lexemes, namely, anthroponyms are used for the purpose of rhyme:
ა) ეგრე არ უნდა, **თაყაო,** შენ რო მამული გაყაო.
egre ar unda, **taqao,** šen rom mamuli gaqao (https://idioms.tsu.ge/?p=13088).
"Taka, this is not a proper way to divide the land".
(ბ) რაც მოგივა, **ალიაო,** ყველა შენი ბრალიაო.
rac mogiva, **aliao**, q̇vela šeni braliao (field materials).
"Alia, whatever happens to you, is your fault".
(გ) ეგრე, ჩემო **თანანიო,** მიყვარს შენისთანანიო.
egre čemo **tananio,** miq̇vars šenistananio (field materials).
"Good job, Tanani! I love people who are like you".

Prince reproached him saying: "Why didn't you bring such presents before?" and he ordered Changelia to bring him salmon every year" (Sherozia & Memishishi, 1994, 138).

The empirical material has yielded another important topic for analysis, namely, the proverbs based on **toponyms**, the local marking of which is related to geographical names. In this case, generalization can be proved by the diversity of toponyms (cf. toponyms of Eastern and Western Georgia, as well as the toponyms currently on the Turkish territory mentioned in the Laz proverbs) as well as the wisdom-advice provided in the proverbs.

3. Analyses of empirical materials (toponyms)

Megrelian:

(10) არძა ართი ჯვარალეფი რენანია.

arʒa arti ǯvaralepi renania (Sherozia & Memishishi, 1994, 13)[6].

"All of them are from Jvari anyway".

(11) მარტვილს ნახარებუთ ქელუშენესია.

marṭvils naxarebut kelušenesia (ibid, 83).

"They built Nakharebavo near Martvili Church".

(12) ხორგას კოჩი გოლახეს დო ხეთას გურქ მურთუა.

xorgas koči golaxes do xetas gurk murtua (Sherozia & Memishishi 1994, 185).

"The man who was beaten in Khorga, got angry in Kheta".

Cf. a Georgian proverb:

(13) ერთი კაცი გორში გალახეს და გული ცხინვალში მოუვიდაო.

erti ḳaci gorši galaxes da guli cxinvalši mouvidao (Jorjaneli 2003, 81).

"A man was beaten in Gori and got angry in Tskhinvali".

(14) ჯვარული კოჩქ თქუუა: ზარბაზანქ მობხვადასჷნ, იშა დობღურე ქომისხუნუნია.

ǯvaruli ḳočk tkuaə: zarbazank mobxvadasən, iša dobǧure komisxununia (Sherozia & Memishishi 1994, 192).

"A man from Jvari said: "I'd rather die than be hit by a cannon".

Laz:

(15) პოლის ჯუმორი დვაბერენან დო ნჩხალას ხარჯი იკვანტერენან.

ṗolis ǯumori dvaberenan do nčxalas xarǯi iḳvanṭerenan (Sherozia & Memishishi 1994, 249).

---

[6] This proverb must be related to the rebellion of peasants led by Utu Mikava. "When they wanted to capture the leader of the rebellion, the residents of Jvari said: "All of us together led the rebellion "(Xalx. Siṭqv. II, 1991, p. 525).

"Someone spilled vinegar in Istanbul and demanded recuperation of damage in Chkhala".

(16) ხოფას ლაზი ღურუ, პოლის ბგარა დოდგეს.

xopas lazi ġuru, p̣olis bgara dodges (ibid, 264).

"A Laz man died in Khofa and people mourned him in Istanbul".

Svan:

(17) აშ�̂ ლეთ ხანსარჟი ესერი ლäლეთი.

ašû let xansarži eseri läleti (Davitiani 1973, 17)[7].

"One night can be spent even on the icy mountain peak".

(18) იუ̂ალäდეღ ხუნ ესერ ლახმელ ი ზეგირ ჩუბეჴეუ̂.

iûalädeġ xun eser laxməl i zegir čubeqeû (ibid, 43).

"Lakhamula has always been a foundation, and Chubekhevi – the roof".

(19) ნäბაუ̂ ი ნაჯäიშდ მäიდს ესერ უშხუ̂არ ხამშერალახ.

näbaû i naqäišd maids eser ušxûar xamšeralax (ibid, 107).

"A man who had been in Becho and a man who had been in Khaishi complained to each other about hunger".

There are certain rare cases, when both anthroponym and toponym are simultaneously represented in one proverb.

Megrelian:

(20) ართ სენ ფაფირს ონოღია გიოდინუ ხინტკირიაქია.

art sen papirs onoġia giodinu xinṭḳiriakia (Sherozia & Memishishi 1994, 11).

"Khintkiria lost Onoghia for one portion of porridge".

Svan:

(21) ჯერუ̂ალე ჯენის ესერ ესფეშ�̂და ი გადრანäრს კäცხთე ხäჭრალა.

jerûale qenis eser espešûda i gadranärs ḳäcxte xäčrala (Davitiani 1973, 123).

"A man fell down in the Kheni gorge and cursed the Gadrani family all the way until he reached Katskhi village".

---

[7] Cf. a Georgian proverb: ერთი ალილუია მღვდელსაც შეეშლებაო.

erti aliluia mġvdelsac šeešlebao.

"Even a priest makes one mistake in saying "Hallelujah"".

Conclusion

Thus, in the Kartvelian proverbs, the local peculiarities are often marked based on the onomastic material, although proverbs are inclined to generalization and provide universal wisdom which is used in every place and understood by everyone. The examples analyzed in the paper have proved that, although the above-discussed Kartvelian proverbs are marked with different historical-geographical peculiarities and the universal values characteristic of proverbs are marked by local features, the meaning of the analyzed proverbs is viewed within a common Kartvelian framework and is easily comprehensible for everyone. Megrelian, Laz and Svan proverbs require additional explanation of the historical background only in a couple of cases (examples (8) and (9)). Yet, the wisdom expressed by a paremic unit is still quite clear, hence, the proverb achieves its aim.

References

Davitiani, A. (1973). ა. დავითიანი, სვანური ანდაზები / Svan Proverbs, Tbilisi: "Metsniereba".

Grzybek, P. (2014). Semiotic and Semantic Aspects of the Proverb. Introduction to Paremiology: A Comprehensive Guide to Proverb Studies, Warsaw, Poland: De Gruyter Open Poland, pp. 68-111. https://doi.org/10.2478/9783110410167

Jesenšek, V. (2014). Pragmatic and Stylistic Aspects of Proverbs. Introduction to Paremiology: A Comprehensive Guide to Proverb Studies, Warsaw, Poland: De Gruyter Open Poland, 2014: pp. 133-161. https://doi.org/10.2478/9783110410167

Jgharkava, G. (2020). გ. ჯღარკავა, ქართველურ ენათა ანდაზების ლექსიკურ-თემატური მახასიათებლები / Lexical-Thematic Characteristics of Proverbs of Kartvelian Languages, East European University, Collection of Scientific Papers, №2, pp. 149-155.

Jorjaneli, K. (2003). კ. ჯორჯანელი, რჩეული ქართული ანდაზები / Selected Georgian Proverbs, Tbilisi: "Merani".

Xalx. Siṭq̇v. II. (1991). ქართული ხალხური სიტყვიერება (მეგრული ტექსტები) II / Georgian Folk Speech (Megrelian Texts) II, The text was prepared for publication, with introduction, remarks and research attached by Korneli Danelia and Apolon Tsanava, Tbilisi University Press.

Lejhava, L. (1959). ლ. ლეჟავა, ქართული ანდაზების ენა / Language of Georgian Proverbs, Issues of the Structure of Kartvelian Languages, Vol. I, pp. 139-264, Tbilisi: Publishing House of the Academy of Sciences of the Georgian SSR.

Mieder, W. (2015). Origin of Proverbs. Introduction to Paremiology: A Comprehensive Guide to Proverb Studies, Warsaw, Poland: De Gruyter Open Poland, pp. 28-48. https://doi.org/10.2478/9783110410167

Rusieshvili, M. (2005). მ. რუსიეშვილი, ანდაზა / Proverb, Tbilisi: "Lega".

Sergienko, O. S. (2016). English and Russian Equivalents to the Proverbs of Czech Active Paremiological Fund. PhD, Saint-Petersburg State University.

Sherozia, R., Memishishi, O. (1994). რ. შეროზია, ო. მემიშიში, მეგრული და ლაზური ანდაზები / Megrelian and Laz Proverbs, Tbilisi: "Msgepsi".

The database of Georgian idioms and proverbs – www.idioms.tsu.ge (Last access: 23.07.2022).

The materials were recorded during linguistic expeditions to Samegrelo, Laz and Svaneti region, implemented within the framework of the grant (PHDF-21-125).

Ekaterina Protassova

University of Helsinki, Finland

Political Engagement of the Russian Speakers in Finland

ABSTRACT

Russian-speaking immigrants in Finland, like many other immigrants in the world, are reluctant to express their opinions on politics. They do not consider themselves competent enough to have the right to make a judgment in a situation in which they have not taken part and which they cannot view completely on their own. Gradually, immigrants who were born in various countries are becoming increasingly aware of their place in their new society, but they still feel they cannot fully trust their leaders. This article examines the attitude of Russian speakers to the Finnish elections and the ongoing war in Ukraine as presented in media and social media, interviews, and essays. It is not easy to compare whether they are less involved than the young Finns, or it is a generational thing. The conclusion points out the difficulties in adapting to a different political system than in the country of origin and illustrates the spectrum of opinions among the immigrants of the first and second generation who live in Finland and use Russian among other languages in their everyday life. Russian-language media continue to have a significant influence on Russian speakers, even though second-generation representatives rely less on these sources of information.

Keywords: Russian-speaking diaspora, immigrants in Finland, bilingual and bicultural identities, TV and FB discussions, immigrant participation in elections, Russian war in Ukraine

Introduction

The situation with Russian-speaking immigrants throughout the world seems to be ambiguous. On the one hand, they are loyal toward their new countries, especially if their skills and values are recognized and appreciated. On the other hand, they feel they should also support their countries of origin, mostly the former Soviet Union, now the independent states. When troubles between these countries emerge, immigrants feel they should take and defend a position. The question raised is what is the new political experience of Russian speakers in a democratic republic like Finland? Are they fully aware of the new opportunities that they have now, or are they still dependent on the views they were brought up with in the USSR and Russia? Do they realize what the political rights are that they have acquired together with their residence permit or citizenship?

Researchers usually agree that immigrants should be incorporated into the economic, social, and political life of their new countries because this provides a more solid feeling of citizenship and mobilizes new identities (Brettell & Reed-Danahay, 2008). There are special ways to engage immigrants in activism and public service (Ramakrishnan & Bloemraad, 2008). Generally,

immigrants in the United States have a low rate of registration and voting, limiting their political power, whereas some NGOs use multiple political techniques to improve immigrant voter turnout (Brown, 2017). Community engagement seems to be very important in this process; individual characteristics and resources, social capital, and political possibilities all influence migrant civic integration (Giugni & Morales Diez de Ulzurrun, 2011). Diasporas are globally involved in transnational networks bonded by a common language and culture, experiencing sometimes exclusion or inclusion, and revealing regularities and disconnections (Pattanaik & Sahoo, 2014).

Because of disparities in socioeconomic background and familial political socialization, Riniolo and Ortensi (2020) have argued that Italian natives are more likely to be interested in politics than their first- and second-generation migrant contemporaries. Young people from migrant backgrounds are more likely to engage in activities that reflect a general interest in politics, such as discussing politics, seeking information on Italian politics, and listening to political debates, than their native counterparts, who, if restrictions do not exist, are likely to attend political meetings, demonstrations, or join a political association.

In the 1990s, the vast majority of émigrés belonged to ethnically privileged groups that are also referred to as "returning diaspora" in migration studies. As a consequence that those groups have not very tough ties with their respective countries of origin, only the network size in home country was positively and co-ethnic identification negatively associated to transnational travel frequency (Iarmolenko et al., 2016). Political repression in the nation of origin, as well as living in countries with a significant number of immigrant peers, have a negative impact on immigrants' health (Huijts, Kraaykamp, 2012).

Several studies are dedicated to Russian-speaking immigrants' political engagement. Simon et al. (2013, 2015) have shown that in Germany, the two largest immigrant groups behave differently. Turkish migrants' political engagement has grown as a result of their dual identity. Russian migrants, in contrast, have had no significant grievances, and dual identity has had a detrimental impact on their subsequent political activity. When component identifications are incompatible, it can lead to problematic or even destructive types of political mobilization, such as radicalism. According to Morgunova and Byford (2018), post-Soviet Russian-speaking migrants in the United Kingdom hold an intrinsically transnational position at the crossroads of numerous polities. Their mobilization as a culturally defined minority migrant community has been aided by the special opportunity structures for mobilization, which encouraged them to join a global network of Russian "compatriots." In the early 2010s, a new opportunity structure evolved in the form of a multinational protest movement in Russia against government corruption. Thereafter, since the Russian government has implemented policies that have resulted in a growing disenfranchisement of Russians living abroad from political

developments in Russia, many Russians in the United Kingdom have begun to seek new methods to participate. For them, the politics of Brexit have created a new opportunity framework.

Fomina (2021) has argued that political emigration from Russia is no longer a secure process. Involved in social remittances, the new dissidents from Putin's Russia send these remittances directly to Russian society, as well as indirectly to the Russian diaspora, political leaders, and society in recipient nations. The key concerns are free and fair elections, human rights and civil liberties, fighting corruption, environmental conservation, anti-war actions, countering Russian propaganda, and the "hybrid war." Haj (2015) writes that in Israel, characterized as a deeply divided society, Russian speakers (analyzed 10 and 20 years after immigration) demonstrate fluid voting behavior. They are influenced primarily by their perceptions of and sentiments toward domestic issues rather than regional issues, such as the Israeli–Palestinian conflict. Over time, their sophisticated political mobilization strategies have shifted from the development of "ethnic" parties in their first decade to the formation of "hybrid-ethnic" parties in the second decade. This has allowed flexibility in terms of support, recruitment, and coalition building, preventing ethnic exclusion, optimizing Russian immigrants' gains, and reducing the cost of ethnic mobilization. Davydova-Minguet (2022) claims that the festivities commemorating WWII, particularly the Immortal Regiment march in May, which is commemorated in Russia as Victory Day, are intertwined with a web of intricate relationships between Russian speakers, Russian mediascapes, and pro-Russian activists in Finland.

I will now look at the participation of Russian speakers in elections and then present the opinions of Russian speakers in Finland concerning the Ukrainian war. The methods used are critical discourse analysis, thematic analysis, document analysis, and triangulation. Materials consist of off-line and on-line discussions and written essays.

'I am thankful when anybody needs my opinion': Discussions upon Participation in Politics among Russian-Speaking Voters in Finland

Immigrant integration occurs in a variety of contexts, including the labor market, but also in the political sphere. Immigrants' participation in host-country politics, including the ability to understand and influence political processes as well as an interest in what is going on in society, facilitates their societal inclusion. The presence of immigrants in decision-making bodies is one of the important factors that supports their political engagement. According to Sippinen (2021), the foreign-speaking residents of Finland vote significantly less actively in municipal elections than the majority population. Only 53% of immigrants with a Somalian background vote in these elections; 50% of Germans, and about a third of those who speak English, Kurdish, or Spanish. Russian speakers exercise their right to vote less frequently than many other groups of migrants, and only

one-fifth of Russian speakers who are eligible to vote in municipal elections go to the polls. Estonians are even less active, because they often live in both countries, Estonia and Finland, traveling between them and not feeling at home in Finland. Many factors contribute to the low turnout. Those who seek political participation must feel that they belong here, have sufficient language skills, understand the political system, be interested in political life, and believe in political institutions. The candidates must have strong personal support and a favorable context. The nomination of immigrant-origin candidates allows parties to reach out to immigrant-origin voters who might otherwise go unnoticed by native-origin candidates. When a party runs a large number of candidates, including candidates of immigrant background on the ballot, this does not pose a genuine danger of losing support. On the contrary, every candidate brings in votes from his or her own network, even if they are not particularly experienced. Sippinen argues that politically active Russian speakers are sometimes reproached for their critical judgments about Finnish politics. Russian women vote more actively than Russian men because when they marry a native Finnish speaker who understands the reality of the nation and politics, they may follow in his footsteps. A lack of faith in politics, politicians, and the political system is also a significant impediment to immigrant participation. If a person is accustomed to being skeptical about elections in their native country, they might apply these concerns to the Finnish system. Russian speakers are represented proportionally in all parties, and this would suggest they vote more for a party than for a person (ibid.).

Dakash (2017), who has studied the construction of identity positions in the blogs of Finnish politicians with an immigrant background (although not from Russia), has discovered that their positions are concerned with minority-majority relations, immigrant belonging and participation. They also generally base their positions on humanistic, collectivistic, and individualistic values. Immigrant politicians talk about success stories, moral human beings, decent citizens, and making a contribution. Although they can position themselves as autonomous decision-makers who possess additional trump cards, they often choose a rhetoric in which they present themselves as second-class citizens, ordinary people, and victims. As far as we can see, this is not the stance of Russian speakers, who define themselves in public debates as a special group rather than as victims.

The "Old Russians" in Finland have traditionally desired to be recognized as a linguistic minority, suggesting that they wished to some extent to be seen as separate from the majority population. By the end of the twentieth century, the heads of the Russian associations in Finland were Kirill Glushkov, Igor Kurkimies, Eugen Novitsky, and Rostislav Holthoer. Journalist Eilina Gusatinsky and lawyer Anna Leskinen once fought for the same cause because it seemed to them that everyone who emigrated to Finland set out with the goal of assimilating, becoming a part of Finnish society,

establishing roots, and instilling in their children a sense of belonging to Finland. Now, Gusatinsky confesses that they mislead society in some part by suggesting that Russian speakers are committed to integration, which, as she can see, is not often the case. The debate about whether Russians wished to integrate or not into Finnish society had been initiated in 2020 on FB. Gusatinsky said that she is disappointed about their past illusions and mentions one expert who claims that many people migrate physically to more comfortable conditions but otherwise live parallel to or perpendicular to the new society. In other words, they moved to the refrigerator but remained seated in front of the television. (In the current Russian debate, 'refrigerator' means economic conditions of life, possibility to eat. 'Television' means ideology, Russia's state propaganda. Usually, the citizens of Russia suppose that in the Western countries, the level of life is good but the *duhovnost'* 'spirituality' is low.) Andrei Monikainen contradicts her, remembering the fact that when individual people are not socially active this is completely natural, and it is not an argument for depriving a statistically significant section of the country's population the exercise of its legal rights. Moreover, as Leskinen once pointed out in her articles, reports and speeches, to confirm the linguistic minority status, no changes in the current legislation are required: All the Finnish legislation and international obligations have been in force for decades. What is needed is an active initiative group of community representatives who will carry out the work that will result in the consideration of this issue by Parliament. But this is not a question of an election. Simply, all candidates begin their program with the phrase "I will defend the interests of Russian speakers," and no one can formulate a single interest of Russian-speakers that would be exclusively different from the interests of other citizens and groups.

In a discussions on FB, one participant, SM, said that gardening, cooking, beauty salons, and concert events are among the common interests of the Russian-speaking people. But what are the commonalities? AM answered that these are language and culture. SM replied that culture is defined by one's interests: "Concerts, performances, exhibitions, musical events, and clubs for Russian-speaking children are already in full swing, and this is more than enough. Those who do not have enough should travel to Russia by train, which takes two hours. The Russian language is not greatly respected in Finland. For more than 30 years, the diaspora has been growing here, and everyone is on their own. There is no community because there is no unification. Many people, by the way, do not want any associations because everything ends in disassembly and gossip. Almost everyone has heard of this. People only unite in their own close groups—through kinship, work, neighborhood, child friendships, acquaintance at courses, or acquaintance prior to moving to Finland. And the same thing happens in any country with a Russian-speaking population—this has already become a byword. Language and culture, no matter how hard Russian speakers try, do not become a unifying factor abroad. This is a commonly occurring phenomenon." NG suggests that many people struggle

with various bureaucracies, filling out paperwork, knowing the laws, and dealing with crisis situations: "Helping with just these issues would be a good start. And getting funding for this is both possible and necessary. Funding is needed in schools, for junior classes as well as valu-luokat (preparatory classes for immigrants), and for Russian-speaking assistants in schools."SM objects, arguing that these difficulties can be overcome: "There are already numerous Russian-speaking societies where people are always willing to assist with filling out paperwork and dealing with crisis situations. There are also numerous Finnish organizations that can and do assist. Many people have difficulties in most cases because of language barriers, but there are translators available for free. If you say that 'Russian speakers should have the same rights as other immigrant groups. We have the legal right to request service in Russian,' this provokes a negative reaction, because Russian-speakers already have equal legal rights in this country. If this law is broken, it is necessary to take this matter to court. Furthermore, there are so many people who understand Russian everywhere, including shops, stores, libraries, preschools, schools, polyclinics, and social agencies, and you have the choice to pick, so voting for a Russian-speaking candidate is not necessary." SM agrees about Russian-speaking assistants at school: "I agree that it would be beneficial. And they are frequently required when a child arrives who does not speak a word of Finnish. However, this is only necessary during the first stage, and the sooner the youngster adapts to a foreign-language environment and does not rely on the 'Russian aunt,' the better. We were all there with our children during this time, and no one was gravely hurt. It would be beneficial to have at least a few helpers who speak different languages in each school. However, the schools should be interested in this and request such assistants from the ministry. It is easier for the Russian-speaking parents to speak with Russian educators, and it is easier for them to demand special care for their child, fill in paperwork (which is always numerous) and make requests (which are always needed). The Finnish approach to education is very distinct and communication happens in an entirely different way."

Some immigrants do not believe that their vote could influence the results. On Facebook, 14 June 2021, AV (first married to a Finn, later divorced, with two children) reflects upon her attitude: "I did not vote in the elections. That's a negative thing. The bad news is that I don't believe I have a moral obligation to engage in them. I'm now referring to the recent local elections held throughout Finland. What is the reason behind this? What exactly is a moral right? Let's just say that I used to try with ardent zeal to become a part of Finnish society, even voting in elections a couple of times, because I believe that this is the duty of a responsible citizen. But, after years of trying, I realized that no matter what, I'm only a visitor here, and becoming a part of society is far more difficult than it appears. And now, when the spirit of change is in the air, any elections are certainly crucial, and it is not for me to decide which way this country should go. Is it, after all, the wrong place for me and my

children to live? Possibly. Please keep in mind that these are solely my private sentiments, affecting solely and only me. I'm sure that after some time I'll alter my mind. In the meanwhile, I am utterly disconnected from Finland's political scene. To be honest, I have no idea how the parties vary in their stances, and I don't attempt to find out. Until I have a complete understanding of how everything works and interacts here (the economy, the social sector, EU, foreign policy, etc.) this would be pointless knowledge. Furthermore, after years of actual experience here, I've concluded that the Finns REALLY know how and what should operate in their society. Many will disagree with me, but everything works! Their systems are operational! As a result, it functions better on aggregate than in many other nations. My viewpoint is that you should not go into someone else's monastery with your own rules; you will only do harm. A lion is depicted as the emblem of Finnish sovereignty. The constitution is under his grasp. So far, I regard it with respect, albeit from afar." A friend asked her why she did not feel that she was a member of Finnish society, and she answered that she respects Finns but does not know exactly. "Probably, first and foremost, the language barrier, which is only just taking hold; the more I learn Finnish, the farther away and more difficult it gets for me, and the more I realize that the ice between us will not thaw if it hasn't thawed in 7 years. Furthermore, I am now in the position of taking unemployment benefits, which I despise, and yet at the same time I am compelled to work. If you don't work, you don't contribute to society—you're not part of the pack. Yes, I accept benefits with a tranquil heart, since God knows I completely deserve them after my years of hard work. However, part-time work, and the difficulties and seeming refusal of society to let you in 'on a regular basis,' all appear to indicate that you are not from here. In theory, that is correct. And, of course, there is the cultural component: the more I submerged myself and grew closer to people, the more I realized that this is not my surroundings, this is not my culture, and it would never be mine." These feelings are difficult to bear, and the personality and character of the author influence the results of her reflections.

The discussions in focus groups with young bilinguals and Russian speakers in Finland confirm the notion that politics is uninteresting to most of them. According to them, the majority votes for the Green Party because many are ecologically minded and they ignore the party's other decisions, even though other parties have climate change on their agenda as well. We also collected some essays on the topic of politics among bilingual youngsters. One 20-year-old participant believes that "words are worth considering before pronouncing them aloud, and even after they have been thoroughly considered, it is better (just in case) to soften them and express yourself carefully so that no one can hurt you. This is particularly true of Finnish politicians. Furthermore, Finns try not to draw undue attention to themselves, and they usually avoid dancing, singing, and any other performance in which they might disgrace themselves." We think that nevertheless, they read political news and are mostly

well-informed about questions that speak to their heart. Among young participants, some even want to become politicians themselves:

Politics, particularly foreign policy, has always piqued my interest. Of course, I keep up with Finnish politics because, well, how can you not? Why is politics interesting, and even necessary, in my opinion? Well, because many political decisions have an impact on our everyday lives. By voting in elections, we have the ability to influence who makes these decisions. Everyone, it appears to me, should vote in the elections. If you do not participate in politics, even in a minor way, you should not complain about bad decisions made by state officials. Evidently, if all of the candidates appear to be bad, you should still try to find the candidate who is closest to your way of thinking. In the future, I hope to spend as much time as possible working in politics. Obviously, I do not see myself as a professional politician or delegate, but it would be fascinating to work in a ministry or even as a diplomat. In the future, I hope to combine my knowledge of Russian language and culture with politics.

Another bilingual respondent had this disappointed reaction: "For many years, the Finnish people have been proud of their ranking as the most uncorrupted country in the world. Finland has been in first place for a long time, but it has now dropped several places in the rankings. It's difficult to say whether Finnish corruption was previously limited to 'special relationships between friends and relatives,' or whether bribes between politicians and business owners have always existed but have only recently come to light. Anyway, even Finland cannot exist without corruption." Another respondent appeared to be both skeptical and a dreamer at the same time:

Politics is a difficult topic to discuss right now because it divides many people's opinions. People lose control of their emotions, thoughts, and words when discussing this subject. Furthermore, many people are unable to stop in time, and this topic acts as a drug for them. In the Internet, you can see people read only the title of an article, add it to their page, and start a discussion about it, even though they haven't read the article and have no idea what ideas it contains. There are those who follow politics, become acquainted with the topics discussed in government, and try to learn about the work of various political parties and their election programs during the election campaign. There is also an opposing group of people who do not follow politics at all and instead vote for the most attractive promises. If I were the president of X-country, I would provide affordable and free education for all citizens, as well as high-quality health care and employment for all. For this system to be feasible many workers would be needed, as many people would need to be taught. This will reduce the number of unemployed. In my country, there would be no class distinctions, no poor and no rich; all people would be treated equally. Finally, I'd like to emphasize that political life and politics are entirely personal choices.

One respondent was very reflective and wrote this essay:

Our lives are structured in such a way that they cannot exist without the centuries-old tradition of politics, because it is difficult to imagine what would happen if there were no politicians at all. Politicians are a part of the governance system of the state. Sometimes they make the right decisions, and at other times they are duped. Do you ever wonder if politicians are truly necessary? Advertisement campaigns are always launched prior to elections, and politicians are frequently invited to various discussion programs on TV. On one side, it appears that politicians are nothing without their constituents. On the other, even if a voter stays at home and does not vote for anyone, someone is still in power at the end of the day. Of course, it is too late and pointless to chastise the politicians; after all, it's people who ignore elections. In many countries, particularly in Europe, voter turnout is frequently less than 50%. In fact, such an occurrence is a dreadful trend. People are apathetic; they do not believe that voting for someone will bring about change or solve a problem. Unfortunately, there is frequently no one to choose from a long list of candidates. Even if there is a politician whose views on social structure issues are similar to yours, the party's line is always prioritized. Party outfits are frameworks that, on the one hand, make it easier for a group of people who are supposed to have similar political opinions to work together. This makes it easier for them to band together and accomplish something. On the other hand, the party spends a lot of money on its image, and their values must be updated on a regular basis. For example, what the Finnish parties fought for at the turn of the twentieth century is no longer a significant issue. Many parties must "clean up" their records and change their names. Politicians are difficult to like. They constantly bombard us with promises, but they appear to do nothing. One example of demagoguery. Occasionally, heinous stories about corruption or official wrongdoing emerge. After all, in any country, it's always if you scratch my back I'll scratch yours. The names of ostensibly "incorruptible" Finnish politicians also make the evening news. Politicians, however, are still people. They must accept a great deal of responsibility as well as accepting responsibility for their mistakes. Despite the fact that the public quickly forgets (and forgives) incidents, a political career can end in an instant. Anyone who enters politics must be brave and self-assured. Without politicians, our lives would be dull and unbalanced. Who will be featured in the same newspapers? Who will be chastised and debated? The speeches of Russian politician Vladimir Zhirinovsky, for example, raise the ratings of any TV program. Nobody is unaffected by his speeches. Politics can appear boring to young people, but in reality it is a fast-paced world where something is always happening.

There was another balanced opinion:

It is now very difficult to understand what true politics entails and who the powerful politicians are. What does politics imply and what benefits does it provide? People seem to focus less and less

on politics year after year. Fewer and fewer people vote, and they are less and less interested in when the elections are held, for example. Today, almost all politicians have the same opinion, the same thoughts, and, most likely, the same style. This style is similar to the general concept, general criteria, and general framework. Politicians and personalities such as Kekkonen, Reagan, and Churchill are no longer present. Now is a changing time, politicians are changing, people are changing... And perhaps there will be no need for politics in the future if interest in it dwindles completely. Is it possible that the Internet will eventually supplant politics? After all, there are no borders in Europe..., and if you are a "European," you can freely travel throughout the continent. You do not require a visa. Of course, people have always been fascinated by and desirous of power. People became interested in power even when they were no longer interested in money. Authority is a great power, and the fact that power governs people is even more influential. Power is politics, and power is authority. And as long as this life goes on, there will be people who must be managed, and who can only be managed with the help of politics.

These individuals are familiar with the situations in various Russian-speaking countries and can compare them. Young people are sensitive as far as justice is concerned. One respondent stated: "The European Union is campaigning for the abolition of the death penalty. This struggle is part of the common European values, as well as one of the EU's human rights policy objectives. Despite this, there is one and only country in Europe that still executes people in the name of justice: Belarus." Young respondents wanted to stimulate a better social policy in Russia: "Problems include illiberal policies and low population activity and passivity in the system (the client does not demand the type of service that he requires). Furthermore, preliminary social work is not yet at an adequate level. There is currently no effective social service, but it is also critical to collaborate with other countries." Respondents evaluate Russian family policy, though it may be naive to believe that they bear responsibility for the shift toward better decisions. They want to have a positive impact on the situation.

The election debates on Finnish television (Yle Debaty 2021) brought together nine candidates from nine parties from various municipalities. They speak Russian and Finnish at varying levels and have varying amounts of experience participating in public life. In total, over 130 Russian-speaking candidates were nominated in more than 50 municipalities around Finland (Yle Kandidaty 2021). The issue of the lack of recognition of Russian diplomas among psychiatrists, psychologists, and speech therapists was raised, and it was pointed out that it is critical that patients receive services in their native (Russian) language. The municipality candidates discussed the need for anonymous recruiting so that the workforce would be hired based on their professionalism rather than their last name. There was also talk of Russian-language services for immigrants, such as the purchase of

home-based care for the elderly and the right to choose one's own doctor. Many participants named their political party in Finnish or in two languages. To clarify the term 'interpellation', the moderator first called it *интерпелляция* in Russian, then *välikysymys* in Finnish. Several Finnish terms were employed in the debate on political concerns, and some candidates did not know how to phrase it in Russian, in which case they were guided by the moderators and other participants. Among such terms were *kotoutumislaki* 'integration law,' *oppisopimus* 'training contract,' integrating education and job, *julkinen* 'social, public,' *terveyskeskus* 'health center, polyclinic,' *perushoito* 'supply of basic medical services,' *hoitaja* 'caregiver's assistant,' *omaishoitaja* 'a person caring for a close relative,' *sote* 'social health,' *kunta* 'municipality,' and *valtionosuudet* 'public money, state support.' It was underlined that if language courses were conducted remotely and all of the materials were in Finnish, it would be considerably more difficult for recent immigrants to adapt to life in Finland during the coronavirus pandemic. Municipalities should encourage and collaborate with Russian-speaking public organizations and reinforce home language teaching.

Fedorov (2021) has summarized the results of the municipal elections, in which anyone over the age of 18 who has lived in Finland for at least two years is eligible to vote. He reports that candidates who speak Russian received over eleven and a half thousand votes, with thirteen of them receiving sufficient votes to be elected to local city councils. Every party presented at least brief information about their programs in Russian.

However, the question of which groups are supported and by whom emerges. For a long time, the Finnish government's task was to entice Russian-speaking residents to participate in social and political life, such as voting, local government. Initiatives were also made to reorganize existing associations and strengthen the composition of old organizations that had existed since the tsarist era or since the White Emigration. It is a legacy of the Soviet Union and modern-day Russia that people do not believe in politics in general, and in Russian-speaking politicians in particular; they do not like Russian-speaking candidates, and they do not accept that fact that while voting, you implement your right to have a representative in the administration. Many people are irritated by politically active Russian-speaking citizens, especially when they say platitudes in poor Finnish in disputes with Finnish native speakers. However, Russian speakers are becoming increasingly noticeable in politics, and a new multilingual generation is assuming leadership roles, including representing Finland's youth at the United Nations (Juri Birjulin, Green party).

The Finnish authorities are attempting to acquire influence in immigrant communities and to attract diverse age and socioeconomic strata among Russian-speaking groups in order that immigrant groups understand the requirements of the host society, especially through publications in Russian. In practice, all political parties attract people from all ethnic communities to their ranks in order for

these parties to have a true view of things and to influence the relevant groups by encouraging them to vote for the "appropriate" candidates. The voices of individuals who have not assimilated, who do not share the majority's viewpoint, are also heard. There seem to be local attempts to draw Russian speakers into social and political life alongside of Finns, however participation in civil activities and elections by this section of the population remains low. Forums, organizations, and circles formed at the request of immigrants emphasize the need for more instruction in Russian, as well as the maintenance of traditions brought from the motherland, such as child rearing and schooling. In general, the second generation of immigrants need fewer services than the first.

Attitudes toward the Ukrainian war

Like in many other countries with a significant number of Russian speakers, attitudes toward the Ukranian war have divided people and even families. In April–May, an economic research commissioned by Yle, the Finnish Broadcasting Company, conducted a survey among 501 Russian-born, Russian-speaking residents in Finland, questioning them about Finnish membership in NATO (Luotonen 2022). The result was that they were more negative about NATO membership than the rest of the country (76% approved joining NATO). Many believed in the possibility of building good neighborly relations with Russia, even despite membership in the alliance. A total of 55% of the respondents were against NATO membership. Those who had Russian passports were slightly more negative about joining than those with dual citizenship who, in their turn, were slightly more negative than those with Finnish passports only. 20% supported joining the alliance, one fourth found it difficult to answer the question. 33% of respondents believed that Russia's invasion of Ukraine was an attack on the sovereignty and territorial integrity of Ukraine, and 19% did not know or did not want to know what was happening there. 15% viewed Russia's invasion of Ukraine as a "special military operation," meaning that they supported Putin's policy, while one third provided no response. According to the results of the survey, Russian-speaking residents in Finland do not trust the Russian media. 39% of respondents said they regularly follow the news in Russian through Yle News services. 46% trust Finnish media, 39% do not know what to say, and 16% do not trust them. The analogical results for Russian media are 13%, 69%, and 18% respectively. About 32% of respondents answered that the attitudes of Finns toward Russians worsened after the beginning of the war, 54% thought that there was no difference, and only 2% suggested that it became better. In the summer 2022, the Cultura-foundation collected opinions of the Russian speakers in Finland about the war in Ukraine. They found out that 82% of the target group did not experience negative attitudes caused by the war. 64% do not approve of the war, again, the anti-war results were higher with the younger generations, which are not under the influence of the Russian propaganda (Cultura-säätiö,

2022).

Vuortama (2022) asked four interviewees to answer some questions connected to Finland's proposed NATO membership, which has been a topic of conversation in Finnish society for years (Zimmermanová et al., 2020) and had now become a hot topic. LS, who has lived in Finland for six years, moved there for political reasons because she wanted her children to grow up without militarist and nationalist propaganda. She is neutral toward NATO. She likes the idea of a common defense but is afraid that Finland might lose its national identity, although the alternatives are worse. It might well worsen the relationships between Russia, whose government, she says, is composed of war criminals, and Finland. Good neighborhood relations may come when freedom and democracy triumph, although now poverty, corruption, and tolerance of daily violence are constant problems. AK, who moved to Finland at the age of 12, immediately supported NATO. She thinks that membership in this organization guarantees safety for all who live between Russia and Europe. She is satisfied, although border crossing, she says, will not be so easy anymore; she has relatives both in Russia and Ukraine. For her, politicians have their part to play in what is happening now. LS works in Finland as an economist. She is against war and against military unions, however, NATO membership, she thinks, may be on the way to resolve the threatening situation. She believes that many Russian authorities are insane, but possibly in a few years' time the situation might change. HZ, a poet who has lived in Finland for more than 20 years, remembers the Soviet anti-NATO propaganda and has supported Finland's membership in this organization since Crimea's annexation in 2014. Before, he agreed with Finland's independent position, but then he understood that Finland is an easy goal for Russian aggression and wanted to enter the Finnish military reserve independently of the fact that he had not served in the Finnish army. He is ready to protect his country (Finland). He is sure that there are some 10 or 20 people in Finland who could go through the streets holding posters with the slogan "Help us, Putin!" He believes Russia will not exist in the same mode as before after some years.

Discussing this publication on Facebook, the comments made were different. Many participants said that they were happy not to be Russian and that recently they had changed their mother tongue in official registers from Russian to Uzbek and Karelian. VR writes: "I feel shame and pain about what is happening, but changing the language somewhere does not change anything. I very much want to disown any identification with Russia. Now I can say that I am Ukrainian, I have nothing to do with Russia, but then what? – go to sleep in peace? My mother's passport [=nationaity] is Finnish; my father is Ukrainian. I was born and raised in Karelia. As a child, I spent every summer with my grandmother in Odessa. I don't want to exaggerate things, but I feel it's good that my granny and father did not live to see this. And who am I now? We have absorbed into ourselves the country and

culture where we were born and lived. To what extent are we responsible for what is happening, and what are we ready to do in this current situation is another question. Everyone should decide and work things out for themselves. Now, only help is important, whether it is an expression of a position, or anything else for what a person has resources."

The politics of the use of the Russian language abroad, the attractiveness of the Russian world as proclaimed by the Russian government and the Russian Orthodox Church of the Moscow Patriarchate implies special behavior by those who adhere to Russian culture (e.g., Mustajoki et al., 2020, 2021). At a time when ties between Russia and the West were deteriorating, the language about the protection of "comrades" was contextual and turned into geopolitical boundary-making (Feklyunina, 2016; Kazharski, 2019, Pieper, 2020, Kosienkowski, 2021). The concept of the Russian world was again discredited after Russia started the war in Ukraine.

Conclusion

Political engagement is not easy for people with multiple identities. One way to avoid it is to declare oneself to be an outsider. Another is to remain with those who are distrusted, rejected, and declared bad people. The third way is to help those who suffer and are in need. The fourth is to support those who seem to be most fair. Yet, the loyalty toward one's country of citizenship is an important factor, especially if relatives and friends are involved, and if people have two citizenships, their consciousness may be divided.

The self-perception of Russian speakers in Finland depends on their social status, involvement in work and local life, social activity, and the presence of a wide network of contacts among the indigenous population. For those who arrived as adults and did not go through the Finnish school system, who did not study social science and do not know how this democratic society works, what parties it has, and what pitfalls there are in politics, it is difficult to realize that their voice can mean anything in the elections. Among young people who are first- and second-generation immigrants, there are increasingly more individuals who understand what is behind political engagement.

Being involved in political debate means strengthening one's place in society, finding platforms for expression, encountering like-minded people to help implement their projects, and taking a more prominent, or salient, place in society. For those who grew up in the Soviet Union, these ambitions were marked as hypocritical and treacherous for honest people, because these objectives were associated with Communist ideology. Very few people are prepared to be in the public eye and to take advantage of this social visibility. Opinions about what is happening differ between the generations. However, upward mobility is not always interesting for young people who want to enjoy the privileges of youth (cf. Krivonos, 2019). When watching activists who are now mostly under 40

discussing current Finnish problems, it is exciting to see how the public discussion takes place in Russian with similar arguments to those presented in big TV debates before Finnish elections. Representatives of all parties present their opinions, publicly underlining also the special situation of the Russian-speaking minority.

Taking this into account, one can observe that Russian speakers in Finland can follow programs like Eurovision and other direct reportage with a Russian commentator. These Russian speakers have their own news in Russian about developments in Ukraine and the current state of affairs in Finland. They receive information about the past and present lives of Russian speakers in Finland. For these reasons, news from Finland in Russian is forbidden on Russian territory.

The heavy legacy inherited from the Soviet and Russian past puts pressure on the self-consciousness of Russian speakers and does not allow them to feel completely independent of the language and culture of the country they come from. Being in the information field, in which different actors with different agendas operate, Russian speakers can either not believe in anyone and consider that the truth is somewhere in the middle, or take sides in the conflict between Ukraine and Russia, while realizing that "the conditional West" (a Russian propaganda term; cf. also Krivonos & Näre, 2019) is also not united and does not express a consolidated opinion on all issues.

References

Brettell, C., & Reed-Danahay, D. (Eds.) (2008). Citizenship, Political Engagement, and Belonging: Immigrants in Europe and the United States. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press.

Brown, H. (2017). Immigrants and Electoral Politics: Nonprofit Organizing in a Time of Demographic Change. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.

Cultura-säätiö (2022) Suomen venäjänkieliset. culturas.fi/wp-content/uploads/2022/10/Cultura-sa-a-tio-sr-Suomen-vena-ja-nkieliset-2022-selvitys.pdf

Dakash, S. (2017). Accounting for minority-majority relations: The construction of identity positions in the blogs of Finnish politicians with immigrant background. Helsinki: University of Helsinki.

Davydova-Minguet, O. (2022). Performing memory in conflicting settings: Russian immigrants and the remembrance of World War II in Finland. East European Politics And Societies, 36(1),

225-247. doi: 10.1177/0888325420956697

Fedorov, M. (2021). V municipal'nye sovety proshlo okolo desjatka russkojazychnyh kandidatov – polnye rezul'taty. Yle.fi/Novosti, 14.6. yle.fi/uutiset/osasto/novosti/v_munitsipalnye_sovety_proshlo_okolo_desyatka_russkoyazychn ykh_kandidatov__polnye_rezultaty/11981069 (accessed 27.7.2022)

Feklyunina, V. (2016) Soft power and identity: Russia, Ukraine and the 'Russian world(s)'. European Journal Of International Relations, 22(4), 773-796. doi: 10.1177/1354066115601200

Fomina, J. (2021). Voice, exit and voice again: democratic remittances by recent Russian emigrants to the EU. Journal Of Ethnic And Migration Studies, 47(11), 2439-2458. doi: 10.1080/1369183X.2019.1690437

Giugni, M., & Morales Diez de Ulzurrun, L. (Eds.) (2011). Social capital, political participation and migration in Europe: Making multicultural democracy work? Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Haj, M. (2015). Ethnicity and political mobilization in a deeply divided society: The case of Russian Immigrants in Israel. International Journal of Politics, Culture, And Society, 28(2), 83-100. doi: 10.1007/s10767-013-9171-6

Huijts, T., & Kraaykamp, G. (2012). Immigrants' health in Europe: A cross-classified multilevel approach to examine origin country, destination country, and community effects. The International Migration Review, 46(1), 101-137. doi: 10.1111/j.1747-7379.2012.00882.x

Iarmolenko, S., Titzmann, Peter F., & Silbereisen, R. (2016). Bonds to the homeland: Patterns and determinants of women's transnational travel frequency among three immigrant groups in Germany. International Journal Of Psychology, 51(2), 130-138. doi: 10.1002/ijop.12141

Kazharski, A. (2019). Eurasian Integration and the Russian World: Regionalism as an Identitiary Enterprise. Budapest: Central European University Press.

Krivonos, D. (2019). The making of gendered 'migrant workers' in youth activation: The case of young Russian-speakers in Finland. Current Sociology, 67(3), 401-418. doi: 10.1177/0011392118824363

Krivonos, D., & Näre, L. (2019). Imagining the 'West' in the context of global coloniality: The case of post-Soviet youth migration to Finland. Sociology, 53(6), 1177-1193. doi: 10.1177/0038038519853111

Kosienkowski, M. (2021). The Russian World as a legitimation strategy outside Russia: The case of Gagauzia. Eurasian Geography And Economics, 62(3), 319-346. doi: 10.1080/15387216.2020.1793682

Luotonen, A. (2022). Ylen kysely: Suomessa asuvat venäjänkieliset suhtautuvat selvästi muuta

väestöä kielteisemmin Suomen Nato-jäsenyyteen. 31.5. yle.fi/uutiset/3-12466237 (accessed 27.7.2022)

Morgunova, O., & Byford, A. (2018). Between neo-nationalizing Russia and Brexit Britain: The dilemmas of Russian migrants' political mobilizations. Revue d'études comparatives est-ouest, 49(4), 129-162.

Mustajoki, A., Protassova, E., Yelenevskaya, M. (Eds.) (2020). The Soft Power of the Russian Language: Pluricentricity, Potitics and Policies. London: Routledge

Mustajoki, A., Protassova, E., Yelenevskaya, M. (2021). Centrifugal and centripetal forces driving Russian language norms. Quaestio Rossica, 9(2), 715-732. doi: 10.15826/qr.2021.2.605

Pattanaik, B., & Sahoo, S. (2014). Global Diasporas and Development: Socioeconomic, Cultural, and Policy Perspectives. New Delhi: Springer.

Pieper, M. (2020). Russkiy Mir: The geopolitics of Russian compatriots abroad. Geopolitics, 25(3), 756-779. doi: 10.1080/14650045.2018.1465047

Ramakrishnan, S., & Bloemraad, I. (Eds.) (2008). Civic Hopes and Political Realities: Immigrants, Community Organizations, and Political Engagement. New York: Russell Sage Foundation.

Riniolo, V., & Ortensi, L. (2020). Young generations' activism in Italy: Comparing political engagement and participation of native youths and youths from a migrant background. Social Indicators Research, 153(3), 923-955. doi: 10.1007/s11205-020-02487-5

Simon, B., Reichert, F., & Grabow, O. (2013). When dual identity becomes a liability: Identity and political radicalism among migrants. Psychological Science, 24(3), 251-257. doi: 10.1177/0956797612450889

Simon, B., Reichert, F., Schaefer, C., Bachmann, A., & Renger, D. (2015). Dual identification and the (de-)politicization of migrants: Longitudinal and comparative evidence. Journal Of Community & Applied Social Psychology, 25(3), 193-203. doi: 10.1002/casp.2206

Sippinen, Josefina (2021) Recruitment of Immigrant-Origin Candidates in Finnish Municipal Elections. Tampere: Tampere University.

Vuortama, J. (2022). "Pienempi paha kuin Putin". Neljä Suomessa asuvaa venäläistä kertoo näkemyksensä Suomen Nato-jäsenyydestä. Ilta-Sanomat, 26.5. is.fi/kotimaa/art-2000008839504.html?fbclid=IwAR0s9ogSTi7LWv3H3vEMWE7oQL2evOALnErkFG70J-uo2x56qurSOf3TZNc (accessed 27.7.2022)

Yle Debaty (2021). V pjatnicu sostojalis' predvybornye debaty na russkom jazyke. 4.6. yle.fi/uutiset/osasto/novosti/v_pyatnitsu_sostoyalis_predvybornye_debaty_na_russkom_yazyke__smotrite_efir_na_facebook_i_yle_areena/11965537?origin=rss (accessed 27.7.2022)

Yle Kandidaty (2021). Russkojazychnye kandidaty na municipal'nyh vyborah. 14.5.

yle.fi/uutiset/osasto/novosti/russkoyazychnye_kandidaty_na_munitsipalnykh_vyborakh__spiso k/11923807 (accessed 27.7.2022)

Zimmermanová, L., Kříž, Z., & Doležalová, E. (2020). Thinking of Russia: Finnish neutrality after the Cold War and the influence of Russian neighborhood on Finnish cooperation with NATO. Central European Journal Of International & Security Studies, 14(1), 9-30. doi: 10.51870/CEJISS.A140101

Tamar Guchua

Akaki Tsereteli State University, Georgia

Silence as Message

(Gender-related aspects of communicative competence)[1]

ABSTRACT

The 1920s saw the emergence of interest in gender-related issues of communication in the scholarly literature. Descriptive analyses of various cultural and linguistic patterns highlighted that there are speech communities within which women undergo linguistic discrimination in two ways: how they are taught to use language and how they actually use it. The present paper provides an analysis of the latter instance.

Within the methodological framework of the Ethnography of Communication, and on the in/occurrence of components of the SPEAKING model, the paper aims at discussing speech events in which silence is a gender-specific fact. Illustrative data have been drawn from ethnographic records and travelogues. Such an analysis of the problem in point enables to discuss key issues of communicative competence and infer that, alongside acquiring vocabulary and grammar rules of a language, it is significant to be aware of who and when is expected to avoid verbal communication in a given speech community.

Keywords: Silence, Speech Event, Gender Asymmetries, Communicative Competence.

Introduction

Gender-related features in speech events began to attract scholars' attention since the 1920s. It was in 1922 when Otto Jespersen, in his book *Language: Its Nature, Development and Origins*, included an individual chapter to differences between feminine and masculine speech behaviours. Based on missionaries' and travelers' accounts, Jespersen discusses cases from an indigenous Caribbean community where, as he observed, local women spoke distinctly from men; men understand women's discourse but they another variety, with its peculiar forms, to communicate (Jespersen, 1922, 237).

When discussing differences between women's and men's linguistic portraits, Z. Kikvidze notes that only a biological sex cannot be a factor to facilitate generation of a linguistic variable; this will only be possible when a natural features takes on social relevance. As he goes on to say, Gender Studies have demonstrated that not a biological sex but rather cultural values play a decisive role in the development of a human as a social creature. This is culture that gives prominence to a set of human features and downplays another; this is why a women becomes feminine and a man becomes masculine made possible following the acquisition of behavioural standards acceptable for a given community (Kikvidze, 2001, 39-46). Whilst gender assumes social and cultural relevance, gender roles assume socio-cultural expectations being actualized in conversations.

Gender-related differences encoded in linguistic structures have repeatedly become object of scholar investigations. In her seminal paper "Language and woman's place," Robin T. Lakoff notes that in our society the dichotomy 'woman-man' is one of the instances of disparity and that individual cases of language use refer to these disparities, that women's linguistic discrimination is twofold: how they are taught to use language, and how they use it (Lakoff, 1973, 46). In the present paper we are concerned with latter aspect, that is, whether women are full-fledged participants of a communication process in the same way as men within individual speech events. My objective is to explore the problem in question based on analyses of individual speech events provided in Georgian ethnographic accounts and travelogues, and to present verbal communication avoidance by women as an instance of gender-based asymmetries.

Methodology

One of the models for the descriptive analysis of communication is D. H. Hymes' SPEAKING which was initially developed in the 1960s within the Ethnography of Communication, the then new research trend (Hymes, 1977, 58-66; Hymes, 1972, 59-67). This is an acronym standing for key components of a speech events: where and when an action takes place (Setting/Scene), who are its participants (Participants), what they want to achieve (Ends), what is a sequence of acts (Act Sequence), what is its tone (Key), what are the channels of communication (Instrumentalities), why individuals behave the way they do (Norms of Interaction), what genre a speech event belongs to (Genres). There is no rule, a ready-made recipe that would prescribe assigning individual components of the SPEAKING model to a speech event; therefore, each of their occurrences should be established empirically. In the present paper, empirical data are gleaned from Georgian ethnographic accounts and travelogues.

Communicative Competence

The theoretical goal of the Ethnography of Communication has been postulated onto the notion of communicative competence: what should a speaker know in order to conduct effective communication?

For the sake of the neutralization of the Chomskyan dichotomy between competence and performance, D. H. Hymes developed the notion of *communicative competence*, and defined it as *Rules of appropriateness* "acquired as part of conceptions of self, and of meanings associated both with particular forms of speech and with the act of speaking itself" (Hymes, 1977, 94); whilst Chomskyan 'competence' demonstrates radical *grammatism*, Hymes emphasizes that to speak a language implies not only command of its vocabulary and grammatical rules. It N. Chomsky charges 'competence' with a human's mental grammar whereby language is represented as a set of abstract rules, 'communicative competence' is a whole aggregate of communicative skills acquired based on one's social experience. Knowledge of norms of use are nonetheless significant than that of grammatical rules[2].

One's communicative competence develops through interaction with various individuals. It is important to know what is assumed to be a request, assertion, command in a given language community, as well as allowed and forbidden topics, normal duration of silence, normal timber of voice, etc. Communicative competence incorporates answers to the questions: in specific conditions, who and when may talk, when is it necessary to stop talking, how to talk to individuals of various status and roles, what are non-verbal behaviours appropriate to various contexts, what are turn-taking rules, and so forth.

With intercultural distinctions, lack of communicative competence may impede communication. Besides, it should necessarily be emphasized that not all kinds of communication is conducted by means of language, and that speech is not the only one among means of communication. The following categories should be considered with respect to a speech event: speaker's gender, age, social status, field of activity, etc.

---

[2] It should also be noted that, alongside *'communicative competence'*, there is a parallel term *'sociolinguistic competence'*, they essentially are terminological synonyms (Kikvidze, 2015, 204-205).

Gender-related aspect of speech events

When addressing anthropolinguistic peculiarities related to interlocutors' gender I give preference to the model which was developed by D. Hymes to treat speech behavior of Araucanians, a group of peoples inhabiting adjacent territories of Chile and Argentina, proposing the opposition of *voluble* and *taciturn* as dimensions in the interactional etiquette: a man is voluble interlocutor while a woman is taciturn (Hymes, 1977, 37).

Notwithstanding the occurrence of a number of experimental studies of mixed-gender communication demonstrating that women more tend to talking and much more solidary to their interlocutors in conversations than men (DeFrancisco, 1991; Coates, 1986; Fishman, 1983), there are instances in which Hymes' oppositional model seems quite plausible since he deals with not the human faculty of speech but rather of an opportunity of its realization. Even based on the stereotypes in European culture, eloquent speech in public appearances is men's job while women are required to be silent and submissive; a woman performs restrain and timidity.

As Hymes notes, in the Araucanian Indians' culture, "[t]he ideal Araucanian man is a good orator, with good memory, general conversationalist, expected to speak well and often. Men are encouraged to talk on all occasions, speaking being a sign of masculine intelligence and leadership. The ideal Araucanian woman is submissive and quite […]. At gatherings where men do much talking, women sit together listlessly, communicating only in whispers or not at all" (Hymes, 1977, 37). According to their tribal traditions, "[o]n first arriving in her husband's home, a wife is expected to sit silently facing the wall, not looking anyone directly in the face. Only after several months is she permitted to speak, and then, only a little" (ibid.).

Silence as message

A tradition of women's taciturnity has occurred in Georgian culture. For instance, in his descriptions of wedding rituals, Archangelo Lamberti addresses an engagements ceremony and writes:

> *Even if they encounter a fiancé face-to-face, well-bred women will not raise their eyes and not look at him in order to prove their timidity. If a fiancé insists to talk to women, it is frequent that he receives a sharp answer instead of fine words* (Lamberti, 1938, 85).

S (setting) —> Samegrelo in the 17th c.: Engagement ritual

P (participants) —> Two participants:

P1 —> Fiance

P2 —> Fiancee ("a well-bred woman")

E (ends) —> Conversation

A (act sequence) —>

      a) P1 addresses P2;

      b) P2 – # ("silence");

In case of repeated attempt:

      c) P1 addresses P2 ("fine words");

      d) P2 addresses P1 ("sharp answer").

K (key) —> Intimate.

I (instrumentalities) —> Oral.

N (norms of interaction) —> Speech avoidance on the part of P2; P2 avoids eye contact with P1.

G (genres) —> Conversation.

Scene: Meet-and-greet.

Cannel of Communication: Oral.

Form of Message: Verbal and non-verbal.

Traditional linguistics does not consider silence as a linguistic unit, concentrating on such phenomena as word, utterance, text. In the meantime, it is clear that silence has its own plane of content and plane of expression. It is true that, in the plane of expression, silence is devoid of sonar effects; however, it has its own content. A concept of silence is formed whereby there is speech. Silence and speech are not mutually exclusive. Within a speech event silence has a specific function: it is a non-verbal communicative response and avoidance from speaking.

Silence is a behavioral stereotype of a communication strategy. One should distinguish between (1) short-term pauses between sentences, and (2) silence *per se*. While the former instance has a syntactic function to finalize one utterance before another starts, the latter one has a communicative function and its use is determined by a situational context.

It has been maintained in the scholarly literature that silence is not speechlessness, rather it is a peculiar form of speech, albeit with no words: if one speaks about zero desinences, zero suffixes in language, one should speak about 'a zero speech act' as well (Arutyunova, 1994, 110); even when

someone tries not to involve in a conversation, s/he is still a participant of a given communicative act (Croucher, 2016, 9); silence is not emptiness (Samarin, 1965, 115); silence is able to perform a function of a liaison (Jensen, 1973, 249-252); silence conveys a message in the same way as words to (DeVito, 1989, 153-154).

It should be noted that a communicative function of silence, considered within a theory of communication, is not always universal, this being attested by our above-analyzed examples. Women's avoidance of verbal communication is not their choice but rather a commitment from their speech community and a justification of expectations of those around them.[3] A certain clarification of silence on the part of "well-bred women" can be found in a Laz story recorded by Georges Dumézil, a French Caucasologist: in accordance with the early custom in Lazistan, a maiden, who would not blush with shame when she was spoken to, would not be referred to in good terms, concluding: "WE do not take such a girl as a bride; we need a girl like an angel" (Dumézil 2009, 83). This is why nubile women of the Black Sea coast kept silence in the presence of visitors having come to ask for marriage.

Georgian ethnographic sources evidence an instance in which a third person occurs as 'a filler of silence' in a would-be couple's communication – a sender of a message; if we consider this instance with respect to the grid of components of the SPEAKING model, it can be viewed as a classical example of the distinction between a sender/receiver, on the one hand, and an addresser/addressee, on the other:

> *A nubile Megrelian woman avoids encounter with a man from a family other than hers, and regards much more indecent to talk anole to him even when they are going to make a declaration of love to each other. In all of such cases, a woman asks her relative or an aged lady to attend who should act as interpreters for a nubile woman and a 'Shkhvashturi' – a stranger, a man from a family other than hers* (Sakhokia, 1956, 73).

S (setting) —> Samegrelo in the 1890s
P (participants) —> Three participants:
P1 —> Nubile woman
P2 —> Man ('Shkhvashturi' – a stranger, a man from a family other than hers)

---

[3] With this respect, the following expressions with gendered connotations are notable; for instance, biblical "*Let your women keep silence in the churches, for it is not permitted unto them to speak*" (Epistles of St. Paul to the Corinthians, XIV, 34); Greek:*"Η σιωπή είναι στολίδι μιας γυναίκας" ["Silence is a woman's ornament"]* (Seven Tragedies of Sophocles: Ajax, 5th Century B.C.; Ray 1768, 19; Speake & Simpson 2015, 285);

P3 —> 'Interpreter' (a nubile woman's family member or an aged lady).

E (ends) —> Conversation ('declaration of love').

A (act sequence) —> P1, as a nubile woman, is not allowed to speak immediately to a man from a family other than hers, that is, to P2. Hence, an addressee of a message does not coincide with a receiver of message. There are the following sequences: P1 – P3 – P2 and P2 – P3 – P1

K (key) —> Modest

I (instrumentalities) —> Oral

N (norms of interaction) —> Indirect communication: when a woman is not married, she is not allowed to talk immediately to a man from a family other than hers.

G (genres) —> Conversation

Scene: Unofficial.

Channel of Communication: Oral.

Form of Message: Verbal.

A woman was obliged to avoid talking during a religious wedding ceremony. According to T. Sakhokia, a priest's question "Do you agree?" is easily answered by a groom, while bride is silent. During the entire ceremony, it is indecent for a bride to speak up, and her silence implies consent (Sakhokia, 1956, 97).

It was necessary to keep silence both throughout a wedding day and following it: "On a wedding day, a bride is taken to a room where dowries are placed; she is adorned, fed, and put on her feet. She considers sitting to be very shameful; neither will she speak up; she would only whisper in a bridesmaid's ear, her face being swathed (Tsaisheli, 1894, 3). For a whole year, a bride and a groom would not speak to each other in public since it was considered shameful (Makalatia, 1941, 270).

The American anthropological linguist Keith Basso provided a detailed study women's silence in speech events based on an Apache community. In his paper "'To Give up on Words': Silence in Western Apache Culture," published in 1970, Basso suggests that at an early stage of their companionship women avoid talking to men, this being conditioned by extralinguistic factors: "This is especially true for girls, who are informed by their mothers and older sisters that silence in courtship' is a sign of modesty and that an eagerness to speak betrays previous experience with men" (Basso, 1970, 219). The author also states the following: "Few of us would maintain that "silence is golden" for all people at all times[4]. But we feel that silence is a virtue for some people some of the

---

[4] Cf. Expressions associated with silence: 1. Geo. "Wise talk is pure silver, and silence is fine gold" (*Life of Gregory of*

time, and we encourage children on the road to cultural competence to act accordingly" (op. cit.: 215).

Concluding remarks

The opposition of 'voluble' (man) and 'taciturn' (woman), suggested by D. Hymes, which, as we already saw, seems to be quite regular in various cultures, is at odds with the Social Penetration Theory of the 1970s. The theory is an attempt to describe how in the process of communication a transfer is made from a comparatively superficial grade to an intimate one, from general issues to personal ones with respect to how well interlocutors know each other and how they achieve self-disclosure (Taylor, 1968; Croucher, 2016, 54). Gender-related aspects are one of the key ones in such circumstances. For example, masculinity is negatively linked to self-disclosure. A man who discloses personal information and emotions is considered to be more feminine and less masculine our culture. Hence, no matter how paradoxical it is, there are cases when the Hymesean dichotomy between 'voluble' (man) and 'taciturn' (woman) is quite legitimate, and, vice versa, when 'speaking like a woman' implies volubility, and it bears an explicitly negative connotation when referred to as a man. In its entirety, a meaning of silence depends on a context of its occurrence; this is why the problem of its treatment is part of communicative competence.

Silence is a message and its position is determined by one's communicative competence. Alongside knowing of whom, when, and how to speak, it is important to be aware of with whom, when, and why to keep silence. Traditional linguistics adheres to a negative definition of silence: "absence of speech" (Tannen & Saville-Troike, 1985). According to the Explanatory Dictionary of the Georgian Language, *dumili* ('silence') is "to keep still, to say nothing, not to speak up" (Chikobava, 1953, 1235). Based on these definitions, silence is an absence of verbal (phonational) speech. Such an approach gives rise to additional questions as far as there are speech events whereby 'silence' and 'absence of speech' are in no way synonymous notions. Our empirical data have shown that silence is an act of deprivation not of speech faculty but rather of a right to verbal communication.

The presented illustrative data demonstrate that silence is an act of restriction not of a speech faculty but rather of a right of verbal communication. Why are specifically women subject to those restrictions? Brown and Levinson associate it with a behavioral stereotype and note that in many communities silence occurs in women's behavior as their 'deferent' self-humbling in front of men

---

Khandzta by Giorgi Merchule; 10th c.); 2. Eng. *"Speech is silver, Silence is golden"* (Carlyle, 1896, 198.). Brewer's Dictionary of Phrase and Fable refers to the oriental etymology of the expression in point considering the following Hebrew phrase to be its equivalent: *"If a word be worth one shekel, silence is worth two"* (Brewer, 1953, 855).

(Brown & Levinson, 1987, 186)

The analysis conducted within the framework of the Ethnography of Communication makes it clear that a) instances of silence are of systemic character and do not occur as exception, b) restriction of verbal communication occurs whenever there are gender-based asymmetries between participants of a speech event, and, c) such cases provide opportunities for identification of noteworthy parallels in terms of intercultural relationships.

References

Arutyunova, N. D. (1994). Silence: Contexts of Use. Logical Analysis of Language: Language of speech actions. Moscow: "Nauka", pp. 106-117 [in Russian].

Basso, K. H. (1970). "To Give up on Words": Silence in Western Apache Culture. *Southwestern Journal of Anthropology,* Vol. 26 (3), pp. 213-230.

Brown, P. & Levinson, S. (1987). *Politeness: Some Universals in Language Usage*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Coates, J. (1986). *Women, men and language: A sociolinguistic account of sex differences in language*. London & New York: Longman.

Croucher, S. M. (2016). *Understanding Communication Theory. A Beginner's Guide*. New York: Taylor & Francis.

DeFrancisco, V. L. (1991). The sounds of silence: how men silence women in marital relations. *Discourse & Society: Women Speaking from Silence*, Vol. 2 (4), pp. 413-423.

DeVito, J. A. (1989). Silence and paralanguage as communication. *ETC: A Review of General Semantics*, Vol. 46 (2), pp. 153-157.

Fishman, P. (1983). Interaction: The Work Women Do. *Language, Gender and Society*, MA: Newbury House, pp. 89-102.

Hymes, D. (1972). Models of the Interaction of Language and Social Life. *Directions in Sociolinguistics: The Ethnography of Communication.* Ed. by Gumperz, J. & Hymes, D. New York: Holt, Rinehart & Winston, pp. 33-72.

Hymes, D. (1977). *Foundations in Sociolinguistics: An Ethnographic Approach*. London: Tavistock.

Jensen, J. V. (1973). Communicative Functions of Silence. *ETC: A Review of General Semantics*, Vol. 30 (3), pp. 249-257.

Jespersen, O. (1922). *Language, its nature, development, and origin*. New York: Henry Holt and Co.

Kikvidze, Z. (2015). *Essays in Sociolinguistics*. Tbilisi: Tbilisi state University Press.

Kikvidze, Z. (2001). On Some Problems of language – and - gender Studies and Gender / Sex differentiation. *Linguistic Papers XI*, pp. 38-50 [in Georgian].

Lakoff, R. (1973). Language and woman's place. *Language in Society*, Vol. 2 (1), pp. 45-80.

Samarin, W. J. (1965). Language of Silence. *Practical Anthropology*, Vol. 12 (3), pp. 115-119.

Tannen, D. & Saville-Troike, M. (1985). *Perspectives on Silence*. Norwood, NJ: Ablex Publishing Corporation.

Taylor, D. A. (1968). The Development of Interpersonal Relationships: Social Penetration Processes. *The Journal of Social Psychology,* Vol. 75, pp. 79-90.

Sources

Brewer, E. C. (1953). *Dictionary of Phrase and Fable*. Harper & Brothers.

Carlyle, Th. (1896). *Sartor Resartus*. Ed. by Archibald MacMechan. Boston, U.S.A. and London, Ginn & Company.

Chikobava, Arn. (ed.-in-chief) (1953). *The Explanatory Dictionary of the Georgian Language*. Tbilisi: Publishing House of the Academy of Sciences of the Georgian SSR [in Georgian].

Dumézil, G. (2009). *Laz Fairy Tales and Legends.* Tbilisi: Arn. Chikobava Institute of Linguistics [in Georgian].

Lamberti, A. (1938). *Description of Samegrelo*. Tbilisi [in Georgian].

Makalatia, S. (1941). *History and Ethnography of Samegrelo*. Tbilisi [in Georgian].

Ray, J. (1768). *A compleat collection of English proverbs*. London, Printed for W. Otridge, S. Bladon [etc.].

Sakhokia, T. (1956). *Ethnographic Writings*. Tbilisi [in Georgian].

Speake, J. & Simpson, J. (eds.) (2015). *The Oxford Dictionary of Proverbs*. Oxford University Press.

Tsaisheli, M. (1894). Customs of Megrelians (Wedding, Funeral Wake). *Iveria*, No. 156 [in Georgian].